Baishideng Publishing Group

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite 160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 52737

Title: Validation and Evaluation of Clinical Prediction Systems for First and Repeated Trans-arterial Chemoembolization in Unresectable Hepatocellular Carcinoma: A Chinese Multicenter Retrospective Study

Reviewer's code: 03724558
Position: Peer Reviewer
Academic degree: MD
Professional title: Assistant Lecturer
Reviewer's country: Egypt
Author's country: China

Reviewer chosen by: Artificial Intelligence Technique
Reviewer accepted review: 2019-11-19 13:29
Reviewer performed review: 2019-11-22 11:45
Review time: 2 Days and 22 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
[Y] Grade A: Excellent	[Y] Grade A: Priority publishing	[ ] Accept (High priority)	Peer-Review:
[ ] Grade B: Very good	[ ] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] Accept (General priority)	[Y] Anonymous
[ ] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[Y] Minor revision	[ ] Onymous
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejection	[ ] Major revision	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the topic of the manuscript:
[ ] Grade E: Do not publish		[ ] Rejection	[Y] Advanced
			[ ] General
			[ ] No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			[ ] Yes
			[Y] No

Baishideng Publishing Group

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite 160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1- In the abstract , You wrote that the study was conducted from January 2009 to December 2015 and then in the manuscript , you wrote that the study was conducted from January 2010 to May 2016. 2- ???? Follow up of patients , you wrote that Contrast enhanced CT or MRI was done every 8 weeks. This is against International guidelines. Is it special for your locality guidelines and this may harm your patients (Contrast nephropathy). 3- In page 17 , You wrote that as shown in table 3 and it must be as shown in table 4. 4- According to your results , For first TACE 553 patients are not candidates for TACE Would you recommend change in guidelines in the future for those non candidates for TACE. 5- What about recommendations for this study , Would you recommend Larger number of patients to validate these results?

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

[ ] The same title

[ ] Duplicate publication

[ ] Plagiarism

[Y] No

BPG Search:

[ ] The same title

[ ] Duplicate publication

[ ] Plagiarism

[Y] No

Baishideng Publishing Group

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite 160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 52737

Title: Validation and Evaluation of Clinical Prediction Systems for First and Repeated Trans-arterial Chemoembolization in Unresectable Hepatocellular Carcinoma: A Chinese Multicenter Retrospective Study

Reviewer's code: 03867417
Position: Peer Reviewer
Academic degree: MD
Professional title: Associate Professor
Reviewer's country: Lebanon
Author's country: China

Reviewer chosen by: Jie Wang
Reviewer accepted review: 2019-11-24 13:14
Reviewer performed review: 2019-11-24 13:35
Review time: 1 Hour

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[Y] Grade A: Priority publishing	[ ] Accept (High priority)	Peer-Review:
[Y] Grade B: Very good	[ ] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[Y] Accept (General priority)	[Y] Anonymous
[ ] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] Minor revision	[ ] Onymous
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejection	[ ] Major revision	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the topic of the manuscript:
[ ] Grade E: Do not publish		[ ] Rejection	[ ] Advanced
			[Y] General
			[ ] No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			[ ] Yes
			[Y] No

Baishideng Publishing Group

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite 160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The article is well-writen and a pleasure to read and the authors should be commended for this. The main thing I would like to see improved is the addition of the treatment lines at progression before inferring on the overall survival effect. Minor comments : - Define abbreviatins at the first occurence in the text - Summarize briefly the 6&12 criteria in the introduction

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

[ ] The same title

[ ] Duplicate publication

[ ] Plagiarism

[Y] No

BPG Search:

[ ] The same title

[ ] Duplicate publication

[ ] Plagiarism

[Y] No

Baishideng Publishing Group

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite 160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 52737

Title: Validation and Evaluation of Clinical Prediction Systems for First and Repeated Trans-arterial Chemoembolization in Unresectable Hepatocellular Carcinoma: A Chinese Multicenter Retrospective Study

Reviewer's code: 03502576
Position: Peer Reviewer
Academic degree: MD, PhD
Professional title: Associate Professor
Reviewer's country: China
Author's country: China

Reviewer chosen by: Jie Wang
Reviewer accepted review: 2019-11-26 02:05
Reviewer performed review: 2019-12-04 14:16
Review time: 8 Days and 12 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing	[ ] Accept (High priority)	Peer-Review:
[Y] Grade B: Very good	[Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[Y] Accept (General priority)	[Y] Anonymous
[ ] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] Minor revision	[ ] Onymous
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejection	[ ] Major revision	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the topic of the manuscript:
[ ] Grade E: Do not publish		[ ] Rejection	[Y] Advanced
			[ ] General
			[ ] No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			[ ] Yes
			[Y] No

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite 160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The artical talked about the validation of and Evaluation of Clinical Prediction Systems for First and Repeated Trans-arterial Chemoembolization in Unresectable Hepatocellular Carcinoma: A Chinese Multicenter Retrospective Study. This study found that the 6&12 (Six-and-twelve) criteria were closely correlated with radiological response, mHAP3 (modified Hepatoma Arterial-embolization Prognostic version 3) predicted overall survival (OS) best, and ABCR (standing for alpha-fetoprotein, BCLC, Child-Pugh and Response) was a reliable predictive system for the post repeated TACE survival (PTRS). And the sequential combination of them performed well in outcome prediction.The methods and conclusion is appropriate. It will help the doctor to make decision in different case and perform personal treatment. Howerver, the conclusion need to be further assessed in a multicentre prospective study.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

[ ] The same title

[ ] Duplicate publication

[ ] Plagiarism

[Y] No

BPG Search:

[ ] The same title

[ ] Duplicate publication

[ ] Plagiarism

[Y] No

Baishideng Publishing Group

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite 160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com