



## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**Manuscript NO:** 53466

**Title:** Comparison of OLGA, OLGIM, and TAIM stagings among men with atrophic gastritis

**Reviewer's code:** 03474116

**Position:** Editorial Board

**Academic degree:** AGAF, MD, PhD

**Professional title:** Professor

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** Japan

**Author's Country/Territory:** Finland

**Manuscript submission date:** 2020-02-01

**Reviewer chosen by:** Le Zhang

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2020-02-13 12:12

**Reviewer performed review:** 2020-02-14 00:51

**Review time:** 12 Hours

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Re-review</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://**www.wjgnet.com

## **SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

General: In this study, the authors investigated the clinical value of a novel staging system, TAIM, which combines the topography with the severity of atrophy and IM and compared TAIM with the OLGA and OLGIM staging systems in elderly men with atrophic gastritis. The concept of this study is interesting and this study was well written. Major comments: 1. In this study, authors evaluated efficacy of TAIM system. At first, authors should evaluate whether score of each category is appropriate (for example: "Mild atrophy/IM in Antrum is 1" is appropriate). 2. Please make Table including patient's characteristics. 3. Please add p value in Figures. 4. In this study, one patient in OLGA I developed gastric cancer. This might not be H. pylori-related gastric cancer. Therefore, background of this patient may differ from others. 5. At least, the category of no atrophy/IM in antrum, corpus and whole stomach will be better to be none, not low. How do you think about it? 6. It is unclear whether new staging system, TAIM, which divides patients into low- and high-risk groups of developing gastric cancer, depending on the degree of the atrophy or IM, is better than OLGA or OLGIM. Authors will be required to investigate efficacy of TAIM by validation. 7. Many patients of East-Asian infected with H. pylori had severe atrophy and moderate-to-severe intestinal metaplasia: TAIM High III-IV. Therefore, It will be better to divide patients with TAIM staging system high grade into two or three category group.



## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**Manuscript NO:** 53466

**Title:** Comparison of OLGA, OLGIM, and TAIM stagings among men with atrophic gastritis

**Reviewer's code:** 01467898

**Position:** Peer Reviewer

**Academic degree:** MD

**Professional title:** Doctor

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** Germany

**Author's Country/Territory:** Finland

**Manuscript submission date:** 2020-02-01

**Reviewer chosen by:** Le Zhang

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2020-02-21 05:04

**Reviewer performed review:** 2020-02-22 08:10

**Review time:** 1 Day and 3 Hours

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Re-review</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://**www.wjgnet.com

#### **SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

I have a few comments, only : Why do I need two Stages for low and high risk groups, each ? In my eyes one stage for low and high risk is enough ! Please explain in detail ! Why do you think TAIM is better with a specificity less than 50 %. Please explain in detail and set it into context with OLGA and OLGIM. Furthermore , I would like to know the frequency of H.pylori Infection in all stages. Please base all calculations differently for individuals that are H.pylori positive , Those who had a prior infection and those who were always negative. I also would like to know the percentage of autoimmune gastritis among the participants. I bet that TAIM, OLGA and OLGIM work for autoimmune gastritis and corpus dominant H.pylori gastritis best ! Please set this in context with the rather small patient numbers!



## RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**Manuscript NO:** 53466

**Title:** Comparison of OLGA, OLGIM, and TAIM stagings among men with atrophic gastritis

**Reviewer's code:** 03474116

**Position:** Editorial Board

**Academic degree:** AGAF, MD, PhD

**Professional title:** Professor

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** Japan

**Author's Country/Territory:** Finland

**Manuscript submission date:** 2020-02-01

**Reviewer chosen by:** Le Zhang

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2020-04-14 02:55

**Reviewer performed review:** 2020-04-14 04:28

**Review time:** 1 Hour

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

### SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568  
**E-mail:** [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com)  
**https://**[www.wjgnet.com](http://www.wjgnet.com)

In this study, the authors investigated the clinical value of a novel staging system, TAIM, which combines the topography with the severity of atrophy and IM and compared TAIM with the OLGA and OLGIM staging systems in elderly men with atrophic gastritis. There are no comments on the finalized manuscript.