

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 53466

Title: Comparison of OLGA, OLGIM, and TAIM stagings among men with atrophic gastritis

Reviewer's code: 03474116

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: AGAF, MD, PhD

Professional title: Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Japan

Author's Country/Territory: Finland

Manuscript submission date: 2020-02-01

Reviewer chosen by: Le Zhang

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-02-13 12:12

Reviewer performed review: 2020-02-14 00:51

Review time: 12 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

General: In this study, the authors investigated the clinical value of a novel staging system, TAIM, which combines the topography with the severity of atrophy and IM and compared TAIM with the OLGA and OLGIM staging systems in elderly men with atrophic gastritis. The concept of this study is interesting and this study was well written. Major comments: 1. In this study, authors evaluated efficacy of TAIM system. At first, authors should evaluate whether score of each category is appropriate (for example: "Mild atrophy/IM in Antrum is 1" is appropriate). 2. Please make Table including patient's characteristics. 3. Please add p value in Figures. 4. In this study, one patient in OLGA I developed gastric cancer. This might not be H. pylori-related gastric cancer. Therefore, background of this patient may differ from others. 5. At least, the category of no atrophy/IM in antrum, corpus and whole stomach will be better to be none, not low. How do you think about it? 6. It is unclear whether new staging system, TAIM, which divides patients into low- and high-risk groups of developing gastric cancer, depending on the degree of the atrophy or IM, is better than OLGA or OLGIM. Authors will be required to investigate efficacy of TAIM by validation. 7. Many patients of East-Asian infected with H. pylori had severe atrophy and moderate-to-severe intestinal metaplasia: TAIM High III-IV. Therefore, It will be better to divide patients with TAIM staging system high grade into two or three category group.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 53466

Title: Comparison of OLGA, OLGIM, and TAIM stagings among men with atrophic gastritis

Reviewer's code: 01467898

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Doctor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Germany

Author's Country/Territory: Finland

Manuscript submission date: 2020-02-01

Reviewer chosen by: Le Zhang

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-02-21 05:04

Reviewer performed review: 2020-02-22 08:10

Review time: 1 Day and 3 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

I have a few comments, only : Why do I need two Stages for low and high risk groups, each ? In my eyes one stage for low and high risk is enough ! Please explain in detail ! Why do you think TAIM is better with a specificity less than 50 %. Please explain in detail and set it into context with OLGA and OLGIM. Furthermore , I would like to know the frequency of H.pylori Infection in all stages. Please base all calculations differently for individuals that are H.pylori positive , Those who had a prior infection and those who were always negative. I also would like to know the percentage of autoimmune gastritis among the participants. I bet that TAIM, OLGA and OLGIM work for autoimmune gastritis and corpus dominant H.pylori gastritis best ! Please set this in context with the rather small patient numbers!

RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 53466

Title: Comparison of OLGA, OLGIM, and TAIM stagings among men with atrophic gastritis

Reviewer's code: 03474116

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: AGAF, MD, PhD

Professional title: Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Japan

Author's Country/Territory: Finland

Manuscript submission date: 2020-02-01

Reviewer chosen by: Le Zhang

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-04-14 02:55

Reviewer performed review: 2020-04-14 04:28

Review time: 1 Hour

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this study, the authors investigated the clinical value of a novel staging system, TAIM, which combines the topography with the severity of atrophy and IM and compared TAIM with the OLGA and OLGIM staging systems in elderly men with atrophic gastritis. There are no comments on the finalized manuscript.