



**PEER-REVIEW REPORT**

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Meta-Analysis

**Manuscript NO:** 53756

**Title:** Probiotics in inflammatory bowel disease: does it work?

**Reviewer's code:** 00034179

**Position:** Editorial Board

**Academic degree:** PhD

**Professional title:** Academic Research, Research Scientist

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** Italy

**Author's Country/Territory:** Brazil

**Manuscript submission date:** 2019-12-29

**Reviewer chosen by:** Ying Dou

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2020-02-17 10:31

**Reviewer performed review:** 2020-02-18 10:33

**Review time:** 1 Day

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

**SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://**www.wjgnet.com

In this minireview the authors report only a sum of references, but they do not talk about the physiological functions of gut microbiota (supply of nutrients and energy, development of immune system, host defense) and the association between the gut microbiota and the pathogenesis of IBD (outcome in host immune systems and mucosal integrity) , as they reported in the aims.

#### **INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT**

##### ***Google Search:***

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

##### ***BPG Search:***

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No



**PEER-REVIEW REPORT**

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Meta-Analysis

**Manuscript NO:** 53756

**Title:** Probiotics in inflammatory bowel disease: does it work?

**Reviewer's code:** 03729678

**Position:** Editorial Board

**Academic degree:** MD, PhD

**Professional title:** Professor

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** France

**Author's Country/Territory:** Brazil

**Manuscript submission date:** 2019-12-29

**Reviewer chosen by:** Ying Dou

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2020-02-17 08:31

**Reviewer performed review:** 2020-02-19 13:13

**Review time:** 2 Days and 4 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

**SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://**[www.wjgnet.com](http://www.wjgnet.com)

Natalia Oliveira e Silva et al. Propose a mini-review on « Probiotics in inflammatory bowel disease : does it work ? » There are many reviews on the topic and the present one does not add new information (new data or meta-analysis) or new ideas (interpretation of data or perspectives of future developments). 1. Half of the text is a mini review on the dysbiosis observed in IBD. The subtitles are “bacterial role”, “viral role” and “fungal and protest microbiota role”. The authors do not provide details and do not discuss whether the observed differences in microbiota composition could be just a consequence or have a causative role in the various situations of IBD. 2. They speculate on the association of the peaks of incidence of IBD with changes in the microbota but do not provide argument supporting this hypothesis. They just here quote one study showing that the microbiota changes in elderly. 3. The part of “protective micro-organisms is very limited although it could be considered a rational for the development of “new generation probiotics” 4. The part on phages could comment on the development of phages to treat IBD 5. The attempts to use fecal transplantation in IBD and its place vs. that of probiotics could have been briefly presented 6. The part on probiotics (topic of the mini-review) is very short and authors do not explain how they selected the studies which they (briefly) discuss. 7. The effects of “probiotic microorganisms” depend on the strain and authors cannot therefore only mention the names of the species without the strains. This should be corrected in the abstract and text and the strains of *Saccharomyces boulardii*, species and strains of *Lactobacillus* and *Bifidobacterium* should be provided. 8. As quoted by the authors (3 references), it is debated whether the probiotic commercialized under the name “VSL#3” still corresponds to the product tested in the IBD trials. Prescribers wait for information whether the publications of the effects of “VSL#3” in IBD should still be considered valid for the actual “VSL#3” product 9. Table 1 quotes references 73-75 but there are only 72 references in the text. 10. The randomized controlled study by Bourreille A, et al. “*Saccharomyces boulardii*



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://**www.wjgnet.com

does not prevent relapse of Crohn's disease. Clin Gastroenterol Hepatol. 2013 “ does not support the phrasing in the table 1 that “Saccharomyces boulardii is useful for the prevention of relapses of CD “ 11. Figure 1: the relative abundance of non-pathogenic bacteria is reduced in IBD but the concentration of bacteria, and protists is not. So to my opinion, this figure is misleading and there should be at least as many bacteria in the “IBD” part as in the “healthy part” but with a higher proportion of pathobionts. The term pathobiont would be here more appropriate than that of pathogen.

#### **INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT**

##### ***Google Search:***

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

##### ***BPG Search:***

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No



**PEER-REVIEW REPORT**

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Meta-Analysis

**Manuscript NO:** 53756

**Title:** Probiotics in inflammatory bowel disease: does it work?

**Reviewer's code:** 04429838

**Position:** Editorial Board

**Academic degree:** PhD

**Professional title:** Assistant Professor

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** Iran

**Author's Country/Territory:** Brazil

**Manuscript submission date:** 2019-12-29

**Reviewer chosen by:** Ying Dou

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2020-02-24 11:13

**Reviewer performed review:** 2020-03-06 08:53

**Review time:** 10 Days and 21 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

**SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://**www.wjgnet.com

Dear Editor, The presented mini-review, discusses the probable efficacy of probiotics on IBD. In a primary database search, hundreds of papers on the same subject could be found, more comprehensive and informative. This manuscript dose not have any novelty in terms of subject or the scientific content. Also, the manuscript could consider more details in studies and add some informative tables contain studies. In my opinion this manuscript could not reach the standards of your respected journals.

1. Derwa Y, Gracie DJ, Hamlin PJ, Ford AC. Systematic review with meta - analysis: the efficacy of probiotics in inflammatory bowel disease. *Alimentary pharmacology & therapeutics*. 2017 Aug;46(4):389-400.
2. Abraham B, Quigley EM. Antibiotics and probiotics in inflammatory bowel disease: when to use them?. *Frontline Gastroenterology*. 2020 Jan 1;11(1):62-9.
3. Guandalini S, Sansotta N. Probiotics in the treatment of inflammatory bowel disease. *Probiotics and Child Gastrointestinal Health: Advances in Microbiology, Infectious Diseases and Public Health Volume 10*. 2019:101-7.
4. DALY K, IBRAHIM F. Current and potential status of probiotics in inflammatory bowel diseases. *Agro FOOD Industry Hi Tech*. 2019 Jan;30:1.

#### **INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT**

##### ***Google Search:***

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

##### ***BPG Search:***

- The same title
- Duplicate publication



# Baishideng Publishing Group

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA

**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568

**E-mail:** [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com)

**https://**[www.wjgnet.com](https://www.wjgnet.com)

[ ] Plagiarism

[ Y ] No