

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 53778

Title: Predicting dyslipidemia after liver transplantation: A significant role of recipient metabolic inflammation profile

Reviewer's code: 03475479

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Lecturer

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Japan

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2019-12-30

Reviewer chosen by: Le Zhang

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-03-04 04:18

Reviewer performed review: 2020-03-05 01:42

Review time: 21 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	RE-REVIEW	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> No	[Y] Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good				[] Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision		Peer-reviewer's expertise on the topic of the manuscript:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision		[] Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection		[Y] General
				[] No expertise
				Conflicts-of-Interest:

☐ Yes

☐ No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Authors evaluated the risk factor of PRDL, and showed that pre-treatment serum IL-12(p70) level is associated with the development of PTDL. Furthermore authors showed that PTDL is associated with poorer prognosis in HCC patients. This report is interesting, but several issues remain to be addressed. 1. Authors should show the proportion of living-donor LT. 2. HBV-HCC patients were main cohort. Authors should describe HBV status such as HBV-DNA, HBeAg positivity or anti-viral treatment in pre- and post LT. 3. HCC recurrence was frequent in present cohort. Authors should describe the indication of LT in HCC patients and the diagnostic methods. 4. Authors should discuss the role of anti-lipid therapy for PTDL.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

☐ The same title

☐ Duplicate publication

☐ Plagiarism

☐ No

BPG Search:



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 53778

Title: Predicting dyslipidemia after liver transplantation: A significant role of recipient metabolic inflammation profile

Reviewer's code: 02440884

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Germany

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2019-12-30

Reviewer chosen by: Le Zhang

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-03-05 07:00

Reviewer performed review: 2020-03-05 08:13

Review time: 1 Hour

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	RE-REVIEW	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision		<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair		<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision		Peer-reviewer's expertise on the topic of the manuscript:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
				<input type="checkbox"/> General
				<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
				Conflicts-of-Interest:

☐ Yes

☐ No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The clinical study is focused on the prediction of dyslipidemia after liver transplantation. In a very good clinical setting the pro-inflammatory cytokine IL-12 was identified as a potential marker predicting post-transplant dyslipidemia (PTDL). Dendritic cells are suggested as the important source of IL-12. Comments 1. The pathophysiological cascade that IL-12 triggers the metabolomics profile is suggested by the data, but additional experimental work is necessary. This point should be clearly addressed in the section Discussion.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

☐ The same title

☐ Duplicate publication

☐ Plagiarism

☐ No

BPG Search:

☐ The same title

☐ Duplicate publication



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

[] Plagiarism

[Y] No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 53778

Title: Predicting dyslipidemia after liver transplantation: A significant role of recipient metabolic inflammation profile

Reviewer's code: 00051373

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Associate Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Taiwan

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2019-12-30

Reviewer chosen by: Le Zhang

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-03-04 09:36

Reviewer performed review: 2020-03-05 12:37

Review time: 1 Day and 3 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	RE-REVIEW	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision		<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair		<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision		Peer-reviewer's expertise on the topic of the manuscript:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
				<input type="checkbox"/> General
				<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
				Conflicts-of-Interest:



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

☐ Yes

☐ No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

A great study design and manuscript written for investigating the association of recipients' metabolic inflammation status with post-liver transplantation dyslipidemia.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

☐ The same title

☐ Duplicate publication

☐ Plagiarism

☐ No

BPG Search:

☐ The same title

☐ Duplicate publication

☐ Plagiarism

☐ No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 53778

Title: Predicting dyslipidemia after liver transplantation: A significant role of recipient metabolic inflammation profile

Reviewer's code: 00503243

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Italy

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2019-12-30

Reviewer chosen by: Le Zhang

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-03-04 07:55

Reviewer performed review: 2020-03-05 18:08

Review time: 1 Day and 10 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	RE-REVIEW	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair		<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision		Peer-reviewer's expertise on the topic of the manuscript:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection		<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
				<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
				<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
				Conflicts-of-Interest:

☐ Yes

☐ No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a very interesting manuscript on clinical factors and cytokines influencing the post liver transplant lipid abnormalities. The manuscript is well written and the study has been well conducted. The statistical analysis has been also well conducted. The conclusion on the role of IL-12 (p70) is new and interesting. My only question is on the role of other cytokines. The authors documented the role of IFN-alpha2 and IFN-beta but their relevance seems to disappear at the multivariate analysis. What about the other cytokines that in different conditions are responsible of lipid abnormalities. Some comments in the discussion should be added

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

☐ The same title

☐ Duplicate publication

☐ Plagiarism

☐ No

BPG Search:

☐ The same title



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

[] Duplicate publication

[] Plagiarism

[Y] No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 53778

Title: Predicting dyslipidemia after liver transplantation: A significant role of recipient metabolic inflammation profile

Reviewer's code: 00071178

Position: Editor-in-Chief

Academic degree: FACS, MD

Professional title: Associate Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Turkey

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2019-12-30

Reviewer chosen by: Le Zhang

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-03-04 05:31

Reviewer performed review: 2020-03-21 17:29

Review time: 17 Days and 11 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	RE-REVIEW	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good				<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision		Peer-reviewer's expertise on the topic of the manuscript:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection		<input type="checkbox"/> General
				<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
				Conflicts-of-Interest:

☐ Yes

☐ No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The most important problem in this article is the statements about HCC. To suggest that there is a relationship between HCC recurrence and posttransplant dyslipidemia, there should be no difference in preoperative HCC characteristics between the two groups. Therefore, both groups should be compared in terms of tumor number, tumor size, vascular invasion and tumor histology. If there is no difference between the groups, it can be claimed that there is a relationship between tumor recurrence and dyslipidemia. MedCalc for Windows version 4.2 Although not specified in the statistical method section, kaplan-meier analysis was used for survival analysis. The authors stated that they are using medcalc 4.2 version, but is this package program still in use? I couldn't be sure of that. The authors should state which p values (obtained univariate analysis) are included in the multivariate analysis.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

☐ The same title

☐ Duplicate publication

☐ Plagiarism

☐ No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☒ No

RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 53778

Title: Predicting dyslipidemia after liver transplantation: A significant role of recipient metabolic inflammation profile

Reviewer's code: 00071178

Position: Editor-in-Chief

Academic degree: FACS, MD

Professional title: Associate Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Turkey

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2019-12-30

Reviewer chosen by: Le Zhang

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-04-20 10:19

Reviewer performed review: 2020-04-20 10:24

Review time: 1 Hour

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
--------------------	------------------	------------	--------------------------



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

thank you for making the necessary corrections

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 53778

Title: Predicting dyslipidemia after liver transplantation: A significant role of recipient metabolic inflammation profile

Reviewer's code: 02440884

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Germany

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2019-12-30

Reviewer chosen by: Le Zhang

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-04-20 10:38

Reviewer performed review: 2020-04-20 10:42

Review time: 1 Hour

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In the revised version of the experimental study to dyslipidemia after liver transplantation the essentials were addressed and I have no further questions.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 53778

Title: Predicting dyslipidemia after liver transplantation: A significant role of recipient metabolic inflammation profile

Reviewer's code: 00051373

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Associate Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Taiwan

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2019-12-30

Reviewer chosen by: Le Zhang

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-04-20 13:17

Reviewer performed review: 2020-04-20 14:15

Review time: 1 Hour

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Well revisions on both manuscript and image files.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 53778

Title: Predicting dyslipidemia after liver transplantation: A significant role of recipient metabolic inflammation profile

Reviewer's code: 03475479

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Lecturer

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Japan

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2019-12-30

Reviewer chosen by: Le Zhang

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-04-20 10:55

Reviewer performed review: 2020-04-21 05:50

Review time: 18 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Revised manuscript was well-addressed for reviewers' comments and well-written. Nice work!

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☒ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☒ No