



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Surgery

Manuscript NO: 53783

Title: Mammalian target of rapamycin inhibitors after post-transplant hepatocellular carcinoma recurrence: Is it too late?

Reviewer’s code: 00053419

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: PhD

Professional title: Professor

Reviewer’s country: Spain

Author’s country: China

Manuscript submission date: 2019-12-30

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-01-02 09:40

Reviewer performed review: 2020-01-08 17:21

Review time: 6 Days and 7 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer’s expertise on the topic of the manuscript:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors present a retrospective study to evaluate the effect of mTOR inhibitors in HCC patient's survival after liver transplant. The study has been well conducted and the main limitations have been evaluated and exposed by the authors. I personally feel that the use of mTOR inhibitors in HCC transplanted patients has been already explored (many references available) with similar conclusions and better statistics (likely resulting from larger cohorts). However, although the novelty is relative, the study might be of interest to reinforce the notion of the positive effect and eventual advantages of mTOR inhibitors for the management of these patients.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

BPG Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Surgery

Manuscript NO: 53783

Title: Mammalian target of rapamycin inhibitors after post-transplant hepatocellular carcinoma recurrence: Is it too late?

Reviewer's code: 00053659

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Professor, Surgeon

Reviewer's country: Japan

Author's country: China

Manuscript submission date: 2019-12-30

Reviewer chosen by: Jin-Zhou Tang

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-01-10 12:50

Reviewer performed review: 2020-01-10 15:03

Review time: 2 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Au and Chok found that mTOR inhibitor could be a potential prognostic factor for prolonged survival after post-transplant HCC recurrence. This study involved a severe bias of time generation, as they discussed. I cannot entirely agree with their comments about the potential time effect rather than a fundamental time effect. Although all these biases, it might present valuable clinical information. The dose-effect of calcineurin inhibitor should be compared among the mTOR vs. no mTOR. I strongly suspect the dose of CNI at the recurrence in mTOR could be lower than that in no mTOR. CNI should include in the multivariate analysis.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

BPG Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No



RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Surgery

Manuscript NO: 53783

Title: Mammalian Target of Rapamycin Inhibitors after Post-transplant Hepatocellular Carcinoma Recurrence: Is it Too Late?

Reviewer's code: 00053659

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Professor, Surgeon

Reviewer's country: Japan

Author's country: China

Manuscript submission date: 2019-12-30

Reviewer chosen by: Ying Dou

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-03-20 04:21

Reviewer performed review: 2020-03-20 06:42

Review time: 2 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Au and Chok revised the manuscript. However, the presentation of the Tables and Figures is still inappropriate, including discrepancies between the tables and the manuscript. In all tables, the number of patients should be numeral rather than a percent, or it could present both of them. Survival analysis should include tables for presenting numeral of the patients, including centered patients with time course. The number of each group is different from each table. For example, the mTOR inhibitor group consists of 48 sirolimus and 29 everolimus in the text, which ended up 76 patients. However, the mTOR group consists of 79 patients in Table 2. Where did three patients go? The presentation of the Tables and Figures seems to hide the results to prevent us in confirming the accuracy.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

BPG Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No



RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Surgery

Manuscript NO: 53783

Title: Mammalian Target of Rapamycin Inhibitors after Post-transplant Hepatocellular Carcinoma Recurrence: Is it Too Late?

Reviewer's code: 00053419

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: PhD

Professional title: Professor

Reviewer's country: Spain

Author's country: China

Manuscript submission date: 2019-12-30

Reviewer chosen by: Ying Dou

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-03-20 07:54

Reviewer performed review: 2020-03-21 08:49

Review time: 1 Day

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

There are no additional questions from this reviewer.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

BPG Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No