

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 53978

Title: Outcome of Gastric Signet Ring Cell Carcinoma after Neoadjuvant Chemotherapy versus Upfront Surgery: A Propensity Score Matched Retrospective Study

Reviewer's code: 05261064

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: FRCPC, MD, MSc

Professional title: Associate Professor

Reviewer's country: United Kingdom

Author's country: China

Manuscript submission date: 2020-01-13

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-01-14 00:15

Reviewer performed review: 2020-01-14 10:54

Review time: 10 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This manuscript is excellently written. Despite a decrease in the overall incidence of gastric cancer in recent decades, the incidence of the patient subgroup with signet-ring cell carcinoma is growing. Signet-ring cell carcinoma is associated with a worse prognosis in advanced stage. A multimodal treatment strategy, including neoadjuvant chemotherapy, needs to be developed and established to improve patient outcomes. In this retrospective study, the authors evaluate the perioperative and long-term outcomes of neoadjuvant chemotherapy for locally advanced gastric signet-ring cell carcinoma. The authors included 144 signet-ring cell carcinoma patients, the sample size is big. The data analysis methods are reasonable. The results are interesting, especially the operative characteristics and postoperative course. Data in tables are clear, and amazing. Well done study. Only the figure are not in a high resolution, please check and re-provide it. Thank you.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

[Y] No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 53978

Title: Outcome of Gastric Signet Ring Cell Carcinoma after Neoadjuvant Chemotherapy versus Upfront Surgery: A Propensity Score Matched Retrospective Study

Reviewer's code: 05266760

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: FCPS, FEBS, MD, PhD

Professional title: Professor, Research Scientist

Reviewer's country: Germany

Author's country: China

Manuscript submission date: 2020-01-13

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-01-13 08:53

Reviewer performed review: 2020-01-14 11:15

Review time: 1 Day and 2 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

An interesting study about the outcome of gastric signet ring cell carcinoma treated by the neoadjuvant chemotherapy and upfront surgery. The manuscript is very well written.

1. The title reflects the main subject of the manuscript. 2. Methods are clearly described. 3. Results are interesting. The tables requires a minor editing. 4. Discussion is good. Suggest the authors to include and discuss the article "Deep Inside of Gastric Signet-Ring Cell Carcinoma" by Roncati et al, PMID: 30064231 DOI: 10.4149/neo_2018_170404N246. 5. Reference list is reasonable. 6. Some minor spelling mistakes should be checked and corrected.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 53978

Title: Outcome of Gastric Signet Ring Cell Carcinoma after Neoadjuvant Chemotherapy versus Upfront Surgery: A Propensity Score Matched Retrospective Study

Reviewer's code: 05261059

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: FEBG, MD, PhD

Professional title: Assistant Professor, Senior Lecturer

Reviewer's country: United Kingdom

Author's country: China

Manuscript submission date: 2020-01-13

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-01-13 08:53

Reviewer performed review: 2020-01-14 11:28

Review time: 1 Day and 2 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This study is very interesting. The authors retrospectively analysis the outcomes of 144 patients with cT3/4 stage signet-ring cell carcinoma. The results are attractive. Are there any pathological images? If so, it's better to add it. Manuscript requires a minor editing, both the English and format. Some unknown character (may be Chinese punctuations?) should be checked and corrected.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No