

**Manuscript No 54698**

**Exclusive cigar smoking in the USA and lung cancer, COPD, heart disease, stroke and circulatory disease: a systematic review**

**Response to Reviewer 1**

Thank you for your helpful comments and your recommendation to publish with minor revisions. Below we discuss each of the points you raised.

“1: Some reports were not prospective. Authors should show this in table 1 and 3.”

Tables 1-3 each include a column headed “Study type”. For each of these tables this column has the values P for prospective studies, C for case control studies and X for cross-sectional analyses.

“2: Could you make new table comparing risk between present study and previous study.”

We have added several paragraphs to the Discussion comparing our results with those given in other reports on similar subjects. We found only one other relevant meta-analysis, which assessed the risk of lung cancer among cigar smokers but which was not restricted to studies in the USA. The other reports simply listed individual study results and, sometimes, included text that assessed the overall evidence. The individual studies listed had already been included in our meta-analyses whenever they related to the subject of our paper (exclusive cigar smokers, studies carried out in the USA, assessing the risk of a disease of interest).

As these other reports did not present comparable numerical summaries of the evidence, we did not feel that it was appropriate to present them in tabular form.

“3. Authors should discuss cause of difference between cigar smoking and cigarettes.”

The newly-added paragraphs mentioned above (for point 2) also summarise possible reasons for the difference in risk between cigar smokers and cigarette smokers, as

reported by Smoking and Tobacco Control Monograph No. 9 and the Surgeon General's Report of 1983.

## **Response to Reviewer 2**

Thank you for your kind comments and your recommendation that our paper be accepted for publication.

## **Additional manuscript changes**

After submitting the manuscript for the first time, we became aware of a Corrigendum to the paper by Inoue-Choi et al. ("Contemporary associations of exclusive cigarette, cigar, pipe and smokeless tobacco use with overall and cause-specific mortality in the United States", JNCI Cancer Spectrum, 2019). We have used the information in that Corrigendum to update the values in our databases, then we have rerun the analyses, updated the values in the Tables and amended the text of the manuscript to reflect the changes in the analysis results. The changes were generally only minor, and did not affect the overall interpretation.