



## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Transplantation

**Manuscript NO:** 54871

**Title:** The interrelationship between Toll-like receptors and infection after orthotopic liver transplantation

**Reviewer's code:** 03742333

**Position:** Editorial Board

**Academic degree:** MD, PhD

**Professional title:** Academic Research, Doctor, Surgeon

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** United Kingdom

**Author's Country/Territory:** Egypt

**Manuscript submission date:** 2020-02-24

**Reviewer chosen by:** Jin-Zhou Tang

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2020-03-27 14:27

**Reviewer performed review:** 2020-03-28 15:19

**Review time:** 1 Day

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Re-review</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://**www.wjgnet.com

## **SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

I have read with great interest the manuscript entitled 'The interrelationship between Toll-like receptors and infection after orthotopic liver transplantation' submitted to the World Journal of Transplantation. In this narrative review article, the authors discuss the role of Toll like receptors in the context of infection following liver transplantation. Although it does not add new information in the literature, the topic is of great scientific interest and the manuscript well written. I would like to congratulate the authors on this. I have just a couple of minor comments. **MINOR COMMENTS** 1. The major limitation of this article is the study design, a narrative review article. It is well known that narrative review articles are more susceptible to selection bias and this may affect its conclusion. Systematic review articles adhere to strict methodology, thus are, potentially, more reliable scientifically. In spite of this limitation, the document seems well balanced and carefully prepared. 2. A paragraph in the discussion acknowledging the study design limitation—discussed above—must be included to alert readers 3. The manuscript would benefit from careful proofreading because there are few typos. For example, in the hepatic stellate cells section the phrase 'In [6, 9, 12, 13], while participating in cell defense... upon the exposure to LPS...' seems unfinished. Other minor typos occur throughout the manuscript, such as the reference 'Blair and Kusne, 2005' differing from the reference format employed.



## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Transplantation

**Manuscript NO:** 54871

**Title:** The interrelationship between Toll-like receptors and infection after orthotopic liver transplantation

**Reviewer's code:** 03475779

**Position:** Peer Reviewer

**Academic degree:** MD, PhD

**Professional title:** Academic Fellow, Associate Professor, Surgeon, Teacher

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** Italy

**Author's Country/Territory:** Egypt

**Manuscript submission date:** 2020-02-24

**Reviewer chosen by:** Ruo-Yu Ma

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2020-04-17 06:52

**Reviewer performed review:** 2020-04-17 08:07

**Review time:** 1 Hour

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Re-review</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568  
**E-mail:** [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com)  
**https://**[www.wjgnet.com](https://www.wjgnet.com)

#### **SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

The article deals with a long and detailed description of how the immune system responds following post-transplant aggression of infectious agents. This description sounds more like a chapter of a book or a summary of knowledge in literature than as a review. In fact, the article does not produce new knowledge nor does it express merit assessments on the subject matter. Nothing is said about the methodology used to search for articles: the search criteria are not indicated (keywords, search engines and repositories or databases, type and value of scientific journals, etc.), nor the criteria for choosing and exclusion of the articles that emerged from this research. In this way the description of the relationship between TLRs and the infecting agent is detailed but arbitrary. The article also contains numerous repetitions of concepts about the genesis of infections and the role of TRL in their determinism. The underlining of the role of the SNPs considered also follows the same fate. In this regard, a table with an indication of the individual SNP, its effect (positive or negative) and its real or prospective translation in the clinical setting would have been useful. The conclusion does not offer considerations on what emerged from the treatment of the topic, but is limited to an uncritical ratification of what is present in the literature without indicating any research lines or possible future clinical effects and to the statement about the need for further studies but without indicating objectives or hypotheses of work on it.