

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 55373

Title: Therapeutic efficiency of bone marrow-derived mesenchymal stem cells for liver fibrosis: A systematic review of in vivo studies

Reviewer's code: 00051373

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Associate Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Taiwan

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2020-08-21

Reviewer chosen by: Jia-Ping Yan

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-09-14 09:36

Reviewer performed review: 2020-09-15 15:31

Review time: 1 Day and 5 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Thank you very much to give me the opportunity to read the comprehensive review regarding the therapeutic efficiency of BR-MSCs for liver fibrosis. It should be much beneficial to the readers of world journal of gastroenterology. Of course, it should be accepting for publication with high priority.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 55373

Title: Therapeutic efficiency of bone marrow-derived mesenchymal stem cells for liver fibrosis: A systematic review of in vivo studies

Reviewer's code: 00503405

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Senior Lecturer, Senior Scientist

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Hungary

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2020-08-21

Reviewer chosen by: Jia-Ping Yan

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-09-17 17:25

Reviewer performed review: 2020-09-17 18:28

Review time: 1 Hour

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The comprehensive review of Aldhamin et al. aimed to summarize the therapeutic possibilities of BMDSCs for liver fibrosis by systematically revising the latest literature of in vivo studies. This manuscript is well written, structured in a logical way, the figures and tables are all clear, well presented and informative. After a brief review of the complex pathogenesis of liver fibrosis the authors focused on the identification of BMDMSCs and summarize their potential contribution of liver physiology/pathology. The revision of cell culturing, improvement of stem cell efficiency, and the routes of SC transplantation are well detailed, all the current strategies are well presented. The review in vivo study results are also clear, contains relevant data, and gives a future perspective for the topic. The conclusions are clear and moderately presented. The used references are adequate. Some minor English language polishing is recommended. I suggest to accept the manuscript for publication in WJG.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 55373

Title: Therapeutic efficiency of bone marrow-derived mesenchymal stem cells for liver fibrosis: A systematic review of in vivo studies

Reviewer's code: 00058401

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Doctor, Emeritus Professor, Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Brazil

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2020-08-21

Reviewer chosen by: Jia-Ping Yan

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-09-15 15:36

Reviewer performed review: 2020-09-18 22:30

Review time: 3 Days and 6 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Congratulations. I made many questions about doubts that a had.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 55373

Title: Therapeutic efficiency of bone marrow-derived mesenchymal stem cells for liver fibrosis: A systematic review of in vivo studies

Reviewer's code: 01557050

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Japan

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2020-08-21

Reviewer chosen by: Jia-Ping Yan

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-09-14 04:02

Reviewer performed review: 2020-09-20 07:44

Review time: 6 Days and 3 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1) General comments Dr. Aldhamin and Dr. Nan, et al. reviewed 'The Therapeutic Efficiency of Bone Marrow-Derived Mesenchymal Stem Cells for liver fibrosis: A Systematic Review of In vivo Studies'. The article is informative and well presentation. The reviewer has some comments. 1. The reviewer should describe CONCLUSIONS more briefly. The reviewer described limitations of this review. Please separate limitations from CONCLUSIONS. The authors can describe Limitations and Further (Future) Study with a heading before CONCLUSIONS.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 55373

Title: Therapeutic efficiency of bone marrow-derived mesenchymal stem cells for liver fibrosis: A systematic review of in vivo studies

Reviewer's code: 00053419

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: PhD

Professional title: Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Spain

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2020-08-21

Reviewer chosen by: Jia-Ping Yan

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-09-15 07:14

Reviewer performed review: 2020-09-25 15:39

Review time: 10 Days and 8 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript provides a review summarizing different aspects relative to the implementation of BM MSCs for the treatment of liver fibrosis. The topic is relevant and the review is timely. However, there are several aspects that must be considered by the authors. Overall, the manuscript contains various sections discussing different aspects, some of which are not of sound interest, considering that the focus of the analysis is that indicated in the title. The sections dedicated to liver fibrosis and MSCs should be shortened and focused on the main topic of the review. In contrast, the last section dedicated to analyze the efficiency of BM-MSCs treatment of liver fibrosis should be substantially extended and enriched with provocative discussions. Additional comments are as follows: - Figures must be explained in more detail in the main text and in more auto explicative figure legends. - The concept of therapeutic imminence index must be defined. How is it calculated? In which principles is it based on?

RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 55373

Title: Therapeutic efficiency of bone marrow-derived mesenchymal stem cells for liver fibrosis: A systematic review of in vivo studies

Reviewer's code: 00053419

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: PhD

Professional title: Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Spain

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2020-08-21

Reviewer chosen by: Pan Huang

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-11-02 13:07

Reviewer performed review: 2020-11-02 16:08

Review time: 3 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors have addressed the issues raised by this reviewer. I have no further questions.