

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 55606

Title: Hepatic TNF receptor signaling is not protective in non-alcoholic steatohepatitis, but attenuates insulin resistance

Reviewer's code: 03465463

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: FCPS, PhD

Professional title: Adjunct Professor, Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Taiwan

Author's Country/Territory: United States

Manuscript submission date: 2020-03-28

Reviewer chosen by: Jia-Ping Yan

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-05-10 06:58

Reviewer performed review: 2020-05-10 07:52

Review time: 1 Hour

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This submission demonstrated the negative role of TNFR1 signaling in hepatocytes for steatohepatitis development using a mouse model lacking hepatic TNFR1 to induce the diet-induced NASH. I like to give the following comments. 1. Results from mice lacking hepatic TNFR1 are not the same as that constitutional activation of TNFR1 promoted the progression of NASH. The suitable explains are not discussed in clear. 2. Role of TNFR2 did not conduct in introduction section. 3. In biochemical assay, tissue was homogenized in 6N HCl. Please give the reference(s) to support. 4. Plasma levels of cytokines in these mice seem helpful. 5. In Figure 2, legends need to check. Additionally, the significant variation for percentage of liver/body weight must show in correct. 6. In Figure 3, sample size in each group needs to show in clear. Variations also must indicate in correct. 7. Hepatic TNFR1 deficiency showed a role in glucose metabolism. Please add more data to support this new finding. 8. From the knockout mice, loss of TNFR1 in hepatocytes seems changed in glucose metabolism but not the lipid profiles. However, suitable speculation(s) were not discussed in clear. 9. Limitation(s) may assist the unclear points in this truth.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 55606

Title: Hepatic TNF receptor signaling is not protective in non-alcoholic steatohepatitis, but attenuates insulin resistance

Reviewer's code: 02926997

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Associate Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Iran

Author's Country/Territory: United States

Manuscript submission date: 2020-03-28

Reviewer chosen by: Jia-Ping Yan

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-05-11 10:05

Reviewer performed review: 2020-05-11 10:10

Review time: 1 Hour

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a narrative review about role of TNFR1 in NASH. The result showed that obesity, liver injury, steatosis and fibrosis was not different between TNFR1 Δ HEP and TNFR1^{fl/fl} mice. However, Tnfr1 deficiency in hepatocytes protected against glucose intolerance and insulin resistance. It concluded that Hepatic TNF receptor signaling is not protective in non-alcoholic steatohepatitis, but attenuates insulin resistance. The manuscript is well written and contains important data regarding the main focus of review. It could be accepted after minor English editing.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 55606

Title: Hepatic TNF receptor signaling is not protective in non-alcoholic steatohepatitis, but attenuates insulin resistance

Reviewer's code: 03664938

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: PhD

Professional title: Associate Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: China

Author's Country/Territory: United States

Manuscript submission date: 2020-03-28

Reviewer chosen by: Jia-Ping Yan

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-05-11 08:24

Reviewer performed review: 2020-05-14 09:17

Review time: 3 Days

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The study proposed an interesting topic, exploring the role of TNF receptor in the development of non-alcoholic steatohepatitis (NASH). Through applied conditional TNFR1 knock out in hepatocytes, the authors concluded that Both NASH and HCC development were dependent on TNF produced by inflammatory macrophages that inhibition of TNFR1 signaling in hepatocytes can protect from diet-induced NASH, but improved insulin resistance. Although the conclusions are quite objective based on the data, the whole study seems to be incomplete. Major concerns 1. The title, according to the study design, the authors mainly explored the TNFR1 function in hepatocytes, whereas the liver contains heterogenous cells, it is not proper to use “hepatic”; 2. The phenotypic data of TNFR1 deficiency should be provided; 3. The authors get evidence that TNFR1 knockout in hepatocytes improved insulin resistance, at least to try to provide some data to explain such phenotype. 4. The authors mentioned that “In this study, Tnfr1 knock-out resulted in increased numbers of both resident (i.e., Kupffer cells) and recruited macrophages into the liver, as well as up-regulation of IL-1 β and IL-6 in the liver along with increased release into the plasma. “, but I can not find these data in the present version; 5. Typos need to be carefully checked.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 55606

Title: Hepatic TNF receptor signaling is not protective in non-alcoholic steatohepatitis, but attenuates insulin resistance

Reviewer's code: 02445646

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: FRCP (Hon), FRCS (Ed), MD

Professional title: Director, Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: United Kingdom

Author's Country/Territory: United States

Manuscript submission date: 2020-03-28

Reviewer chosen by: Jia-Ping Yan

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-05-12 15:35

Reviewer performed review: 2020-05-18 13:31

Review time: 5 Days and 21 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

No comments to the authors.

RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 55606

Title: Hepatic TNF receptor signaling is not protective in non-alcoholic steatohepatitis, but attenuates insulin resistance

Reviewer's code: 02926997

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Associate Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Iran

Author's Country/Territory: United States

Manuscript submission date: 2020-03-28

Reviewer chosen by: Ze-Mao Gong

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-07-24 19:33

Reviewer performed review: 2020-07-24 19:36

Review time: 1 Hour

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

No comments

RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 55606

Title: Hepatic TNF receptor signaling is not protective in non-alcoholic steatohepatitis, but attenuates insulin resistance

Reviewer's code: 03465463

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: FCPS, PhD

Professional title: Adjunct Professor, Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Taiwan

Author's Country/Territory: United States

Manuscript submission date: 2020-03-28

Reviewer chosen by: Ze-Mao Gong

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-07-23 08:14

Reviewer performed review: 2020-07-25 08:02

Review time: 1 Day and 23 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

It has been revised in a good way. Please take care of the language in context.