

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 56537

Title: Compromised therapeutic value of pediatric liver transplantation in ethylmalonic encephalopathy: A case report

Reviewer's code: 03261379

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Associate Professor, Chief Doctor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Romania

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2020-05-12

Reviewer chosen by: Jia-Ping Yan

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-06-07 09:17

Reviewer performed review: 2020-06-07 20:46

Review time: 11 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Congratulations on your article. The case is very well presented and the comparison to the other cases described in literature is very clear. There are minor grammar changes that need to be made. Since this a very rare condition, it would be interesting to mention other treatment strategies that may be used in EE such as hemodialysis (Acute and Chronic Management in an Atypical Case of Ethylmalonic Encephalopathy. Kitzler TM, Gupta IR, Osterman B, Poulin C, Trakadis Y, Waters PJ, Buhas DC. JIMD Rep. 2019;45:57-63) or intravenous N-acetylcysteine (Kılıç, M., Dedeoğlu, Ö., Göçmen, R. et al. Successful treatment of a patient with ethylmalonic encephalopathy by intravenous N-acetylcysteine. Metab Brain Dis 32, 293–296 (2017).)

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 56537

Title: Compromised therapeutic value of pediatric liver transplantation in ethylmalonic encephalopathy: A case report

Reviewer's code: 00054549

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: BSc

Professional title: Doctor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Australia

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2020-05-12

Reviewer chosen by: Jia-Ping Yan

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-06-07 23:05

Reviewer performed review: 2020-06-11 21:51

Review time: 3 Days and 22 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an important case report and hence it is worthy of publication. I have some comments with respect to enhancing the manuscript. 1) Reference is made to the OMIM website in the first sentence of the Introduction section of the manuscript. This needs to be included in the References - <https://www.omim.org/entry/602473> 2) There is some published literature out of China pertaining to the incidence of ethylmalonic encephalopathy, this should be referred to - Diagnosis and therapeutic monitoring of inborn errors of metabolism in 00,077 newborns from Jining city in China. Yang et al. BMC Pediatrics, 2018, 118, 110. <https://link.springer.com/article/10.1186/s12887-018-1090-2> 3) In addition there is a Liver Transplant Registry in China which does report from time to time. Has this case been reported to the Registry and if so are you aware of how many other children have been transplanted for metabolic disorders in China to date? It is important to also report cases to a central registry so that their outcomes can be tracked. 4) Finally the discussion section does not quite encapsulate all of the factors that may contribute to improved patient outcomes for this condition, noting that your patient did have a novel gene mutation. It is possible that there is a spectrum of phenotypes of this disorder partly due to the variation in the nature of the gene mutations. This may partly explain the difference in outcomes seen to date with liver transplantation in the handful of cases that have been reported. I noted with interest that the best result to date was seen with a non related donor liver (ie the case transplanted with the deceased donor liver), which raises the question as to whether live donor liver transplantation with a related donor is truly the best option (although it may be the only option in the absence of deceased donors). So there seem to be genetic factors, recipient factors (not all which are currently understood) and possibly factors related to the organ donor which contribute to the



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

outcomes. If this can all be covered off in the discussion section.

RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 56537

Title: Compromised therapeutic value of pediatric liver transplantation in ethylmalonic encephalopathy: A case report

Reviewer's code: 00054549

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: BSc

Professional title: Doctor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Australia

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2020-05-12

Reviewer chosen by: Pan Huang

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-08-30 01:13

Reviewer performed review: 2020-08-31 02:32

Review time: 1 Day and 1 Hour

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

I am satisfied that you have addressed all of the comments that I previously made during the initial review of this manuscript

RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 56537

Title: Compromised therapeutic value of pediatric liver transplantation in ethylmalonic encephalopathy: A case report

Reviewer's code: 03261379

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Associate Professor, Chief Doctor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Romania

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2020-05-12

Reviewer chosen by: Pan Huang

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-08-31 12:03

Reviewer performed review: 2020-08-31 12:10

Review time: 1 Hour

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

You have succeeded in improving the article, and the discussions section is particularly interesting.