

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Stem Cells

Manuscript NO: 57061

Title: Still 'Dwelling in the Possibility' - A Critical Update on Stem Cell Therapy for Acute on Chronic Liver Failure

Reviewer's code: 03478635

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: PhD

Professional title: Senior Research Fellow

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Japan

Author's Country/Territory: India

Manuscript submission date: 2020-05-24

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-05-25 00:20

Reviewer performed review: 2020-05-25 07:38

Review time: 7 Hours

| | |
|---------------------------------|---|
| Scientific quality | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish |
| Language quality | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection |
| Conclusion | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection |
| Re-review | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No |
| Peer-reviewer statements | Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No |



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is very interesting study on stem cell therapy for chronic liver failure. It is not clear what "stem cell therapy for acute on chronic liver failure" means in the title, legend texts and figures. The term acute-on-chronic liver failure (ACLF) may be better in a whole manuscript. Proofreading is needed.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Stem Cells

Manuscript NO: 57061

Title: Still 'Dwelling in the Possibility' - A Critical Update on Stem Cell Therapy for Acute on Chronic Liver Failure

Reviewer's code: 03668558

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Academic Fellow

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Italy

Author's Country/Territory: India

Manuscript submission date: 2020-05-24

Reviewer chosen by: Ya-Juan Ma

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-08-06 06:27

Reviewer performed review: 2020-08-06 07:56

Review time: 1 Hour

| | |
|---------------------------------|---|
| Scientific quality | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish |
| Language quality | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection |
| Conclusion | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection |
| Re-review | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No |
| Peer-reviewer statements | Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No |

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This was a narrative review on the therapeutic role of stem cells in patients with acute-on-chronic liver failure (ACLF). The main finding of this study was that therapeutic options considering stem cells were not effective in patients with ACLF, according to available data. On a general view, the introduction section is good, whereas the following two chapters (ACLF and liver regeneration; stem cells and their use in diseases of the liver) are somewhat redundant. The most important section (stem cell therapy for ACLF) should be widened, with a deeper discussion on pros and cons of all studies reported in Table 1. For instance, the first study cited in this chapter (Ref 22) evaluated the role of adipose tissue derived stem cells in rabbits, whereas the second study (ref 23) used umbilical-cord derived MSCs in humans; another study dealt with pediatric patients. Moreover, the Authors cited a metanalysis by Chen et al, on three studies. Two of them were cited in Table 1, but not the third one (PMiD 27687792). I suggest to look for recently published studies on this field. I suggest to more deeply describe adverse events reported throughout the studies. The introduction section correctly reported two different classifications of ACLF (Eastern vs. Western criteria).