

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 57868

Title: Autoimmune hepatitis in a patient with IgA nephropathy: A case report

Reviewer's code: 03490697

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Assistant Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Japan

Author's Country/Territory: South Korea

Manuscript submission date: 2020-06-29

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-06-29 12:08

Reviewer performed review: 2020-06-29 16:08

Review time: 3 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this manuscript, authors reported a case of IgA nephropathy concurrent with autoimmune hepatitis which led to acute liver failure requiring liver transplantation. The case seems to be interesting because IgA nephropathy in patients with autoimmune hepatitis has been rarely reported. However, there are some concerns in this report. The reviewer's comments are described as follows. 1. In this report, the temporal association between IgA nephropathy and autoimmune hepatitis remained unclear. Subclinical IgA nephropathy is relatively common in Asian populations. When abnormalities of urine test and liver function test occurred, respectively, and which occurred first are critical points. 2. There were no findings suggesting autoimmune mechanisms of IgA nephropathy rather than impaired IgA clearance in liver disease in this case. Detection of circulating autoantibody against galactose-deficient IgA1 should be useful to explain the autoimmune mechanisms. 3. Authors diagnosed autoimmune hepatitis based on the revised scoring system of the International Autoimmune Hepatitis Group and the score was 16. However, the patient had hepatitis B antigen as described in laboratory data. The score for positive hepatitis virus is -3 but not +3. Therefore, the score 16 appears to be wrong. In addition, Including IgA nephropathy as "other autoimmune disorder" is generally uncommon. This case could not be considered definitive as autoimmune hepatitis based on the scoring system. 4. In renal histology, were there any complement depositions? In addition, were there any glomerular chronic lesions such as segmental or global sclerosis? 5. Acute kidney injury was probably caused by hepato-renal syndrome but not IgA nephropathy. Authors should clearly explain the pathogenesis of kidney injury at each timing.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 57868

Title: Autoimmune hepatitis in a patient with IgA nephropathy: A case report

Reviewer's code: 05077783

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Surgeon

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Brazil

Author's Country/Territory: South Korea

Manuscript submission date: 2020-06-29

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-06-30 13:42

Reviewer performed review: 2020-07-01 16:35

Review time: 1 Day and 2 Hours

Scientific quality	[<input checked="" type="radio"/>] Grade A: Excellent [<input type="radio"/>] Grade B: Very good [<input type="radio"/>] Grade C: Good [<input type="radio"/>] Grade D: Fair [<input type="radio"/>] Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	[<input checked="" type="radio"/>] Grade A: Priority publishing [<input type="radio"/>] Grade B: Minor language polishing [<input type="radio"/>] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing [<input type="radio"/>] Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	[<input checked="" type="radio"/>] Accept (High priority) [<input type="radio"/>] Accept (General priority) [<input type="radio"/>] Minor revision [<input type="radio"/>] Major revision [<input type="radio"/>] Rejection
Re-review	[<input checked="" type="radio"/>] Yes [<input type="radio"/>] No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: [<input checked="" type="radio"/>] Anonymous [<input type="radio"/>] Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: [<input type="radio"/>] Yes [<input checked="" type="radio"/>] No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors present the case report of an uncommon association between IgA nephropathy and acute hepatic failure. The manuscript is written in a clear and concise manner. It would be interesting to have more information on the results of the tomography scan (whether there were radiological signs of chronic hepatopathy and portal hypertension) and of the endoscopy (for any findings suggestive of primary sclerosing cholangitis). Since the histopathological study of the liver was unable to unequivocally confirm autoimmune hepatitis as the primary cause of the liver failure, it would be also interesting to know if other causes of acute liver failure were excluded (such as copper, ceruloplasmin and iron metabolism studies).

RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 57868

Title: Autoimmune hepatitis in a patient with IgA nephropathy: A case report

Reviewer's code: 03490697

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Assistant Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Japan

Author's Country/Territory: South Korea

Manuscript submission date: 2020-06-29

Reviewer chosen by: Jia-Ping Yan

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-08-07 07:52

Reviewer performed review: 2020-08-07 09:27

Review time: 1 Hour

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Authors have addressed most of the reviewer's concerns. However, regarding the



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

comments #3, including IgA nephropathy in International autoimmune hepatitis group (IAIHG) scoring system as an autoimmune disease appears to be inappropriate. IAIHG scoring system was revised in 2008. Now, the simplified scoring system has been more popular and does not need complicated information. The reviewer recommends replacing the original scoring in the manuscript with revised, simplified scoring. The results should not be changed.

RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 57868

Title: Autoimmune hepatitis in a patient with IgA nephropathy: A case report

Reviewer's code: 05077783

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Surgeon

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Brazil

Author's Country/Territory: South Korea

Manuscript submission date: 2020-06-29

Reviewer chosen by: Jia-Ping Yan

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-08-07 16:30

Reviewer performed review: 2020-08-07 17:02

Review time: 1 Hour

Scientific quality	[<input checked="" type="radio"/>] Grade A: Excellent [<input type="radio"/>] Grade B: Very good [<input type="radio"/>] Grade C: Good [<input type="radio"/>] Grade D: Fair [<input type="radio"/>] Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	[<input checked="" type="radio"/>] Grade A: Priority publishing [<input type="radio"/>] Grade B: Minor language polishing [<input type="radio"/>] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing [<input type="radio"/>] Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	[<input checked="" type="radio"/>] Accept (High priority) [<input type="radio"/>] Accept (General priority) [<input type="radio"/>] Minor revision [<input type="radio"/>] Major revision [<input type="radio"/>] Rejection
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: [<input checked="" type="radio"/>] Anonymous [<input type="radio"/>] Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: [<input type="radio"/>] Yes [<input checked="" type="radio"/>] No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The case reported by the authors is of scientific interest, and the revised manuscript is



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

clear, well-written and informative. We recommend it for publication.