

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 59596

Title: Skeletal muscle metastases of hepatocellular carcinoma : A case report and review of literature

Reviewer's code: 00057826

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Professor, Surgeon, Surgical Oncologist

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Italy

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2020-09-28

Reviewer chosen by: Ya-Juan Ma

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-10-28 09:19

Reviewer performed review: 2020-10-28 09:22

Review time: 1 Hour

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The article needs a better literature review in the field of skeletal muscle metatases.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 59596

Title: Skeletal muscle metastases of hepatocellular carcinoma : A case report and review of literature

Reviewer's code: 04683021

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: FRCS (Gen Surg), MD, MS

Professional title: Lecturer, Surgeon

Reviewer's Country/Territory: United Kingdom

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2020-09-28

Reviewer chosen by: Ya-Juan Ma

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-12-08 22:18

Reviewer performed review: 2020-12-08 22:42

Review time: 1 Hour

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

An interesting case report on a very rare presentation of metastatic liver tumour. Exceedingly rare, especially 6 years after a transplanted liver for liver cancer. The manuscript is well written and the relevant question as to the possible mechanism for this is asked. The language needs minor revision. I have enclosed some suggestions as attachment

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 59596

Title: Skeletal muscle metastases of hepatocellular carcinoma : A case report and review of literature

Reviewer's code: 03290510

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Associate Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: United States

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2020-09-28

Reviewer chosen by: Ya-Juan Ma

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-12-08 19:47

Reviewer performed review: 2020-12-17 06:31

Review time: 8 Days and 10 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Thank you so much for your very interesting case report. Overall, this seems to be one of the first reported cases of Hepatocellular Carcinoma with metastasis to the skeletal muscle. This case report has a number of strengths, but there are areas for improvement prior to acceptance. Overall, there are grammatical errors that need to be corrected and a better timeline needs to be established. In regards to feedback and recommended areas for change, they are as follows: Major concerns: (1) The same sentences from the introduction are copied into the discussion, specifically the first paragraph and a large portion of the second paragraph of the Discussion is taken verbatim from the Introduction or elsewhere in the report. (2) Introduction and throughout the manuscript: There are a number of grammatical errors throughout the article that require correction. Minor concerns: (1) The original details of the primary cancer (HCC) need to be described given the rarity of this finding, specifically the initial stage, if there was vascular invasion and other such details. (2) Title: The title is not clear. The use of the descriptor "long term" is potentially confusing to the readers. In addition, it might be more specific to say hepatocellular carcinoma as opposed to liver cancer. (3) Keywords: The keywords could be more focused on the specific case instead of broad topics such as "ultrasound" and "pathological." These can frequently be found among Medical Subject Headings in PubMed. (4) Abstract: Please provide tumor type and not "liver tumor." (5) Core tip: "Skeletal muscle delivered factors may play a vital role in the rarity of skeletal muscle metastasis. Therefore further studies should be carried out to estimate the biochemical characteristics of skeletal muscle delivered factors and their anti-tumor activity". This appears somewhat inappropriate as a summary of a case report. It is unclear what "skeletal muscle delivered factors" are. Introduction: The referencing is commended, but there are unsupported statements in the manuscript. For

example, the first line of your Introduction – “Hepatocellular carcinoma (HCC) is ranked sixth in malignancies and fourth in the mortality rate.” would benefit from a source and this exact sentence is repeated in the Discussion. In addition, re-wording would assist this statement. (6) Introduction: When discussing the skeletal muscle metastases, it would be more clear if you defined this as “Metastases to the skeletal muscle from HCC.” Also, it would be beneficial to discuss the most common sites of HCC metastasis in your introduction. (7) Be sure to accurately label imaging and be careful with phrases such as “Arterial spectrum.” (8) Provide clarification on phrases such as “Spindle mass” (page 5, line 83). (9) Figure 3: be more specific about what the IHC stains are indicating. (10) Discussion: For your citation of Katafigiotis, it would be useful to know where these tumors were metastatic from. And again for Li et al (page 9, line 150), where are these skeletal muscle metastases from. (11) Discussion: It is recommended to avoid generalized statements such as “and so on” – page 9, line 148, “etc” on page 9, line 160. (12) Discussion: The discussion should focus on a relevance to the case. You describe three types of MRI findings on line 155 of page 9, but significance to the case is not provided. Also, the differential diagnosis discussion could be shortened and more focused. (13) Conclusion: In the conclusion, it is mentioned that skeletal muscle metastases have a poor prognosis, but there are no statistics/references presented to support that statement. (14) Conclusion: Clarify the timing of the resection versus when this case report was written. You state he is in “good condition” but how long post op is the patient. Also, clarify whether any chemotherapy or additional therapy was required. (15) Conclusion: Clarify what you mean by “Due to a lack of data, we have not been able to draw a firm conclusion.” It is not clear what that conclusion is focused on. (16) Referencing: References are not provided in numerical order.

RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 59596

Title: Skeletal muscle metastases of hepatocellular carcinoma : A case report and review of literature

Reviewer's code: 04683021

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: FRCS (Gen Surg), MD, MS

Professional title: Lecturer, Surgeon

Reviewer's Country/Territory: United Kingdom

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2020-09-28

Reviewer chosen by: Le Zhang

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-12-25 19:40

Reviewer performed review: 2020-12-26 14:10

Review time: 18 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

Again, the language used in the manuscript can be improved. The opening sentence - '6 years ago...' is not required. The conclusion - ' which would focus on ongoing research' does not make sense.. do the authors mean to say ' should be the focus for ongoing research'? In the introduction - ' reported frequencies of HCC metastasis include ... do the authors mean to say - reported sites of HCC metastasis? In the case study section, there is no need for subheadings such as chief complaints, history of present illness, physical examination etc... There are quite a few simple grammatical mistakes which need to be corrected to make the flow of reading good. The authors have made efforts to address the points made by the reviewers. They present a rare case of skeletal metastasis from HCC occurring 6 years after transplantation. Is it possible at all to compare the immunotype of this metastasis to the original tumour which was resected 6 years back to trace the origin? if possible, this would be of great significance

RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 59596

Title: Skeletal muscle metastases of hepatocellular carcinoma : A case report and review of literature

Reviewer's code: 03290510

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Associate Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: United States

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2020-09-28

Reviewer chosen by: Le Zhang

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-12-25 02:20

Reviewer performed review: 2020-12-26 19:03

Review time: 1 Day and 16 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

Thank you for your re-submission of this interesting case report. Overall, the quality of the article has improved. We have minor recommendations. Our specific recommendations include: (1) Please disclose the initial stage of the HCC prior to liver transplantation. Was it outside the Milan criteria, did it have vascular invasion, what was the pathology (mixed vs pure HCC)? (2) Provide the month/year of the resection of this skeletal muscle metastasis and what the exact resection involved – what specific muscles was this tumor overlying and what were partially resected? (3) Clarify what “biceps silenced SMM” means on line 153 (4) The line “Treatment for this disease is controversial as there is no exact treatment regimen addressing metastatic lesions located in the skeletal muscles and bilateral adrenals” is potentially confusing to the reader. Did this patient have adrenal metastasis or what is this in reference to? (5) While we understand that SMM are rare, the majority of the discussion is focused on SMMs in general, not about HCC metastasis to the skeletal muscle, thus your conclusions about SMMs are too generalized. It could be more focused on saying that HCC metastasis to the skeletal muscle is rare, not previously reported, and recognized as a possibility in patients with HCC.