

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 59620

Title: Alteration of fecal tryptophan metabolism correlates with shifted microbiota and may be involved in the pathogenesis of colorectal cancer

Reviewer's code: 00004011

Position: Associate Editor

Academic degree: PhD

Professional title: Associate Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Greece

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2020-09-20

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-09-21 06:42

Reviewer performed review: 2020-09-23 11:53

Review time: 2 Days and 5 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript is not clear regarding methodology issues 1. The authors should described in more details the specimens collected from each patient 2. it is not clear if tissue materials used for RT-PCR are from the same patients that fecal samples were collected 3. Did the patients received chemotherapy? or other therapy? since therapy influence the microbiota and microbiome function

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 59620

Title: Alteration of fecal tryptophan metabolism correlates with shifted microbiota and may be involved in the pathogenesis of colorectal cancer

Reviewer's code: 05095461

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Doctor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: China

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2020-09-20

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-09-22 03:13

Reviewer performed review: 2020-09-24 07:57

Review time: 2 Days and 4 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This manuscript describes the correlations between Trp metabolites and gut microbiota in patients and healthy controls, suggesting that impaired fecal Trp metabolism and elevated tissue Trp metabolism may participate in the pathogenesis of CRC by reducing intestinal barrier function and promoting tumor immune escape. The study and results from clinical samples in this manuscript are interesting. However, the role of tryptophan metabolism in CRC and its correlation with gut microbiota has attracted wide attention (Transl Res, 2016, 167(1):67-79. doi: 10.1016/j.trsl.2015.07.003.). The hypothesis mentioned in this manuscript has existed (We hypothesized that there was an alteration of gut Trp metabolism mediated by microbiota and that it might be involved in the pathogenesis of cancer in patients with CRC). -The fecal Trp metabolism was correlated with shifted microbiota in CRC patients. However, there is no evidence that they have participated in the pathogenesis of CRC. May be CRC induced the changes of microbiota and fecal Trp metabolism. -The indexes of intestinal barrier function include ZO-1, Claudin, Muc, and so on. Just detection of ZO-1 only in mRNA level is not very convincing. -The manuscript has some typos and format errors.

RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 59620

Title: Alteration of fecal tryptophan metabolism correlates with shifted microbiota and may be involved in the pathogenesis of colorectal cancer

Reviewer's code: 00004011

Position: Associate Editor

Academic degree: PhD

Professional title: Associate Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Greece

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2020-09-20

Reviewer chosen by: Pan Huang

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-10-18 07:38

Reviewer performed review: 2020-10-18 07:39

Review time: 1 Hour

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

the authors covered the revision issues