



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 60458

Title: Quinone oxidoreductase 1 is overexpressed in gastric cancer and associated with outcome of adjuvant chemotherapy and survival

Reviewer’s code: 05380317

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Assistant Professor

Reviewer’s Country/Territory: India

Author’s Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2020-10-30

Reviewer chosen by: Jia-Ru Fan

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-12-29 14:38

Reviewer performed review: 2021-01-01 07:30

Review time: 2 Days and 16 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1. The Title "NAD(P)H:quinone oxidoreductase 1 is overexpressed in gastric cancer and associated with adjuvant chemotherapy and survival" The authors may change the title as the part "associated with adjuvant chemotherapy and survival" is not giving much meaning.

2. The authors aim to investigate the role of NQO1 in cancer DEVELOPMENT and PROGRESSION, and to explore the potential of NQO1 to serve as a prognostic biomarker and therapeutic target. But the results, discussion and conclusion are entirely concentrated on the Prognostic aspect only. The authors should modify this aspect as the AIM of the study is not completely reflected in the results, conclusion. Otherwise this is a very good paper and CAN BE CONSIDERED FOR PUBLICATION. Regards



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 60458

Title: Quinone oxidoreductase 1 is overexpressed in gastric cancer and associated with outcome of adjuvant chemotherapy and survival

Reviewer's code: 03529715

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Associate Chief Physician, Attending Doctor, Staff Physician

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Japan

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2020-10-30

Reviewer chosen by: Jia-Ru Fan

Reviewer accepted review: 2021-01-01 03:48

Reviewer performed review: 2021-01-01 08:06

Review time: 4 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This study entitled 'NAD(P)H:quinone oxidoreductase 1 is overexpressed in gastric cancer and associated with adjuvant chemotherapy and survival' is a retrospective analysis that focused on investigating the associations between NQO1 protein expression status and responses to 5-FU-based adjuvant chemotherapy in patients with GC and thereby determine the potential of NQO1 to serve as a prognostic biomarker and therapeutic target. Although this study contains merit for advancing the therapy of gastric cancer, there are several problems that should be revised before publishing. Major 1. Authors should describe the procedure characteristic regarding to lymph node dissection in operation. Did every patient undergo D2 dissection in the gastrectomy? 2. Were there any patients who underwent chemoradiation therapy in the participants? 3. Authors should clarify the proportion of the patients who had HER2 expression. It is possible to confirm HER2 expression by using paraffin - embedded tissue. 4. This study only analyzed the patients with adjuvant using 5-FU plus cisplatin. Although fluorinated pyrimidine has been the key drug for GC adjuvant, other effective add on therapy (fluorinated pyrimidine plus OX, DTX plus S1, SOX) are accepted in daily practice. Therefore, it seems to be difficult to conclude that GC patients with NQO1 overexpression may be suitable for adjuvant chemotherapy by just only this study's result.