

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 60852

Title: Circulating tumor cells with epithelial-mesenchymal transition markers as the potential biomarker for the diagnosis of lung cancer

Reviewer's code: 05220432

Position: Editor-in-Chief

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Assistant Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: United States

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2020-11-20

Reviewer chosen by: Jin-Lei Wang

Reviewer accepted review: 2021-01-22 00:13

Reviewer performed review: 2021-01-23 02:50

Review time: 1 Day and 2 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The article "Circulating tumor cells with epithelial-mesenchymal transition markers as potential biomarkers for the diagnosis of lung cancer" is an interesting article. The statistics in the figure should be drawn separately for both positive vs control, and negative vs control. The discussion and the flow of story should be more concise and clear.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 60852

Title: Circulating tumor cells with epithelial-mesenchymal transition markers as the potential biomarker for the diagnosis of lung cancer

Reviewer's code: 02492656

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: BSc, MSc, PhD

Professional title: Emeritus Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: United States

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2020-11-20

Reviewer chosen by: Jin-Lei Wang

Reviewer accepted review: 2021-01-22 16:56

Reviewer performed review: 2021-01-27 19:49

Review time: 5 Days and 2 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an interesting, well written paper that suggests a role for detecting circulating tumor cells (CTCs) in diagnosing lung adenocarcinomas. While, as the authors indicated, further studies will be necessary to confirm how significant this finding will be as a front-line diagnostic tool, the results are encouraging. A few questions remain.

1) It was not clear how any of the tissue and blood sampling was "blinded" as to its derivation, and how such labeling could play any role in biasing the results. 2) The data show that "benign" tumors were a source of CTCs and the authors indicated that such cells "can be shed" and thus collected and analyzed. Is anything known about the nature of these "benign" tumors such that perhaps they were not as "benign" as originally described, or that the tumors were perhaps in a pre-malignant stage? 3) Ground glass opacities (GGO) are a common finding in lungs with scarring and ongoing fibrogenesis. Since the lung cancers in concert with GGO in this study were likely to yield CTCs, a question could be asked about the degree of ongoing fibrogenesis and how its severity might have correlated with the finding of CTCs. Since many tumors are found in a background of tumor- induced fibrosis, a question could be asked to whether the fibrosis was due to the tumor or perhaps by the original carcinogens and how this point might correlate with the CTC findings.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 60852

Title: Circulating tumor cells with epithelial-mesenchymal transition markers as the potential biomarker for the diagnosis of lung cancer

Reviewer's code: 05087664

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: PhD

Professional title: Senior Scientist

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Italy

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2020-11-20

Reviewer chosen by: Jin-Lei Wang

Reviewer accepted review: 2021-01-26 09:16

Reviewer performed review: 2021-02-04 10:46

Review time: 9 Days and 1 Hour

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Jang and colleagues applied the CanPatrol technique coupled to RNA-ISH to classify CTCs using EMT markers in patients with lung cancer. Compared with healthy controls and benign tumors, CTCs with mesenchymal features were more commonly found in patients in the advanced stages of the disease, showing acceptable specificity and sensitivity of the method. The work is interesting and adequately presented, adding new clues to the possibility for implementing the CanPatrol protocol in early diagnosis of lung cancer. As the authors mentioned, the study will necessitate of further validation in bigger and prospective cohorts.

RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 60852

Title: Circulating tumor cells with epithelial-mesenchymal transition markers as the potential biomarker for the diagnosis of lung cancer

Reviewer's code: 02492656

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: BSc, MSc, PhD

Professional title: Emeritus Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: United States

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2020-11-20

Reviewer chosen by: Jia-Ru Fan

Reviewer accepted review: 2021-02-20 01:44

Reviewer performed review: 2021-02-20 02:02

Review time: 1 Hour

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors have done a good job following the substantive suggestions of all three reviewers. The paper has clearly been improved.

RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 60852

Title: Circulating tumor cells with epithelial-mesenchymal transition markers as the potential biomarker for the diagnosis of lung cancer

Reviewer's code: 05087664

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: PhD

Professional title: Senior Scientist

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Italy

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2020-11-20

Reviewer chosen by: Jia-Ru Fan

Reviewer accepted review: 2021-02-22 08:46

Reviewer performed review: 2021-02-22 08:52

Review time: 1 Hour

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https:// www.wjgnet.com

The manuscript is worth of publication in this reviewer's opinion