

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**Manuscript NO:** 62325

**Title:** Factors influencing the short-term and long-term survival of hepatocellular carcinoma patients with portal vein tumor thrombosis underwent chemoembolization

**Reviewer's code:** 05038583

**Position:** Peer Reviewer

**Academic degree:** MD

**Professional title:** Doctor

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** United States

**Author's Country/Territory:** China

**Manuscript submission date:** 2021-01-09

**Reviewer chosen by:** Jin-Lei Wang

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2021-01-10 13:56

**Reviewer performed review:** 2021-01-10 14:55

**Review time:** 1 Hour

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Re-review</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

## **SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

**General comments** This study tried to elucidate the predictors of short-term and long-term survival of hepatocellular carcinoma with portal vein thrombosis after chemoembolization. There have been some studies to look at this topics in the past. For example, Asian Pac J Cancer Prev. 2017 Jan 1;18(1):183-188. However, what was interesting in this study was incorporation of cholinesterase to the logistic regression model. Therefore, this study can add important information to the current literature. Before this study can be accepted, authors should address the points listed below.

**Specific comments** As expected from China based study, majority of patients had hepatitis B. In our experiences, there HCC behavior is slightly different from other causes. Generalizability of this study to the North America may be limited. I do not believe author can modify this point. Due to the sample size, AUC is not high. However, this study may aim for future study with larger population size. Pre-albumin is not a routine test that our liver transplant center order for HCC unless sarcopenia or malnutrition is suspected. This makes it a little harder to apply in the North American settings. For Table 2 and 4, it would be better to say survivor rather than Live and non-survivor than died. ChE for serum cholinesterase on abstract which was not used in the main text. It is better to be consistent. I have not seen serum cholinesterase was ordered on any patient on our transplant center. I am not sure the cost related to the testing in the North America. This may be a limiting factor to apply these finding to our clinical settings. MELD scores for this sample population appears lower than our center for HCC. This is likely related to underlying HBV as a cause of HCC. In the methods section, it would be helpful to discuss what factors were selected in multivariate analysis.

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**Manuscript NO:** 62325

**Title:** Factors influencing the short-term and long-term survival of hepatocellular carcinoma patients with portal vein tumor thrombosis underwent chemoembolization

**Reviewer's code:** 01560036

**Position:** Peer Reviewer

**Academic degree:** DSc, MD

**Professional title:** Professor

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** Russia

**Author's Country/Territory:** China

**Manuscript submission date:** 2021-01-09

**Reviewer chosen by:** Jin-Lei Wang

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2021-01-11 06:41

**Reviewer performed review:** 2021-01-11 06:57

**Review time:** 1 Hour

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Re-review</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No
<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

#### **SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

Interesting paper within the scope of the Journal. Some practical advises according to your findings will be useful for readers

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**Manuscript NO:** 62325

**Title:** Factors influencing the short-term and long-term survival of hepatocellular carcinoma patients with portal vein tumor thrombosis underwent chemoembolization

**Reviewer's code:** 05408183

**Position:** Peer Reviewer

**Academic degree:** MD

**Professional title:** Doctor

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** China

**Author's Country/Territory:** China

**Manuscript submission date:** 2021-01-09

**Reviewer chosen by:** AI Technique

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2021-01-11 13:02

**Reviewer performed review:** 2021-01-23 08:01

**Review time:** 11 Days and 18 Hours

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Re-review</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No
<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

#### **SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

This study aims to identify the factors affecting the short-term and long-term survival of HCC patients with PVTT undergoing TACE through the analysis of preoperative indicators, so as to provide reference for clinicians in selecting suitable patients. There are three questions for this study. First, why have no independent predictors for long-term survival been evaluated? Second, why is there no univariate analysis of survivors versus non-survivors at 12 months after TACE? Third, the number of cases is OK, why is there no validation cohort to verify? Finally, the author may be able to establish a nomogram to predict the postoperative survival of HCC patients with PVTT.

## RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**Manuscript NO:** 62325

**Title:** Factors influencing the short-term and long-term survival of hepatocellular carcinoma patients with portal vein tumor thrombosis underwent chemoembolization

**Reviewer's code:** 05038583

**Position:** Peer Reviewer

**Academic degree:** MD

**Professional title:** Doctor

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** United States

**Author's Country/Territory:** China

**Manuscript submission date:** 2021-01-09

**Reviewer chosen by:** Le Zhang

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2021-02-23 01:29

**Reviewer performed review:** 2021-02-23 01:42

**Review time:** 1 Hour

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

## SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Authors have addressed my comments on response to the reviewers and made appropriate edit to the manuscript. Limitation of study is now appropriately addressed. It is a minor point, but authors should be consistent with font and font size throughout the manuscript.