

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Clinical Cases

**Manuscript NO:** 62551

**Title:** Beta-carotene and its protective effect of gastric cancer

**Reviewer's code:** 05372534

**Position:** Peer Reviewer

**Academic degree:** MD

**Professional title:** Doctor

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** Iran

**Author's Country/Territory:** China

**Manuscript submission date:** 2021-01-12

**Reviewer chosen by:** Jia-Ping Yan

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2021-04-07 09:33

**Reviewer performed review:** 2021-04-08 08:19

**Review time:** 22 Hours

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Re-review</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No
<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

#### **SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

The description of the introduction was appropriate, but if the sources are more up-to-date, please use them. Tables and figures usually come at the end of the manuscript, but in this study this was not the case.

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Clinical Cases

**Manuscript NO:** 62551

**Title:** Beta-carotene and its protective effect of gastric cancer

**Reviewer's code:** 05113803

**Position:** Peer Reviewer

**Academic degree:** MD

**Professional title:** Associate Professor

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** South Korea

**Author's Country/Territory:** China

**Manuscript submission date:** 2021-01-12

**Reviewer chosen by:** Jia-Ping Yan

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2021-04-07 11:55

**Reviewer performed review:** 2021-04-10 05:29

**Review time:** 2 Days and 17 Hours

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Re-review</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No
<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

## **SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

This manuscript article was well-written about beta-carotene and its beneficial effect for gastric cancer. The sections of text body were structured and contents were described in detail. However, major concerns about this manuscript are as below. First, the section of '1.3 Functions of beta-carotene' was divided into the antioxidant effect, facilitating gap-junction intercellular communication, and immune-related function. To help the readers in understanding these contents, some illustrations are needed. Second, Figures 2-4 were not cited in the manuscript body. Third, *H. pylori* was not described despite an important risk factor of gastric carcinogenesis in the first paragraph of '2. Gastric cancer'. Fourth, there were wrong descriptions in the second paragraph of '2. Gastric cancer'. The 'late gastric cancer' and 'site of tumor invasion' should be corrected to 'advanced gastric cancer' and 'depth of tumor invasion', respectively. The 'depressed adenoma' is not appropriate to be a type of early gastric cancer. Paris classification for gastric cancer is recommended. For example, type I, IIa, IIb, IIc, and III are useful. The 'stomach type' seems to be wrongly written. Please check the Lauren's classification including intestinal and diffuse type gastric cancer on the pathology. Fifth, recent advance of gastrointestinal endoscopic techniques and equipment allows the endoscopic treatment in the selected patients with early gastric cancer. Endoscopic treatment should be added to surgery in the third paragraph of '2. Gastric cancer'. The authors mentioned the diet and lifestyle control for gastric cancer. However, there was no reference about it. Sixth, 'special gastritis' was not understood in the fourth paragraph of '2. Gastric cancer'. Please check whether 'special gastritis' is one of official classification in the reference. Seventh, the authors mentioned 'animal experiments' as the subsection of '3. The mechanism by which of beta-carotene modulates gastric cancer'. However, there was no description about it. Eighth, the abbreviation such as AGS should be explained as full form in the section of '3.1.1 Beta-carotene and the cell cycle'. Ninth, 'caneration' was

misspelled in the footnote of Figure 4. Lastly, I hope that author can summarize the description of '3.2 Human epidemiological studies' using table. A summary using table may be helpful because many studies were described in the section.