



Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO.: 62625

Manuscript Type: Review

Title: Role of Modern Radiotherapy in Managing Patients with Hepatocellular Carcinoma

Dear editor:

We have read thoroughly all the reviewer and editor's comments with the constructive suggestion which I do respect for the perfection of the manuscript. We have taken all comments into consideration and we answered the questions and revised the text accordingly.

Enclosed please find our revised manuscript entitled " **Role of Modern Radiotherapy in Managing Patients with Hepatocellular Carcinoma** " that we are re-submitting to the *World Journal of Gastroenterology* as a review article **(Manuscript NO.: 62625)**. All authors have read and approved the submitted revised manuscript. All comments are replied point-by-point in the following pages. I am herewith attaching the revised manuscript and the point to point replies to the reviewers.

I always do appreciate very much your support.

With my best regards,

Sincerely,

Shih-Kai Hung, M.D., Ph.D.

e-mail: oncology158@yahoo.com.tw

Point-by point replies to editorial and reviewers' comments:

Reviewer's Comments:

Scientific Quality: Grade B (Very good)

Language Quality: Grade B (Minor language polishing)

Conclusion: Accept (High priority)

Specific Comments to Authors: This is an elaborate and topical review of the current guidelines on the use of radiotherapy in HCC. The manuscript is very well written and provides an updated account of the treatment of HCC. I believe this work will add value to the available literature and serve as a good source of information on the topic. In my opinion, the manuscript can be made more readable and attractive by the addition some figures and diagrams about the mechanisms and techniques which have been reviewed in the manuscript. I suggest adding the same on all or some the following aspects: Proton Therapy Photon Therapy Stereotactic ablative radiotherapy(SABR)/SBRT Comparison between Stereotactic ablative radiotherapy(SABR)/SBRT and ablative therapy Comparison of SABR and trans-arterial chemoembolization (TACE) Trans-arterial radioembolization (TARE) Mechanism of action of Sorafenib STAR effect

Author reply:

- (1) According to your kindly recommendation, some new figures as well as figure legend have been added to the review and cited in the text. The new figure titles are: "**Figure 2. Overview of therapeutic options and the consideration behind the combination of different combined modalities for liver cancer**", "**Figure 4. Proton therapy vs SBRT vs conventional RT for liver tumors**" and "**Figure 5. Potential mechanism of SBRT combined with systemic therapy to induce the STAR effect (also known as ISABR) for liver tumors**", respectively.
- (2) The figure as well as figure legend has been inserted at the end (pages 15 and 16) of the manuscript after the References section.

Editorial office's comments:

Authors must revise the manuscript according to the Editorial Office's comments and suggestions, which are listed below:

(1) Science editor: 1 Scientific quality: The manuscript describes a review of the role of modern radiotherapy in managing patients with hepatocellular carcinoma. The

topic is within the scope of the WJG. (1) Classification: Grade B; (2) Summary of the Peer-Review Report: The authors found an elaborate and topical review of the current guidelines on the use of radiotherapy in HCC. It is very well written and provides an updated account of the treatment of HCC. However, some figures and diagrams about the mechanisms and techniques should be added; and (3) Format: There are 3 figures. (4) References: A total of 150 references are cited, including 55 references published in the last 3 years; (5) Self-cited references: There are 3 self-cited references. The self-referencing rates should be less than 10%. Please keep the reasonable self-citations that are closely related to the topic of the manuscript, and remove other improper self-citations. If the authors fail to address the critical issue of self-citation, the editing process of this manuscript will be terminated; and (6) References recommend: The authors have the right to refuse to cite improper references recommended by peer reviewer(s), especially the references published by the peer reviewer(s) themselves. If the authors found the peer reviewer(s) request the authors to cite improper references published by themselves, please send the peer reviewer's ID number to the editorialoffice@wjgnet.com. The Editorial Office will close and remove the peer reviewer from the F6Publishing system immediately.

2 Language evaluation: Classification: Grade B. 3 Academic norms and rules: No academic misconduct was found in the Bing search. 4 Supplementary comments: This is an invited manuscript. No financial support was obtained for the study. The topic has not previously been published in the WJG. 5 Issues raised: (1) The authors did not provide original pictures. Please provide the original figure documents. Please prepare and arrange the figures using PowerPoint to ensure that all graphs or arrows or text portions can be reprocessed by the editor; and (2) Please obtain permission for the use of picture(s). If an author of a submission is re-using a figure or figures published elsewhere, or that is copyrighted, the author must provide documentation that the previous publisher or copyright holder has given permission for the figure to be re-published; and correctly indicating the reference source and copyrights. For example, "Figure 1 Histopathological examination by hematoxylin-eosin staining (200 ×). A: Control group;

B: Model group; C: Pioglitazone hydrochloride group; D: Chinese herbal medicine group.
Citation: Yang JM, Sun Y, Wang M, Zhang XL, Zhang SJ, Gao YS, Chen L, Wu MY, Zhou L, Zhou YM, Wang Y, Zheng FJ, Li YH. Regulatory effect of a Chinese herbal medicine formula on non-alcoholic fatty liver disease. *World J Gastroenterol* 2019; 25(34): 5105-5119. Copyright ©The Author(s) 2019. Published by Baishideng Publishing Group Inc[6]". And please cite the reference source in the references list. If the author fails to properly cite the published or copyrighted picture(s) or table(s) as described above, he/she will be subject to withdrawal of the article from BPG publications and may even be held liable. 6 Recommendation: Conditional acceptance.

(2) Editorial office director:

(3) Company editor-in-chief: I have reviewed the Peer-Review Report, full text of the manuscript, and the relevant ethics documents, all of which have met the basic publishing requirements of the *World Journal of Gastroenterology*, and the manuscript is conditionally accepted. I have sent the manuscript to the author(s) for its revision according to the Peer-Review Report, Editorial Office's comments and the Criteria for Manuscript Revision by Authors.

Author reply:

According to your kindly recommendation, some new figures as well as figure legend have been added to the review and cited in the text. The new figure titles are: "**Figure 2. Overview of therapeutic options and the consideration behind the combination of different combined modalities for liver cancer**", "**Figure 4. Proton therapy vs SBRT vs conventional RT for liver tumors**" and "**Figure 5. Potential mechanism of SBRT combined with systemic therapy to induce the STAR effect (also known as ISABR) for liver tumors**", respectively.