

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Transplantation

Manuscript NO: 63072

Title: Hypertension and obesity in living kidney donors

Reviewer's code: 03011351

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: FRCS (Gen Surg), MD, PhD

Professional title: Doctor, Professor, Surgeon

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Belgium

Author's Country/Territory: United States

Manuscript submission date: 2021-01-23

Reviewer chosen by: Jin-Lei Wang

Reviewer accepted review: 2021-01-25 06:54

Reviewer performed review: 2021-01-26 18:20

Review time: 1 Day and 11 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Good overview of obesity and hypertension influencing living donor kidney transplantation. For readability i suggest to create 2 tables to summarise the review of the literature of the 2 topics (obesity and hypertension). You propose a scoring system or criteria to evaluate the living donor long term outcome. In my opinion you should mention the Canadian study of Shantier M more in detail in your manuscript to provide the reader an exemple. Because as you mention, until today no other scoring systems exist. By doing that you are offering a tool to the readers but also important is to mention the limitation of this tool (small study, suboptimal after 1 year, ...).

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Transplantation

Manuscript NO: 63072

Title: Hypertension and obesity in living kidney donors

Reviewer's code: 02726701

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Associate Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Chile

Author's Country/Territory: United States

Manuscript submission date: 2021-01-23

Reviewer chosen by: Jin-Lei Wang

Reviewer accepted review: 2021-01-26 19:37

Reviewer performed review: 2021-01-30 20:41

Review time: 4 Days and 1 Hour

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Comments on Hypertension and Obesity in Living Kidney Donors As authors rightly point out, there is a relative scarcity of kidney donors to match the yearly increasing waiting list for a graft. Non-living donors are not enough to supply the demand even in Spain, with more than 40 donors per million population, leaving as the most suitable solution to look for more living donors. Long term follow-up of living kidney donors has shown that after the early postoperative period, the risks to the donors are manageable if the acceptance criteria for donation strictly preclude a person to donate if he/she has some morbidity potentially causing kidney disease. Hypertension and diabetes and their related partner, obesity, are main etiologies of chronic kidney disease and are very prevalent in western societies. The manuscript addresses this topic: Is it safe for an obese or a hypertensive subject to donate one kidney and “long term survive to tell it”? The paper is concise and well written but it does not give enough assurance to the reader that authors are pro or con with the donation. I think it is necessary to state that the nephrectomy could be riskier for an obese donor in comparison with another person with a proper body mass index, that a nephrectomy could induce maladaptive hyperfiltration in the remnant kidney in a subject with a clear risk factor for chronic kidney disease as hypertension is and many of the today-obese subjects will be tomorrow-diabetics, both potentially capable of threatening long-term kidney disease-free survival. In summary, I think that the manuscript needs to be very stronger precluding obese or hypertensive subjects to be considered as potential living kidney donors as hepatologists and liver surgeons rejecting potential living liver donors suffering of steatohepatitis (Transplantation: February 15th, 2007 - Volume 83 - Issue 3 - p 257-262. doi: 10.1097/01.tp.0000250671.06456.3f).

RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

Name of journal: World Journal of Transplantation

Manuscript NO: 63072

Title: Hypertension and obesity in living kidney donors

Reviewer's code: 03011351

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: FRCS (Gen Surg), MD, PhD

Professional title: Doctor, Professor, Surgeon

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Belgium

Author's Country/Territory: United States

Manuscript submission date: 2021-01-23

Reviewer chosen by: Chen-Chen Gao

Reviewer accepted review: 2021-03-01 06:47

Reviewer performed review: 2021-03-11 01:02

Review time: 9 Days and 18 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In my opinion, the authors really improved the quality of this mini review based on the

remarks of the reviewers and I think it can be published in this format. Some minor orthographic corrections should be made.

RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

Name of journal: World Journal of Transplantation

Manuscript NO: 63072

Title: Hypertension and obesity in living kidney donors

Reviewer's code: 02726701

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Associate Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Chile

Author's Country/Territory: United States

Manuscript submission date: 2021-01-23

Reviewer chosen by: Chen-Chen Gao

Reviewer accepted review: 2021-03-02 21:40

Reviewer performed review: 2021-04-01 04:46

Review time: 29 Days and 7 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors did minor modifications in comparison with its previous version., but they



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

did not afford my comments at all: "The paper is concise and well written but it does not it gives not enough assurance to the reader that authors are pro or con with the donation. I think it is necessary to state that the nephrectomy could be riskier for an obese donor in comparison with another person with a proper body mass index, that a nephrectomy could induce maladaptive hyperfiltration in the remnant kidney in a subject with a clear risk factor for chronic kidney disease as hypertension is and many of the today-obese subjects will be tomorrow-diabetics, both potentially capable of threatening long-term kidney disease-free survival. In summary, I think that the manuscript needs to be very stronger precluding obese or hypertensive subjects to be considered as potential living kidney donors as hepatologists and liver surgeons rejecting potential living liver donors suffering of steatohepaitis (Transplantation: February 15th, 2007 - Volume 83 - Issue 3 - p 257-262. doi: 10.1097/01.tp.0000250671.06456.3f)." I think these couple of comments must be included in the discussion of the important topics scoped by the authors. After these modifications, surely the manuscript will be able to be published.