

Dr Lian-Sheng Ma

December 30, 2013

World Journal of Gastroenterology
Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited
Room 1701, 17/F, Henan Building,
No. 90, Jaffe Road, Wanchai,
Hong Kong, China

Dear Dr Ma,

Please find enclosed the edited manuscript in Word format (file name: 6348-review.doc).

Title: Liver Transplantation for Malignancy: Current treatment strategies and future perspectives

Author: Christina Hackl, Hans J Schlitt, Gabriele I Kirchner, Birgit Knoppke, and Martin Loss

Name of Journal: *World Journal of Gastroenterology*

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6348, invited review (ID 02442212)

We are very happy about the positive reviewer comments and have improved the manuscript according to the suggestions of reviewers:

Editorial comments

The title has been shortened to 10 words.

A street address has been added to the corresponding authors contact address

The reference style has been checked and modified across the document. PMID and doi numbers have been added.

Table 1 has been moved to the end of the manuscript

Reviewer 00053490

The authors were invited to write a review article to describe indications for liver transplantation in the setting of malignancy. Overall, the authors do a good job with the review. I have some comments:

-There are some grammatical errors that will need to be corrected. It is throughout the manuscript, making it somewhat difficult to follow at times. For example, eMELD should mean "exception" MELD, not "exceptional" MELD.

We thank the reviewer for bringing our attention to these errors which we corrected.

-UNOS stands for United Network for Organ Sharing. There is no need to say "UNOS network"; this is redundant. Those are just two examples.

We corrected this phrasing. Furthermore, the language throughout the manuscript was revised and improved.

-On page 8, the authors mention that there were "many retrospective analyses" confirming the validity of the Milan criteria. However, there are no references for the "many" analyses. Please, provide.

This information was added to the manuscript.

-There is only brief mention of LDLT in the body of the manuscript (outside Milan criteria, a sentence of fibrolamellar variant of HCC and a paragraph in the CCA section). However, almost half of the conclusion concentrated on the benefits of LDLT. Was that the intention of the authors?

Given the shortage of cadaveric donor organs in LT for malignant disease, we consider LDLT a very important – and for many patients diagnosed with malignant liver disease the only remaining – alternative and therefore emphasized this in the discussion. We thank the reviewer for suggesting more emphasis on this subject also within the manuscript and have added a separate paragraph on LDLT into the revised manuscript.

-There is also only a small paragraph regarding immunosuppression, although this was mentioned prominently in the abstract and conclusion.

This aspect was also mentioned by reviewer 02444850 and we modified the manuscript accordingly. We put more emphasis on immunosuppression and added a dedicated paragraph.

-Although the discretion lies with the editors, I would refrain from using superlatives to describe individuals and manuscripts. They do not add much to the manuscript.

We revised the manuscript accordingly and omitted the use of superlatives.

Reviewer 02444850

This review gives a well-founded overview of the topic of liver transplantation for Malignancy. It is highly relevant for the scientific community and covers all aspects of the topic. The language is well written. I only have a few minor points:

-1- The aspect of immunosuppression in the case of liver transplantation for malignancy should be discussed in more details in a separate paragraph at the end of the paper, rather than on page 10 lines 6 following

This aspect was also mentioned by reviewer 00053490 and we modified the manuscript accordingly. We put more emphasis on immunosuppression and added a dedicated paragraph.

-2- Page 3 line 5: "established" should be replaced by "suggested"

We modified the manuscript accordingly.

-3- Page 4 lines 6: it should be specified if the survival data refer to only the UNOS or ET regions or in general.

This information was added to the manuscript.

-4- Table 1: correct typing error: "Epithelioid"

We thank the reviewer for bringing our attention to this typographical error which we corrected.

Reviewer 00054465

This is an in depth review of the current state of liver transplantation for malignant disease. It is very comprehensive with not only indications, contraindications and outcome data but the authors have discussed the ethics involved with a very balanced view. This manuscript will be an excellent reference for all involved in liver transplantation and managing liver malignancies.

We thank the reviewer very much for his/her evaluation.

Reviewer 01560464

1) The review described more in detail the current treatment strategies in different regions and the role of living-donor liver transplantation for liver various malignant diseases, and indicated that the advantages and disadvantages of LT compared with liver resection in treating for liver malignant diseases. The review is important clinical significance to know about advantages and disadvantages of the liver transplantation (LT) for liver malignant diseases . 2) The review need simplify the history of LT , the background of every liver malignant disease, and focus on the various viewpoints of LT for liver malignant diseases near five years

We thank the reviewer very much for his/her evaluation and suggestions. We shortened the history of LT slightly. As the other three reviewers agreed on the present style and length of the background of every liver malignant disease, we did not shorten these paragraphs but would prefer to give this in-depth overview. However, we leave this decision tot he editors and will simplify the mentioned paragraphs if recommended.

Thank you again for publishing our manuscript in the *World Journal of Gastroenterology*.

Best regards,

Christina Hackl and Martin Loss