

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Transplantation

Manuscript NO: 64973

Title: Post-Transplant Erythrocytosis After Kidney Transplantation: A Review

Reviewer's code: 00503322

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: BSc, FRCS, FRCS, MBBS, MD, MPhil

Professional title: Senior Lecturer, Surgeon, Teacher

Reviewer's Country/Territory: United Kingdom

Author's Country/Territory: United States

Manuscript submission date: 2021-02-27

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2021-04-09 07:22

Reviewer performed review: 2021-04-09 07:47

Review time: 1 Hour

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The paper entitled "Post-Transplant Erythrocytosis: A Review" is well-written short review, which needs following revision to make it up-to-date. 1. Title: Post-transplant does not indicate the type of organ transplanted. So I would suggest to change it to post-renal transplantation. 2. The method of literature review (data collection) needs to be clearly written. 3. The references are too old (from 90s mostly). There are many recent publications over last 10 years and the authors have published their own data on February this year, which need to be included. 4. Every section should have an up to date information with recent references.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Transplantation

Manuscript NO: 64973

Title: Post-Transplant Erythrocytosis After Kidney Transplantation: A Review

Reviewer's code: 00503228

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Doctor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Iran

Author's Country/Territory: United States

Manuscript submission date: 2021-02-27

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2021-04-08 11:32

Reviewer performed review: 2021-04-09 08:14

Review time: 20 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Overall it is an informative and nice review article, and importantly I found no other comprehensive review article on the subject in the literature. Yet there are some limitations in the protocol used for the review. Authors nicely give the topics important on the subject in their subsections, however, their attendance to the subjects is more general & not evidence-targeted. You give nice data in the tables, but not using them well in the text. If it was my article, I would have instead given for example data of studies in favor of enalapril, then those against it, or those in favor of other therapeutic protocols, referring their data to the tables; to investigate the subgroups of patients with special characteristics most benefit of any therapy strategy and those who might benefit the other one; discussing the dosing of the therapies and associating them with either the therapeutic or adverse effects, and analyses to define what treatments were most effective, with the least adverse effects. For example in table 3, two studies reported in favor of theophylline, one found no significant reduction, and two reported an increase in the Hct. A more precise in the patients' demographics (i.e. age, immunosuppression, deceased vs. living donor; dialysis before transplant, duration of taking the drug and so on) might reveal factors that might have contributed in the differential observation. Also an analysis to find any differentials in the demographic factors of patients who have developed PTE or not would be informative on the potential risk factors. For example, the percentage of the people with living vs. deceased donor TRx developed PTE; differentials in age, gender, surgical protocols, immunosuppression regimen/blood levels, comorbidities (i.e. cardiovascular; liver disease; DM; HTN etc), time on dialysis, graft functioning indices, seropositivity for infections and so on. I know you will say we have already mentioned them in the review, yes, but I mean to precisely and evidence-based step, to say in what studies there were evidence in favor of them and in which ones not or even against them; and try to make conclusions based on the overall



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

reviewed data & independent of single study conclusions, and wherever possible to conduct meta-analyses.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Transplantation

Manuscript NO: 64973

Title: Post-Transplant Erythrocytosis After Kidney Transplantation: A Review

Reviewer's code: 03815884

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Surgeon, Teaching Assistant

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Slovenia

Author's Country/Territory: United States

Manuscript submission date: 2021-02-27

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2021-04-08 09:38

Reviewer performed review: 2021-04-13 02:42

Review time: 4 Days and 17 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The paper is review. They have made a summary of available literature on the field of PTE in post kidney transplant patients, using the most commonly used guidelines.