

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Stem Cells

Manuscript NO: 65113

Title: Mesenchymal stem cells for enhancing biological healing after meniscal injuries

Reviewer's code: 05817451

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Doctor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Japan

Author's Country/Territory: South Korea

Manuscript submission date: 2021-02-28

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2021-03-02 14:19

Reviewer performed review: 2021-03-17 08:37

Review time: 14 Days and 18 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a review article examining the therapeutic effect of MSCs on meniscus injury, which is of high importance in musculoskeletal disorders. Authors refer to many past reports including the latest ones and two tables are useful for understanding this field. On the other hand, the text is somewhat descriptive, and I think it lacks several themes to be discussed for the readers of the World Journal of Stem Cells. I propose that it is necessary to improve the sentence structure and add content before publishing.

ROLE OF THE MENISCUS: WHY SHOULD WE PRESERVE THE MENISCUS? BASIC ANATOMY OF THE MENISCUS THE LIMITED HEALING POTENTIAL OF A TORN MENISCUS These parts are useful in the sense that they help non-specialized readers understand this manuscript concerning knee meniscus. However, considering the theme of this paper, I think that there should be enough discussion about how to evaluate the meniscus healing. An overview of typical animal disease models and their evaluation methods, as well as of subjective and objective evaluation methods used in clinical research, will improve the quality of the paper and help the reader's understanding.

A CELL BASED APPROACH FOR ENHANCED MENISCUS HEALING APPLICATION OF MSCS IN BIOLOGICAL MENISCUS HEALING The concept of MSC has changed considerably from its original proposal. In particular, there are increasing reports that the efficacy as a source of secretory factors is more important than that as a cell source. Since it is also an essential issue of this paper, authors would better to mention its definition and the mechanism of therapeutic effect.

Intra-articular injection of MSCs for meniscus healing Animal Studies/Human Studies Tissue engineering using MSCs for meniscus healing Animal Studies/Human Studies These parts were a bit descriptive and felt hard to read. Adding sub-headlines seems to make it easier to read. For example, how about to classify animal experiments by model and clinical researches by MSC origin. Please consider.