Baishideng Publishing Group

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite 160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Meta-Analysis

Manuscript NO: 66721

Title: Systematic review with meta-analysis of the epidemiological evidence in Europe, Israel, America and Australasia on smoking and COVID-19

Reviewer's code: 05915429
Position: Peer Reviewer
Academic degree: BSc, MSc
Professional title: Research Assistant Professor
Reviewer's Country/Territory: India
Author's Country/Territory: United Kingdom

Manuscript submission date: 2021-04-03
Reviewer chosen by: Ya-Juan Ma
Reviewer accepted review: 2021-06-09 15:52
Reviewer performed review: 2021-06-13 05:18
Review time: 3 Days and 13 Hours

Scientific quality	[ ] Grade A: Excellent [ ] Grade B: Very good [ ] Grade C: Good [Y] Grade D: Fair [ ] Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing [ ] Grade B: Minor language polishing [Y] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing [ ] Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	[ ] Accept (High priority) [ ] Accept (General priority) [ ] Minor revision [Y] Major revision [ ] Rejection
Re-review	[Y] Yes [ ] No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: [ ] Anonymous [Y] Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: [Y] Yes [ ] No

Baishideng Publishing Group

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite 160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors are requested to resubmit. Quite blunt hypotheses was presented hence requested to sharpen the acquisitions and claims in stronger manner within the manuscript. The original findings should have been presented more accurately thereby suggested to resubmit and present the data to support the hypothesis. Limitations are not mentioned by the authors and impact on clinical practice also has to be mentioned by the authors in discussion section. 1. Reduce the size of the background to one or two sentences. Modify the aim of the study as per the hypotheses considered before starting the search in pubmed. Mention the aim in one or two sentences. In introduction section explain the importance of the study in detail but not more than a page. Try to keep the size of this article below 8000 words. 2. Please provide a systematic review flow chart explaining the inclusion and exclusion criteria. 3. Reasons for exclusion and inclusion criteria with number of literatures should be mentioned both in flowchart and methodology sections. 4. The articles excluded need not to be provided in reference section, include only 74 articles and other references used in the manuscript. 5. In the discussion section justify your findings with reasons. Add atleast one limitation of this study in the discussion section. 6. Reduce the size of the manuscript to 60 pages maximum and resubmit. 7. E-cig smoker's data is not required in this study. 8. The methods section's size in the abstract has to be reduced. 9. Statistical analysis section has to be added in the main body as a heading and with a sentence in the abstract methods section explaining procedure followed to analysis. Mention the highest and lowest significant values considered in this study. Mention the tools used for statistical analysis. Verify if the Journal has specific list of tools used for data analysis. 10. Mention the key findings with statistical values in the result section of abstract. Only statistically significant findings has to be presented in abstract. 11. Please refer the Journal's

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite 160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

standard procedure of manuscript preparation. 12. Mention only the key words with which maximum search results were obtained in pubmed, no need to mention all the words. 13. For tables and graph plot provide only the study characteristics, results obtained among various groups and Forest plot results. Statistical significance should be highlighted in bold. 14. Please be specific if you have included studies from America, Europe, and Australia. Asian articles can be excluded completely. When you speak about America I hope Canadian studies are included, as I can see Brazilian studies are included but not Canadian studies. If the literature not found mention it accordingly in the search result section. 15. At the same time studies conducted in Israel are included which is incorrect procedure of systematic review as it do not matches with the statement provided in the title. Article from Israel can be excluded. If you include it please mention the reason as it is an Asian country. 16. Please send only one reference list in next manuscript, at present multiple reference list is provided which is confusing. 17. You have to show the statistical significance among groups or studies matching your hypothesis or else mention that your hypothesis and findings are not matching post analysis. For that mention the key findings in the abstract results section. 18. Please refer a previously published article in this journal (Systematic review and meta-analysis) before resubmitting. 19. Comorbidities are causing deaths in COVID-19 patients, smoking does not have any relevance with deaths, it is a well known fact and in 2002-03 a SARS-CoV study showed similar results in smokers. 20. Please explain if you mean that non smokers without comorbidities are at high risk than smokers without comorbidities. Mention this in abstract with statistical significance. The progression of SARS-CoV-2 pneumonia from hospitalization to ICU admission to death is due to comorbidities and not due to smoking. Hospitalization occurs due to pneumonia and pneumonia exacerbates due to presence of comorbidities. 21. In the tables mention the study as Niedzwiedz et al., 2020. Present the tables related to your hypothesis or aim of

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite 160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

your study, 17 tables cannot be included. 22. In the study characteristics Figure 1. section add a column for comorbidities. Present the statistical significance properly to further consider this article for publication. 23. The language should be short and precise.

Baishideng Publishing Group

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite 160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

Name of journal: World Journal of Meta-Analysis

Manuscript NO: 66721

Title: Systematic review with meta-analysis of the epidemiological evidence in Europe, Israel, America and Australasia on smoking and COVID-19

Reviewer's code: 05915429
Position: Peer Reviewer
Academic degree: BSc, MSc
Professional title: Research Assistant Professor
Reviewer's Country/Territory: India
Author's Country/Territory: United Kingdom

Manuscript submission date: 2021-04-03
Reviewer chosen by: Man Liu
Reviewer accepted review: 2021-07-27 13:42
Reviewer performed review: 2021-07-29 14:12
Review time: 2 Days

Scientific quality	[ ] Grade A: Excellent [ ] Grade B: Very good [ ] Grade C: Good [ ] Grade D: Fair [Y] Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing [ ] Grade B: Minor language polishing [ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing [Y] Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	[ ] Accept (High priority) [ ] Accept (General priority) [ ] Minor revision [ ] Major revision [Y] Rejection
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: [ ] Anonymous [Y] Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: [ ] Yes [Y] No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite 160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

Thanks for your responses. I could not find the systematic review flow chart where as in your response you have mentioned that you have introduced the flow chart. Without the flow chart this article cannot be considered for publication. Such a huge article doesn't makes any sense.