

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Surgery

Manuscript NO: 67554

Title: Preoperative serum carbohydrate antigen 19-9 levels predict early recurrence after the resection of early-stage pancreatic ductal adenocarcinoma

Reviewer's code: 04723746

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Deputy Director

Reviewer's Country/Territory: China

Author's Country/Territory: South Korea

Manuscript submission date: 2021-05-03

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2021-05-06 12:08

Reviewer performed review: 2021-05-09 03:08

Review time: 2 Days and 14 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Comments to the Author This article identified the factors associated with the early recurrence of early PDAC and evaluated 407 patients with stage i PDAC who underwent pre-operative resection. Early recurrence was defined as disease recurrence within 6 months after surgery. Analysis of receiver operating characteristics shows that preoperative ca19-9 > 70u/mL is an important risk factor for early recurrence of early PDAC, and roc curve analysis shows that ca19-9 > 70u/mL is a risk factor for early recurrence of early PDAC. Still, there are some questions concerning this research. 1. Did these patients only do CA19-9 as a tumor marker? Are other tumor markers such as CEA included in the analysis? 2. What is the change of CA19-9 after operation compared with before operation? 3. How to deal with the inconsistent judgment results caused by different pathologists? 4. Which patients received adjuvant chemotherapy after surgery and what are the standards?

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Surgery

Manuscript NO: 67554

Title: Preoperative serum carbohydrate antigen 19-9 levels predict early recurrence after the resection of early-stage pancreatic ductal adenocarcinoma

Reviewer's code: 03874081

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: India

Author's Country/Territory: South Korea

Manuscript submission date: 2021-05-03

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2021-05-03 16:18

Reviewer performed review: 2021-05-10 10:43

Review time: 6 Days and 18 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Kindly provide multivariate analysis using the described variable in early recurrence vs. no group. Table 2 talks about the entire cohort without any mention of early recurrence or no. Based on the findings and results, the conclusion can not be drawn. Most of the references are old and may not be relevant in the current context. Thank you

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Surgery

Manuscript NO: 67554

Title: Preoperative serum carbohydrate antigen 19-9 levels predict early recurrence after the resection of early-stage pancreatic ductal adenocarcinoma

Reviewer's code: 03674268

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Chief Doctor, Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: China

Author's Country/Territory: South Korea

Manuscript submission date: 2021-05-03

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2021-05-03 03:43

Reviewer performed review: 2021-05-11 14:35

Review time: 8 Days and 10 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript aimed to assess the predictive factors associated with 6-month recurrence after R0 resection for early stage PDAC. The author concluded that CA19-9 could be a valid biomarker for the prediction and adjuvant chemotherapy could prevent early recurrence. Overall, the results were not novel. An ocean of previous studies have demonstrated the value of CA19-9 and chemo. in PDAC. There were also some other shortcomings: 1. In methodology, the inclusion and exclusion criteria should be clearly presented. 2. A total of 407 patients were included. However, in Table 1, there were missing cases that should be mentioned. For example, 254 tumors located at the head or uncinate and 151 tumors located at the pancreatic neck, body, or tail. Please explain the location of another two cases. 3. The results part should be separated with subtitles. 4. The AUCs for predicting early recurrence were <0.7 , indicating low accuracy. For instance, AUC of CA19-9 was 0.605 and tumor size was 0.619. It would be much better to construct a predictive model with much higher AUC. 5. Language and format errors.