

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Gastrointestinal Surgery*

Manuscript NO: 83506

Title: Diverticulitis is a population health problem: Lessons and gaps in strategies to implement and improve contemporary care

Provenance and peer review: Invited manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 00068348

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Surgeon

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Greece

Author's Country/Territory: United States

Manuscript submission date: 2023-01-27

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2023-02-10 06:47

Reviewer performed review: 2023-02-23 21:16

Review time: 13 Days and 14 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Novelty of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No novelty
Creativity or innovation of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No creativity or innovation

Scientific significance of the conclusion in this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No scientific significance
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
	Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The article deals with a very interesting subject which is controversial regarding the surgical strategy of treatment. It is well structured and analyzes important issues on treatment. The authors should explain more about performing hartman's procedure or primary anastomosis.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Gastrointestinal Surgery*

Manuscript NO: 83506

Title: Diverticulitis is a population health problem: Lessons and gaps in strategies to implement and improve contemporary care

Provenance and peer review: Invited manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 02840006

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Academic Research

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Italy

Author's Country/Territory: United States

Manuscript submission date: 2023-01-27

Reviewer chosen by: Geng-Long Liu

Reviewer accepted review: 2023-02-17 10:26

Reviewer performed review: 2023-03-02 17:12

Review time: 13 Days and 6 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Novelty of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No novelty
Creativity or innovation of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No creativity or innovation

Scientific significance of the conclusion in this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No scientific significance
Language quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
	Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This opinion review “Diverticulitis is a population health problem: lessons and gaps in strategies to implement and improve contemporary care” aims to understand disparity between contemporary studies and real world practice and suggest strategies to improve future care. The Authors summarize what the guidelines indicate about hospitalization, use of antibiotics and surgery in uncomplicated acute diverticulitis and show the gap between real practice and guidelines, identifying possible solutions to overcome this gap. This study has several merits, such as trying to explain the reasons for the gap real practice-guidelines and identify research areas for improvement. Generalizability of this study is quite limited. Furthermore improving existing guidelines, to reach more strong evidence, should be always a research goal. In my opinion some concepts should be better explained: - Introduction, line 2. The proportion of patients developing acute diverticulitis has been revised, being less than 5% over an 11-year follow-up period (see Shahedi K et al, Clin Gastroenterol Hepatol. 2013 Dec;11(12):1609-13) - I’m not sure that Segmental colitis associated to diverticulosis (SCAD) could be considered a complication of diverticulitis. SCAD can be considered a separate entity, with a various clinical



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

presentation. To my knowledge no data regarding the incidence of post diverticulitis SCAD is available. - Regarding quality of life, it is important to underline that not only patients with previous diverticulitis presented reduction of quality of life. Some data showed that symptomatic uncomplicated diverticular disease and patients with previous diverticulitis have similar scores both concerning physical and mental components (see Carabotti M et al., United European Gastroenterol J. 2018 Jul;6(6):926-934). - Some comments between authors are present over the manuscript

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Gastrointestinal Surgery*

Manuscript NO: 83506

Title: Diverticulitis is a population health problem: Lessons and gaps in strategies to implement and improve contemporary care

Provenance and peer review: Invited manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 02552429

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: FACS, MD, PhD

Professional title: Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: France

Author's Country/Territory: United States

Manuscript submission date: 2023-01-27

Reviewer chosen by: Geng-Long Liu

Reviewer accepted review: 2023-02-13 09:16

Reviewer performed review: 2023-03-08 01:39

Review time: 22 Days and 16 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No

Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: [<input type="checkbox"/>] Anonymous [<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>] Onymous
	Conflicts-of-Interest: [<input type="checkbox"/>] Yes [<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>] No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The article aims to review the current management of diverticular disease, its acute and chronic complications, and to analyze the recommendations published by learned societies, as well as those from the literature. The article clearly highlights the unreliable and standardized nature of the recommendations, leaving all the evaluation criteria vague and at the unsubstantiated assessment of doctors and practitioners. This leads to extremes which are the rate of operation proportional to the surgical density... The article perfectly covers the inadequacy of CPGs, including the heterogeneity of evaluation of determining criteria such as QOL in the surgical indication. It is regrettable that the authors did not complete their analysis with a few methodological proposals to be implemented in order to progress in the analysis of the severity of acute and chronic complications. This would have laid the foundations for new updated consensus conferences to re-specify the medical and surgical therapeutic indications, why not going so far as to define reference decision-makers like other indications ranging from bariatric surgery to metastatic colorectal cancer. Indeed, an inappropriate or complicated gesture is particularly harmful for a usually benign pathology...