

# PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 83855

Title: Metastatic colon cancer treated using traditional Chinese medicine combined with

chemotherapy: A case report

Provenance and peer review: Unsolicited manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 06134888

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: PhD

Professional title: Associate Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Saudi Arabia

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2023-02-20

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2023-02-20 15:58

Reviewer performed review: 2023-02-20 16:52

Review time: 1 Hour

|                             | [ ] Grade A: Excellent [ ] Grade B: Very good [ ] Grade C:  |
|-----------------------------|---|
| Scientific quality          | Good  |
|                             | [Y] Grade D: Fair [] Grade E: Do not publish  |
| Novelty of this manuscript  | <ul> <li>[ ]Grade A: Excellent [ ]Grade B: Good [Y]Grade C: Fair</li> <li>[ ]Grade D: No novelty</li> </ul> |
| Creativity or innovation of | [ ] Grade A: Excellent [ ] Grade B: Good [Y] Grade C: Fair  |
| this manuscript             | [ ] Grade D: No creativity or innovation  |



| Scientific significance of the conclusion in this manuscript | [ ] Grade A: Excellent [ ] Grade B: Good [ Y] Grade C: Fair<br>[ ] Grade D: No scientific significance  |
|--|---|
| Language quality   | [ ] Grade A: Priority publishing [Y] Grade B: Minor language<br>polishing [ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing [ ]<br>Grade D: Rejection                   |
| Conclusion   | <ul> <li>[ ] Accept (High priority)</li> <li>[ ] Accept (General priority)</li> <li>[ Y] Minor revision</li> <li>[ ] Major revision</li> <li>[ ] Rejection</li> </ul> |
| Re-review  | [Y]Yes []No   |
| Peer-reviewer statements                                     | Peer-Review: [Y] Anonymous [] Onymous<br>Conflicts-of-Interest: [] Yes [Y] No   |

#### SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1- Although the authors did mention it, 7 months period of follow up is not enough for diagnosing full remission! The risk of colorectal cancer recurrence is highest within the first five years following your diagnosis. About 60% to 80% of recurrence happens within the first two years<sup>2</sup> after resection and over 90% within the first five years. 2- The authors still need to closely follow up the patient and publish updates regarding the progress and prognosis of this particular patient! 3- The active pricinciples of the chinese medicines used need to be thoroughly discussed.



# PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 83855

Title: Metastatic colon cancer treated using traditional Chinese medicine combined with

chemotherapy: A case report

Provenance and peer review: Unsolicited manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

**Peer-review model:** Single blind

Reviewer's code: 00503194

**Position:** Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Consultant Physician-Scientist

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Greece

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2023-02-20

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2023-02-20 20:52

Reviewer performed review: 2023-03-07 02:31

Review time: 14 Days and 5 Hours

|                             | [ ] Grade A: Excellent [ ] Grade B: Very good [Y] Grade C:                            |
|-----------------------------|---|
| Scientific quality          | Good  |
|                             | [ ] Grade D: Fair [ ] Grade E: Do not publish   |
| Novelty of this manuscript  | [ ] Grade A: Excellent [ ] Grade B: Good [ ] Grade C: Fair<br>[ ] Grade D: No novelty |
| Creativity or innovation of | [ ] Grade A: Excellent [ ] Grade B: Good [ ] Grade C: Fair                            |
| this manuscript             | [ ] Grade D: No creativity or innovation  |



| Scientific significance of the conclusion in this manuscript | [ ] Grade A: Excellent [ ] Grade B: Good [ ] Grade C: Fair<br>[ ] Grade D: No scientific significance   |
|--|---|
| Language quality   | [ ] Grade A: Priority publishing [ ] Grade B: Minor language<br>polishing [Y] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing [ ]<br>Grade D: Rejection |
| Conclusion   | <ul> <li>[ ] Accept (High priority) [ ] Accept (General priority)</li> <li>[ ] Minor revision [ Y] Major revision [ ] Rejection</li> </ul>          |
| Re-review  | [Y]Yes []No   |
| Peer-reviewer statements                                     | Peer-Review: [Y] Anonymous       [] Onymous         Conflicts-of-Interest: [] Yes       [Y] No  |

#### SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

It is an interesting case report, as it opens a perspective for a clinical trial that could test the efficacy of TCM in colon cancer or other cancer too. Nevertheless it can not be published in its present form It could be considered for publication after major revision that could address the following remarks: 1) You can not write ">12 year history" etc. The authors could write approximately 12 or 15 years (the closer) 2) Tumor biopsy "suggested" adenocarcinoma. Should be changed to revealed. 3) The tumor stage at diagnosis is not stated 4) The oncology plan after resection is not stated. The authors write " Chemotherapy - related liver damage developed slowy". After which scheme? 5) The conclusion is over statement. TCM was given as an adjuvant treatment that could have the role of placebo. The right conclusion is that maybe as an adjuvant treatment TCM could aid in the management of colon cancer. Further studies are needed in order to confirm the therapeutic potential of TCM in colon cancer 6) Many syntax, grammar and vocabulary errors, as "transverse colon completely smooth". 7) The surgery detailed prescription does not offer anything and should be ommited



# PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 83855

Title: Metastatic colon cancer treated using traditional Chinese medicine combined with

chemotherapy: A case report

Provenance and peer review: Unsolicited manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

**Peer-review model:** Single blind

**Reviewer's code:** 00607640

Position: Editor-in-Chief

Academic degree: PhD

Professional title: Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Taiwan

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2023-02-20

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2023-03-06 20:57

Reviewer performed review: 2023-03-16 11:17

Review time: 9 Days and 14 Hours

|                             | [ ] Grade A: Excellent [ ] Grade B: Very good [Y] Grade C:                            |
|-----------------------------|---|
| Scientific quality          | Good  |
|                             | [ ] Grade D: Fair [ ] Grade E: Do not publish   |
| Novelty of this manuscript  | [ ] Grade A: Excellent [Y] Grade B: Good [ ] Grade C: Fair<br>[ ] Grade D: No novelty |
| Creativity or innovation of | [ ] Grade A: Excellent [Y] Grade B: Good [ ] Grade C: Fair                            |
| this manuscript             | [ ] Grade D: No creativity or innovation  |



| Scientific significance of the conclusion in this manuscript | <ul> <li>[ ] Grade A: Excellent [Y] Grade B: Good [ ] Grade C: Fair</li> <li>[ ] Grade D: No scientific significance</li> </ul>                                       |
|--|---|
| Language quality   | [ ] Grade A: Priority publishing [Y] Grade B: Minor language<br>polishing [ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing [ ]<br>Grade D: Rejection                   |
| Conclusion   | <ul> <li>[ ] Accept (High priority)</li> <li>[ ] Accept (General priority)</li> <li>[ Y] Minor revision</li> <li>[ ] Major revision</li> <li>[ ] Rejection</li> </ul> |
| Re-review  | [ ]Yes [Y]No  |
| Peer-reviewer statements                                     | Peer-Review: [Y] Anonymous       [] Onymous         Conflicts-of-Interest: [] Yes       [Y] No  |

#### SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this case report, the authors reported the traditional Chinese medicine effectively treat a 71-year-old man with metastatic colon cancer. The paper is interesting and suitable for the Journal.



# **RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT**

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases Manuscript NO: 83855 Title: Metastatic colon cancer treated using traditional Chinese medicine combined with chemotherapy: A case report Provenance and peer review: Unsolicited manuscript; Externally peer reviewed Peer-review model: Single blind **Reviewer's code:** 06134888 **Position:** Editorial Board Academic degree: PhD **Professional title:** Associate Professor Reviewer's Country/Territory: Saudi Arabia Author's Country/Territory: China Manuscript submission date: 2023-02-20 Reviewer chosen by: Yu-Jie Ma Reviewer accepted review: 2023-04-16 12:02 Reviewer performed review: 2023-04-16 12:12 Review time: 1 Hour

| Scientific quality | [ ] Grade A: Excellent [ ] Grade B: Very good [Y] Grade C: Good<br>[ ] Grade D: Fair [ ] Grade E: Do not publish   |  |
|--------------------|--|--|
| Language quality   | <ul> <li>[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing [Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing</li> <li>[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing [ ] Grade D: Rejection</li> </ul> |  |
| Conclusion         | <ul> <li>[ ] Accept (High priority) [Y] Accept (General priority)</li> <li>[ ] Minor revision [ ] Major revision [ ] Rejection</li> </ul>                                  |  |
| Peer-reviewer      | Peer-Review: [Y] Anonymous [] Onymous  |  |





statements

\_

Conflicts-of-Interest: [ ] Yes [Y] No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS



#### **RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT**

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases Manuscript NO: 83855 Title: Metastatic colon cancer treated using traditional Chinese medicine combined with chemotherapy: A case report Provenance and peer review: Unsolicited manuscript; Externally peer reviewed Peer-review model: Single blind **Reviewer's code:** 00503194 **Position:** Peer Reviewer Academic degree: MD, PhD Professional title: Consultant Physician-Scientist Reviewer's Country/Territory: Greece Author's Country/Territory: China Manuscript submission date: 2023-02-20 Reviewer chosen by: Yu-Jie Ma Reviewer accepted review: 2023-04-16 19:29 Reviewer performed review: 2023-04-16 21:09

Review time: 1 Hour

| Scientific quality | [ ] Grade A: Excellent [ ] Grade B: Very good [Y] Grade C: Good<br>[ ] Grade D: Fair [ ] Grade E: Do not publish                                  |
|--------------------|---|
| Language quality   | [ ] Grade A: Priority publishing [ ] Grade B: Minor language polishing<br>[ Y] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing [ ] Grade D: Rejection |
| Conclusion         | [ ] Accept (High priority)       [ ] Accept (General priority)         [ Y] Minor revision       [ ] Major revision       [ ] Rejection           |
| Peer-reviewer      | Peer-Review: [Y] Anonymous [] Onymous   |



statements

Conflicts-of-Interest: [ ] Yes [Y] No

#### SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Corrections have been made in the right path, but the article is not yet ready for publication. The auhthors should revise their presentation. It is not the first time that TCM is used for colorectal cancer. But although the litterature is in favor of the effective role of TCM in cancer (and colorectal also) there are not yet randomized control trials to prove its efficacy and establish it as standard treatment.