

# PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Transplantation

Manuscript NO: 88938

Title: Improving the radiological diagnosis of hepatic artery thrombosis after liver

transplantation: Current approaches and future challenges.

Provenance and peer review: Invited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 04382733 Position: Peer Reviewer Academic degree: DO, PhD

Professional title: Consultant Physician-Scientist, Doctor, Medical Assistant

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Brazil

Author's Country/Territory: Chile

Manuscript submission date: 2023-10-16

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2023-10-24 22:13

Reviewer performed review: 2023-10-25 01:21

**Review time:** 3 Hours

	[ ] Grade A: Excellent [ ] Grade B: Very good [ ] Grade C:
Scientific quality	Good
	[ Y] Grade D: Fair [ ] Grade E: Do not publish
Novelty of this manuscript	[ ] Grade A: Excellent [ Y] Grade B: Good [ ] Grade C: Fair [ ] Grade D: No novelty
Creativity or innovation of	[ ] Grade A: Excellent [ ] Grade B: Good [ Y] Grade C: Fair
this manuscript	[ ] Grade D: No creativity or innovation



# Baishideng

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite 160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA **Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568 E-mail: office@baishideng.com

https://www.wjgnet.com

Scientific significance of the	[ ] Grade A: Excellent [ ] Grade B: Good [ Y] Grade C: Fair	
conclusion in this manuscript	[ ] Grade D: No scientific significance	
Language quality	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing [Y] Grade B: Minor language	
	polishing [ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing [ ]	
	Grade D: Rejection	
Conclusion	[ ] Accept (High priority) [ ] Accept (General priority)	
	[ ] Minor revision [ <mark>Y</mark> ] Major revision [ ] Rejection	
Re-review	[Y]Yes [ ]No	
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: [Y] Anonymous [ ] Onymous	
	Conflicts-of-Interest: [ ] Yes [ Y] No	

### SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

I commend the authors for selecting a pertinent and current topic. However, I would like to highlight some relevant issues that should be addressed. Firstly, this article appears to resemble more of a review rather than an editorial. Editorials typically maintain a higher level of objectivity. I recommend focusing the discussion on the application of AI in the diagnosis of HAT and setting aside some of the clinical aspects. In fact, there are inaccuracies regarding the clinical presentation of HAT. For example, it is well-known that biliary graft ischemia is associated with ischemic cholangiopathy. English style should also be reviewed, as there are a few instances of concordance and grammatical imperfections.



# PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Transplantation

Manuscript NO: 88938

Title: Improving the radiological diagnosis of hepatic artery thrombosis after liver

transplantation: Current approaches and future challenges.

Provenance and peer review: Invited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 05334153 Position: Peer Reviewer Academic degree: MD

**Professional title:** Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Egypt

Author's Country/Territory: Chile

Manuscript submission date: 2023-10-16

Reviewer chosen by: Yu-Lu Chen

Reviewer accepted review: 2023-11-06 12:35

Reviewer performed review: 2023-11-17 09:44

**Review time:** 10 Days and 21 Hours

Scientific quality	[ ] Grade A: Excellent [ ] Grade B: Very good [ ] Grade C: Good [ Y] Grade D: Fair [ ] Grade E: Do not publish
Novelty of this manuscript	[ ] Grade A: Excellent [ ] Grade B: Good [ Y] Grade C: Fair [ ] Grade D: No novelty
Creativity or innovation of this manuscript	[ ] Grade A: Excellent [ ] Grade B: Good [ Y] Grade C: Fair [ ] Grade D: No creativity or innovation



7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite 160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA **Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568

E-mail: office@baishideng.com

https://www.wjgnet.com

Scientific significance of the conclusion in this manuscript	[ ] Grade A: Excellent [ ] Grade B: Good [ Y] Grade C: Fair [ ] Grade D: No scientific significance
Language quality	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing [ Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing [ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing [ ] Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	[ ] Accept (High priority) [ ] Accept (General priority) [ ] Minor revision [ Y] Major revision [ ] Rejection
Re-review	[Y] Yes [] No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: [Y] Anonymous [ ] Onymous  Conflicts-of-Interest: [ ] Yes [Y] No

### SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Specific comments to authors: Linder and co-others in this review article report on "Improving the diagnosis of hepatic artery thrombosis after liver transplant". Congratulations on completing this interesting work. The manuscript is of clinical and academic interest although the authors need to address some points as follows. - The manuscript in general needs more details about the diagnostic findings, management approaches and the role of AI. - Add in the article title "radiological" diagnosis of HAT ...... - Please add a paragraph on the incidence and management of HAT in pediatrics liver transplant recipients. - Please mention the risk factors for the development of HAT in liver transplant patients. - Add a paragraph about the incidence and diagnosis of late HAT. - Mention the clinical features and laboratory findings in HAT. - Add figures for MRA findings and figures for interventional radiology approaches for treatment of HAT. - Add more details about algorithms provided by AI for management of HAT and how they speeded up or resolved the diagnostic dilemma of HAT. - The abbreviations should be first mentioned in details then used thereafter. Thanks



# RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

Name of journal: World Journal of Transplantation

Manuscript NO: 88938

Title: Improving the radiological diagnosis of hepatic artery thrombosis after liver

transplantation: Current approaches and future challenges.

Provenance and peer review: Invited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 05334153 Position: Peer Reviewer Academic degree: MD

**Professional title:** Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Egypt

Author's Country/Territory: Chile

Manuscript submission date: 2023-10-16

Reviewer chosen by: Xin-Liang Qu

Reviewer accepted review: 2023-12-04 12:27

Reviewer performed review: 2023-12-05 21:03

**Review time:** 1 Day and 8 Hours

Scientific quality	[ ] Grade A: Excellent [ ] Grade B: Very good [ ] Grade C: Good [ Y] Grade D: Fair [ ] Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing [ Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing [ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing [ ] Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	[ ] Accept (High priority) [Y] Accept (General priority) [ ] Minor revision [ ] Major revision [ ] Rejection
Peer-reviewer	Peer-Review: [ Y] Anonymous [ ] Onymous



7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite 160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA **Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568

E-mail: office@baishideng.com

https://www.wjgnet.com

statements

Conflicts-of-Interest: [ ] Yes [Y] No

# SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Accept



# RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

Name of journal: World Journal of Transplantation

Manuscript NO: 88938

Title: Improving the radiological diagnosis of hepatic artery thrombosis after liver

transplantation: Current approaches and future challenges.

Provenance and peer review: Invited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 04382733 Position: Peer Reviewer Academic degree: DO, PhD

Professional title: Consultant Physician-Scientist, Doctor, Medical Assistant

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** Brazil

Author's Country/Territory: Chile

Manuscript submission date: 2023-10-16

Reviewer chosen by: Xin-Liang Qu

Reviewer accepted review: 2023-12-07 12:42

Reviewer performed review: 2023-12-08 02:28

Review time: 13 Hours

Scientific quality	[ ] Grade A: Excellent [Y] Grade B: Very good [ ] Grade C: Good [ ] Grade D: Fair [ ] Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	[ Y] Grade A: Priority publishing [ ] Grade B: Minor language polishing [ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing [ ] Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	[ ] Accept (High priority) [Y] Accept (General priority) [ ] Minor revision [ ] Major revision [ ] Rejection
Peer-reviewer	Peer-Review: [ Y] Anonymous [ ] Onymous



statements

Conflicts-of-Interest: [ ] Yes [Y] No

# SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Thank you for appropriately addressing the suggestions provided by the reviewers.