

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology*

Manuscript NO: 89098

Title: Present situation and prospect of immunotherapy for unresectable locally advanced esophageal cancer during peri-radiotherapy

Provenance and peer review: Invited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 03709972

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Doctor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Taiwan

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2023-10-21

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2023-10-21 06:22

Reviewer performed review: 2023-10-21 07:56

Review time: 1 Hour

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Novelty of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No novelty
Creativity or innovation of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No creativity or innovation

Scientific significance of the conclusion in this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No scientific significance
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
	Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

#1. "Another RTOG phase II randomized controlled trial (RCT) (4)" >> but ref-4= Beijing: People's Medical Press, 2017. So please clarify [or ref-3 in fact?]

#2. "resectable esophageal cancer has made some progress (6)" >> where was re-5 cited in the text? [INT 0123 study [5]?]

#3. "neoadjuvant chemotherapy combined with immunotherapy for resectable esophageal cancer has made some progress (6)," >> please note ref-6 = ESMO guideline in 2016 in which immunotherapy was not mentioned.

#4. "INT 0123 (31)," but ref-31 = JCO 2002;20(5):1167 =ref-5

#5. "Based on the standard treatment of radical concurrent radiotherapy and chemotherapy, combined immunotherapy may get more clinical positive results (34 36)" >> please note ref-34 [NCT03914443] & ref-36 [KEYNOTE-590-NCT03881111] did not use radiotherapy.

#6. "(14, 37) published the results of a one arm exploratory study on the treatment of locally advanced esophageal squamous cell carcinoma with karelizumab combined with concurrent radiotherapy and chemotherapy" >> Please note ref-37 [PMID: 33314747] did not use radiotherapy.

#7. KUNLUN >> suggest to add reference [NCT04550260]

#8. suggest to comment on other (older?) forms of immunotherapy in addition to immune checkpoint inhibitors



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

[such as DC-CIK reported in Genet Mol Res. 2015 Feb 2;14(1):898-905 or protein-bound polysaccharide reported in Am J Clin Oncol . 1995 Jun;18(3):216-22]

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology*

Manuscript NO: 89098

Title: Present situation and prospect of immunotherapy for unresectable locally advanced esophageal cancer during peri-radiotherapy

Provenance and peer review: Invited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 05223442

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: FACS, FICS, MD, MSc

Professional title: Assistant Professor, Senior Researcher, Surgeon

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Liberia

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2023-10-21

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2023-10-25 22:24

Reviewer performed review: 2023-11-03 00:51

Review time: 8 Days and 2 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Novelty of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No novelty
Creativity or innovation of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No creativity or innovation

Scientific significance of the conclusion in this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No scientific significance
Language quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
	Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1. What is the specific gap or unmet need in the field of esophageal cancer treatment that this manuscript aims to address? 2. How does the manuscript assess the efficacy and drawbacks of neoadjuvant chemotherapy before concurrent radiotherapy and chemotherapy in treating locally advanced esophageal cancer? b. What evidence is provided to evaluate the advantages and disadvantages of induction chemotherapy in comparison to direct concurrent chemoradiotherapy? 3. Are there clear recommendations or suggestions provided in the manuscript regarding patient selection criteria and the optimization of treatment modalities in the future?