

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Clinical Cases*

Manuscript NO: 92656

Title: Establishment and evaluation of a prognostic model for patients with unresectable gastric cancer liver metastases

Provenance and peer review: Unsolicited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 03767650

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Japan

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2024-02-01

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2024-02-03 00:10

Reviewer performed review: 2024-02-12 12:28

Review time: 9 Days and 12 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Novelty of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No novelty
Creativity or innovation of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No creativity or innovation

Scientific significance of the conclusion in this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No scientific significance
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
	Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This study identifies pivotal prognostic factors and introduces a nomogram model for predicting individualized prognosis in GCML. The authors found five independent risk factors including albumin levels, primary tumor size, presence of extrahepatic metastases, surgical treatment status, and chemotherapy administration. This retrospective study is well organized, however, some major issues were raised. 1. The AUC of 0.7-0.8, 0.8-0.9, and 0.9-1.0 indicate fair, good, and excellent predictive accuracies, respectively. The AUC for OSs from 1 to 3 years is fair, so please change the article including the Abstract accordingly. 2. It is unclear which variables were enrolled into the multivariate analysis. Please describe the method in the Statistical analysis. Age and gender should be included in multivariate analysis. There was a significant difference in BMI in univariate analysis, but was it enrolled into multivariate analysis? 3. Since gastric cancer and H. pylori infection status have a clinically important relationship, they should be included in the analysis. Did you assess this relationship?

RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Clinical Cases*

Manuscript NO: 92656

Title: Establishment and evaluation of a prognostic model for patients with unresectable gastric cancer liver metastases

Provenance and peer review: Unsolicited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 03767650

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Japan

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2024-02-01

Reviewer chosen by: Huo Liu

Reviewer accepted review: 2024-03-14 11:38

Reviewer performed review: 2024-03-15 14:24

Review time: 1 Day and 2 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Peer-reviewer	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: office@baishideng.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

statements

Conflicts-of-Interest: [] Yes [Y] No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Thank you for revising. There are still points to be corrected in this manuscript. 1. Age and sex are clinically significant factors for this study. The variables that are enrolled into multivariate analysis must be clinically significant rather than statistically relevant. Therefore, even if age and sex are not significantly associated in univariate analysis, they should be included in multivariate analysis. 2. Although the section on Statistical analysis has been revised, the method for selecting explanatory variables used in multivariate analysis is still not clear. 3. Regarding the relationship with H. pylori, please explain in the limitations why this was not included in the analysis, given that most cases of gastric cancer are infected with H. pylori.