

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 3466

Title: Feasibility and Safety of Trans-umbilical Cholecystectomy with A Water-jet Hybrid-knife by Pure NOTES: A Pilot Animal Study

Reviewer code: 01559334

Science editor: Wang, Jin-Lei

Date sent for review: 2013-05-02 16:30

Date reviewed: 2013-05-14 16:34

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a very interesting study about the feasibility and safety of Natural orifice trans-umbilical endoscopic cholecystectomy with a water-jet hybrid-knife in a non-survival porcine model. In this study, pure NOTES cholecystectomy was performed on three non-survival pigs, by transumbilical approach, with a double-channel flexible endoscope, and a water-jet hybrid-knife. The authors found that pure NOTES trans-umbilical cholecystectomy with a water-jet hybrid-knife appears to be feasible and safe. Comments: 1. The abstract should be re-arranged. The methods and results section is so short. The authors should provide more information in the abstract. 2. The tables and figures are very informatic. Good. 3. the ref. is updating.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 3466

Title: Feasibility and Safety of Trans-umbilical Cholecystectomy with A Water-jet Hybrid-knife by Pure NOTES: A Pilot Animal Study

Reviewer code: 00926900

Science editor: Wang, Jin-Lei

Date sent for review: 2013-05-02 16:30

Date reviewed: 2013-05-14 19:38

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Dear Author, I have read with interest the manuscript entitled "Feasibility and Safety of Trans-umbilical Cholecystectomy with A Water-jet Hybrid-knife by Pure NOTES: A Pilot Animal Study" by Hong Shi et al. It is a very interesting topic for the readers of WJG. The manuscript can be published after minor revision. 1. The abstract is so simple. 2. Manuscript need some editing.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 3466

Title: Feasibility and Safety of Trans-umbilical Cholecystectomy with A Water-jet Hybrid-knife by Pure NOTES: A Pilot Animal Study

Reviewer code: 01504856

Science editor: Wang, Jin-Lei

Date sent for review: 2013-05-02 16:30

Date reviewed: 2013-05-15 20:37

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Very interesting study about NOTES in cholecystectomy.