

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Diabetes

ESPS Manuscript NO: 4768

Title: Effect of Ethnicity on Weight Loss Among Morbidly Obese Adolescents 1 Year After Bariatric Surgery: Results from the Bariatric Outcomes Longitudinal Database

Reviewer code: 00732053

Science editor: Song, Xiu-Xia

Date sent for review: 2013-07-22 10:35

Date reviewed: 2013-07-23 15:02

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Interesting paper

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Diabetes

ESPS Manuscript NO: 4768

Title: Effect of Ethnicity on Weight Loss Among Morbidly Obese Adolescents 1 Year After Bariatric Surgery: Results from the Bariatric Outcomes Longitudinal Database

Reviewer code: 00054585

Science editor: Song, Xiu-Xia

Date sent for review: 2013-07-22 10:35

Date reviewed: 2013-07-24 02:49

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a retrospective study that compared three different populations: Hispanics; Non-Hispanic Whites, and Non-Hispanic Blacks, using anthropometric measurements. No difference of body weight change was observed, which is different from a recent report (Admiraal WM, et al. Obese Surg 2013 Jul 3. [Epub ahead of print]), in which in terms of weight loss, gastric bypass surgery is less effective in African, South Asian, Turkish and Moroccan patients than in their ethnic Dutch counterparts. The difference between the reports may contribute to the different ethnic subjects, Hispanics vs. non-Hispanics, and adults, vs. adolescents. As author states that a substantial amount of missing follow-up data" and the short-term observation limit its significance. The most important, when comparing gastric banding with gastric bypass, RYGB, but not gastric banding, results in sustained effects in improved metabolic phenotype, thereby resulting in different weight change in long-term between two different procedures. In addition, "those undergoing gastric bypass surgery were significantly heavier than those undergoing adjustable gastric band surgery" (should be surgeries), therefore the subjects who undergone gastric bypass may loss more weight than those with gastric banding, which need to be discussed in the section of Discussion. Minor Please simplify the title in all Tables.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Diabetes

ESPS Manuscript NO: 4768

Title: Effect of Ethnicity on Weight Loss Among Morbidly Obese Adolescents 1 Year After Bariatric Surgery: Results from the Bariatric Outcomes Longitudinal Database

Reviewer code: 00477066

Science editor: Song, Xiu-Xia

Date sent for review: 2013-07-22 10:35

Date reviewed: 2013-08-06 19:14

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a very interesting and well-written study testing whether there is a relationship between outcomes of bariatric surgery and ethnicity among adolescents. However, the results of this analysis could be changed by confounding factors. The potential impact of the grade of obesity before surgery and the surgical intervention (by pass, banding, sleeve ...) should be analyzed in separate analyses.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Diabetes

ESPS Manuscript NO: 4768

Title: Effect of Ethnicity on Weight Loss Among Morbidly Obese Adolescents 1 Year After Bariatric Surgery: Results from the Bariatric Outcomes Longitudinal Database

Reviewer code: 00057868

Science editor: Song, Xiu-Xia

Date sent for review: 2013-07-22 10:35

Date reviewed: 2013-08-15 03:16

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The work done in this manuscript is similar to other papers published by the authors. This research utilizes patients entered into the the national bariatric surgery longitudinal database. There are some limitations in the scope of this paper: 1. Follow-up was very incomplete and was not longer than one year. 2. Gastric bypass and adjustable laparoscopic band patients should have been separated. 3. The %EWL was modest compared to other studies 4. It would be helpful to know more about the 26 patients with nutritional complications as this is of great concern in this patient group. Despite these concerns, the author's hypothesis seems reasonably proven that there are no differences in outcomes across ethnic backgrounds.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Diabetes

ESPS Manuscript NO: 4768

Title: Effect of Ethnicity on Weight Loss Among Morbidly Obese Adolescents 1 Year After Bariatric Surgery: Results from the Bariatric Outcomes Longitudinal Database

Reviewer code: 00504418

Science editor: Song, Xiu-Xia

Date sent for review: 2013-07-22 10:35

Date reviewed: 2013-08-15 21:37

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This manuscript describes the results of the bariatric surgery for adolescents on the difference of ethnicity. However, there are several queries as follows; 1. Could you describe the indication of bariatric surgery for adolescents? 2. Could you describe the selection of bariatric surgery, gastric bypass or adjustable gastric banding for candidates? 3. What do you think the difference between the adults and the adolescents? How about the influence of parents?

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Diabetes

ESPS Manuscript NO: 4768

Title: Effect of Ethnicity on Weight Loss Among Morbidly Obese Adolescents 1 Year After Bariatric Surgery: Results from the Bariatric Outcomes Longitudinal Database

Reviewer code: 00068211

Science editor: Song, Xiu-Xia

Date sent for review: 2013-07-22 10:35

Date reviewed: 2013-08-19 19:05

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Bariatric surgery is popular and in children is new.1,The obesity indices of child is like adult.2,The date come from different hospital,the way of bariatric surgery is same.