



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Endoscopy

ESPS Manuscript NO: 3600

Title: Gastric calcifying fibrous tumor eradicated by endoscopic submucosal resection

Reviewer code: 00503824

Science editor: Zhai, Huan-Huan

Date sent for review: 2013-05-09 21:51

Date reviewed: 2013-05-14 05:30

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a case report of a gastric calcifying fibrous tumour that was diagnosed after endoscopic submucosal dissection (ESD). Major comments: · How does this case report add to current practice? It is accepted practice to resect a submucosal polyp less than 2 cm in size endoscopically for a definitive diagnosis. This is what was done in this case and the only thing that is unusual is the pathological diagnosis. · The authors' title claims that the tumour is eradicated after ESD. According to some reports as mentioned in the discussion, they can locally recur. Can this tumour recur in the stomach? Tumours are not eradicated but removed/resected and this may be a better description. · The title is that of endoscopic submucosal resection but the authors mention ESD in the rest of the text. They should be consistent and stick to one terminology. · In retrospect, are there any specific features of this tumour that could be detected by EUS? For example does calcification narrow down the differential diagnoses? · Why was an endoscopy done as part of routine health screening in a healthy asymptomatic 37 year old?



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Endoscopy

ESPS Manuscript NO: 3600

Title: Gastric calcifying fibrous tumor eradicated by endoscopic submucosal resection

Reviewer code: 00069469

Science editor: Zhai, Huan-Huan

Date sent for review: 2013-05-09 21:51

Date reviewed: 2013-05-21 23:09

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The calcifying fibrous tumors (CFTs) rarely occur in stomach, this case report can enrich our knowledge about CFTs. But it should be minor revised especially in English grammar and terminology before it would be published in ESPS: 1. It should be read by an English-speaker, because it lost a lot of articles in the paper 2. In the title, the last word should be "dissection", because "ESD" or "EMR" is recognized precedent, it should not be optional changed.