ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology
ESPS manuscript NO: 32897
Title: Trend of hepatocellular carcinoma incidence after Bayesian correction for misclassified data in Iranian provinces
Reviewer's code: 02462197
Reviewer's country: Italy
Science editor: Yuan Qi
Date sent for review: 2017-02-01 21:24
Date reviewed: 2017-02-03 02:35

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[Y] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[Y] Accept
[ ] Grade B: Very good	[ ] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] The same title	[ ] High priority for publication
[Y] Grade C: Good		[ ] Duplicate publication	
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] Plagiarism	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	[ ] Minor revision
	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	[ ] Major revision
		[ ] The same title	
		[ ] Duplicate publication	
		[ ] Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a very interesting study from Iran aimed at estimating the rate of regional misclassification in registering the incidence of hepatocellular carcinoma in cancer registry system using a Bayesian method. The study is original and very well written. The statistical analysis is well done. The results are consistent. The study deserves to be published.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology
ESPS manuscript NO: 32897
Title: Trend of hepatocellular carcinoma incidence after Bayesian correction for misclassified data in Iranian provinces
Reviewer's code: 00507910
Reviewer's country: United States
Science editor: Yuan Qi
Date sent for review: 2017-02-01 21:24
Date reviewed: 2017-02-08 06:15

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[Y] Grade B: Very good	[Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] The same title	[ ] High priority for publication
[ ] Grade C: Good		[ ] Duplicate publication	
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] Plagiarism	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	[Y] Minor revision
	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	[ ] Major revision
		[ ] The same title	
		[ ] Duplicate publication	
		[ ] Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

As stated by the authors: "It is assumed that some cancer cases from a province that has an expected coverage of cancer cases lower than 100% are registered in their neighboring facility province with more than 100% expected coverage" . This is an admitted assumption that can result in missing a localized cancer cluster in a particular solitary province. Thus a small HCC cluster could be misattributed as patients registering in a neighboring province . This should be discussed further by the authors in their paper as a potential weakness of their mathematical model. Such a discussion would remedy the flaw sufficiently

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology
ESPS manuscript NO: 32897
Title: Trend of hepatocellular carcinoma incidence after Bayesian correction for misclassified data in Iranian provinces
Reviewer's code: 00182548
Reviewer's country: Romania
Science editor: Yuan Qi
Date sent for review: 2017-02-01 21:24
Date reviewed: 2017-02-16 01:58

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B: Very good	[Y] Grade B: Minor language	[ ] The same title	[ ] High priority for
[Y] Grade C: Good	polishing	[ ] Duplicate publication	publication
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of	[ ] Plagiarism	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade E: Poor	language polishing	[Y] No	[Y] Minor revision
	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	[ ] Major revision
		[ ] The same title	
		[ ] Duplicate publication	
		[ ] Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The article is interesting in scientific terms. The methodology is clearly exposed, as the results. Unfortunately, the information is not very recent. Financial corrections are difficult to made using data from 2004 to 2008. There are some grammatical errors, including to references.