BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC
7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com http://www.wjgnet.com

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology
Manuscript NO: 33198
Title: Targeted mass spectrometry based metabonomics of urine reveals novel host-gut microbial metabolic interactions in healthy and IBD children
Reviewer's code: 03254999
Reviewer's country: United States
Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma
Date sent for review: 2017-02-22
Date reviewed: 2017-02-22

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
[Y] Grade A: Excellent	[Y] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[Y] Accept
[ ] Grade B: Very good	[ ] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] The same title	[ ] High priority for publication
[ ] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] Duplicate publication	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	[ ] Plagiarism	[ ] Minor revision
[ ] Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	[ ] Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		[ ] The same title	
		[ ] Duplicate publication	
		[ ] Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a well-written manuscript about an important and insightful topic. Understanding the metabolic characteristics of pediatric patients with IBD compared to control is a key factor in diagnosis. The authors stuck to their specific hypothesis and eloquently presented their material. This opens the door for future trials looking at predictive modeling utilizing metabolomics and modifying various therapies to target patients with specific metabolic characteristics.

BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC
7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com http://www.wjgnet.com

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology
Manuscript NO: 33198
Title: Targeted mass spectrometry based metabonomics of urine reveals novel host-gut microbial metabolic interactions in healthy and IBD children
Reviewer's code: 02440884
Reviewer's country: Germany
Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma
Date sent for review: 2017-02-22
Date reviewed: 2017-02-23

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
[Y] Grade A: Excellent	[Y] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[Y] Accept
[ ] Grade B: Very good	[ ] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] The same title	[ ] High priority for publication
[ ] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] Duplicate publication	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	[ ] Plagiarism	[ ] Minor revision
[ ] Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	[ ] Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		[ ] The same title	
		[ ] Duplicate publication	
		[ ] Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The excellent study gives a very good data set reflecting metabonomics in IBD children. Comments 1. The study could improve by additional data describing the microbiome in the cohort; is there any data set available?

BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC
7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com http://www.wjgnet.com

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology
Manuscript NO: 33198
Title: Targeted mass spectrometry based metabonomics of urine reveals novel host-gut microbial metabolic interactions in healthy and IBD children
Reviewer's code: 01047558
Reviewer's country: Tunisia
Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma
Date sent for review: 2017-02-10
Date reviewed: 2017-02-24

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B: Very good	[Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] The same title	[ ] High priority for publication
[Y] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] Duplicate publication	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	[ ] Plagiarism	[Y] Minor revision
[ ] Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	[ ] Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		[ ] The same title	
		[ ] Duplicate publication	
		[ ] Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript "Targeted mass spectrometry based metabonomics of urine reveals novel host-gut microbial metabolic interactions in healthy and IBD children" compared the profile of some metabolites in urine of IBD patients and controls. The article is complex and it is difficult to follow and see the practical interest of the study. The patients are in remission and therefore the difference between patients and controls is not due to the activity of the disease. Comments: - Title is long - Methodology is very detailed (8 pages): it must be simplified - In results there is many paragraph that should be in chapter "materials and methods" - The number of subjects is little and use CD and UC in the same group is disturbing - The IBD patients in this study are in remission. It will be useful to compare the metabolomics of urine in IBD patient in remission and in active diseases