

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 33440

Title: The impact of gut microbiota on neuropsychiatric disorders

Reviewer's code: 03661119

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2017-03-30

Date reviewed: 2017-04-15

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This manuscript is well organized and I enjoy reading it. The topic of gut microbiota and brain dysfunction is indeed a very interesting one. # The gut microbiota may be more dynamic than the human genome. This may pose a challenge to decipher the role of gut microbiota in the etiology and progress of neuropsychiatric diseases. What have we learned about the time scale on the changes of microbial community and development of the diseases? Does the disease development require a constant presence of particular microbial community or is the latter just a trigger? # Regarding depression, alpha diversity seems to correlate either positively or negatively with depression. This needs to be clarified or there is no link between the two. # There is lack of information about the changes in gut microbiota in AD patients. I am interested in seeing more information and discussion about how the alteration in gut microbiota in diabetes or obesity may link to the risk for the development of AD. # Microglia appears to be a crucial cell type in these neuropsychiatric disorders, but only the effect of probiotic VSL#3 on microglia activation has been described in this manuscript. I would be cautious on the role of



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

microglia unless more information can be provided. # Minor errors in grammar: Page 5, last paragraph, an extra “we” need to be deleted: “Thus, it is tempting to speculate that modulating the microbiota and its metabolic products we will enable us to modulate the epigenome and, thereby, prevent or treat mental illness.” Page 19, last paragraph, a rearrangement of the sentence will make it clearer: “Another study showed a reduction in butyrate-producing bacteria (Blautia, Coprococcus and Roseburia) in feces and Faecalibacterium spp. in the mucosa of PD patients, together with an increase in Ralstonia in mucosal samples compared with the abundance of those microbiota members in controls[80].”

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 33440

Title: The impact of gut microbiota on neuropsychiatric disorders

Reviewer's code: 00188995

Reviewer's country: India

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2017-03-30

Date reviewed: 2017-04-15

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a well written and informative article. It would be nice to add a couple of tables summarising the evidence on the role of gut microbiota. This may also help to reduce the size of the manuscript which appears a bit lengthy currently.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 33440

Title: The impact of gut microbiota on neuropsychiatric disorders

Reviewer's code: 00049509

Reviewer's country: Poland

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2017-03-30

Date reviewed: 2017-04-17

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a very interesting and comprehensive paper presenting up-to-date knowledge regarding to interactions between gut microbiota and specific neuropsychiatric disorders. Please replace "germ-free" on "GF" on page 13, line 15 and on page 20 line 4.