

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 33498

Title: Diet in IBS: what to recommend, not what to forbid to patients !

Reviewer's code: 00058573

Reviewer's country: India

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2017-03-01

Date reviewed: 2017-03-01

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Nicely written. Very detailed. It needs to be curtailed and references reduced. Its more of a Review article rather than an Editorial.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 33498

Title: Diet in IBS: what to recommend, not what to forbid to patients !

Reviewer's code: 00001787

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2017-03-01

Date reviewed: 2017-03-02

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

I read with interest the MS "Diet in IBS: what to recommend, not what to forbid to patients!" by Cozma-Petru? A et al. It is an innovative and well designed review paper. I found deeply interesting the proposal of a diet advise pyramid to benefit IBS Tx. The Authors should be commended for providing such an innovative approach to deal with a relevant issue, thou commonly neglected.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 33498

Title: Diet in IBS: what to recommend, not what to forbid to patients !

Reviewer's code: 00069819

Reviewer's country: Jordan

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2017-03-01

Date reviewed: 2017-03-03

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an interesting and comprehensive review of dietary recommendations and lifestyle modifications for IBS patients. The manuscript is well written and informative. However, the manuscript type-Editorial-, as stated by the Authors, is inappropriate. I believe the article type is better be labeled as "review article", as the present is in fact a narrative review of the topic. Furthermore, I wonder if the "IBS food pyramid" was developed "de novo" by the Authors or modified from previous works by others! In the former case, the Authors should state this clearly, by writing " we developed....." and not " it was developed" (second line of the first paragraph of the section "The IBS food pyramid). Overall, I believe that this review is useful for both patients and treating physicians, and therefore, it should attract a large number of readers.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 33498

Title: Diet in IBS: what to recommend, not what to forbid to patients !

Reviewer's code: 00044509

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2017-02-14

Date reviewed: 2017-03-03

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1. The pathology of IBS is composed of visceral hypersensitivity and abnormal bowel movement. The authors should discuss not only the effect of each food but also the relationship between disease condition, especially visceral hypersensitivity and diet. 2. Papers related to diet and IBS still have low levels of evidence and many conflicting results. IBS food pyramid figure is fine, but the authors should show how much the evidence level is. 3. In this paper, the authors should explain why items of physical activity is necessary.