



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https:// www.wjgnet.com

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 34721

Title: Performance Verification and Comparison of TianLong Automatic Hypersensitive HBV DNA Quantification System with COBAS CAP/CTM System

Reviewer's code: 02528812

Reviewer's country: Iran

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2017-05-19

Date reviewed: 2017-05-23

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript entitled "Performance Verification and Comparison of TianLong Automatic Hypersensitive HBV DNA Quantification System with COBAS CAP/CTM System" is well performed. In this study, the authors have evaluated the performance characteristics of the domestic TianLong HBV DNA Quantification System by testing 200 clinical HBV samples and compared the results with the international automatic HBV DNA detection systems including Roche CAP/CTM System. The authors have claimed that the TianLong system confers high specificity as well as good repeatability and stability. In addition, there was no statistically significant difference between TianLong and CAP/CTM systems. This study reports valuable results to validate the detection performance of TianLong HBV DNA Quantification System, which can pave the way to reduce cost of HBV DNA quantitative detection in the Chinese market. I have few comments: 1) There needs to be a space between some words. This should be checked

throughout. 2) I would recommend a linguistic revision of the manuscript by a native speaker as some parts do not read very well.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 34721

Title: Performance Verification and Comparison of TianLong Automatic Hypersensitive HBV DNA Quantification System with COBAS CAP/CTM System

Reviewer's code: 01564209

Reviewer's country: Germany

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2017-05-19

Date reviewed: 2017-05-24

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Drs. Chen and colleagues presented a methodical study in which they tested the TL System to detect HBV DNA and compared this system to the COBAS CAP/CTM system. To show this the colleagues included in their study clinical HBV-serum samples and national HBV reference sera. The authors tested their TL system for detection limit, accuracy, linearity, and more and compared the results to the COBAS system. As results the colleagues could show that there were no significant differences of the performance of both TL and COBAS systems. Overall, the methodical design is well performed and the manuscript is concise in its content. However, I have some comments which should be addressed

Comments 1. English style, punctuation, typing and grammar needs strong attention and should be checked carefully best by a native English speaker. 2. Introduction section, 2nd para. What is a "high barrier resistant gene drug"? In my opinion it is "an antiviral drug with a high genetic barrier to resistance". Please correct

this. 3. Introduction, 2nd para. What is a “sensitive quantitative reagents”? Do you mean “NAT systems”? 4. Results and Discussion section. The colleagues argued that there are no international universal standard for HBV DNA PCR. This is not correct. Please refer to: WHO International Standard “3rd WHO International Standard for Hepatitis B Virus for Nucleic Acid Amplification Techniques (NIBSC code: 10/264). As a suggestion, the involvement of the WHO standard may enhance the impact of this study. 5. With regard to the clinical samples, were the serum samples tested for co-infections with HIV, HCV, HDV etc? Please note this in the Material and Method section. 6. Discussion section, 1st para, 1st sentence. It is “HBV includes..” not “genes” (make no sense). Must also A “-” I not “A ~ I”, and most important A -I are genotypes not subtypes. The wrong term Subtypes instead of Genotypes was used also at other places in the text and should corrected. 7. To show accuracy of the quantitative tests of the TL system a representative plot as a figure would be helpful for the readers. 8. Table 4 has no additional validity and was described in the results text. Therefore Table 4 can be omitted. 9. Table 5. is not clear to me and seems to be unnecessary. 10. Is the TL system available outside of China?



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https:// www.wjgnet.com

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 34721

Title: Performance Verification and Comparison of TianLong Automatic Hypersensitive HBV DNA Quantification System with COBAS CAP/CTM System

Reviewer's code: 00004603

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2017-05-19

Date reviewed: 2017-05-25

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This paper is very technical, it is far from considering as a basic study and should be submitted to a special Journal. This is not the matter of the manuscript quality, just in the journal that deals with technology it will be more appreciated.



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https:// www.wjgnet.com

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 34721

Title: Performance Verification and Comparison of TianLong Automatic Hypersensitive HBV DNA Quantification System with COBAS CAP/CTM System

Reviewer's code: 02528622

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2017-05-19

Date reviewed: 2017-05-28

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The paper by Chen and cols describes a performance evaluation and comparative study of the TL platform versus the COBAS system. The authors concluded that there are no significant differences on performance between the two systems. This is a very interesting, well presented and written manuscript. Overall a good read with pretty solid results. Minor grammatical errors can be found spread throughout the paper. A review of the style in some sections of the manuscript will likely improve the paper facilitating reading.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 34721

Title: Performance Verification and Comparison of TianLong Automatic Hypersensitive HBV DNA Quantification System with COBAS CAP/CTM System

Reviewer's code: 02942798

Reviewer's country: Slovakia

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2017-05-19

Date reviewed: 2017-05-28

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Dear sir, thank you to select me for review of manuscript Chen et al. Performance Verification and Comparison of TianLong Automatic Hypersensitive HBV DNA Quantification System with COBAS CAP/CTM System TianLong Automatic Hypersensitive HBV DNA Quantification System has adequate limit of detection, limit of quantification, accuracy and reproducibility. Results from TL AH HBV DNA quantification system are comparable with COBAS CAP/CTM System. Paper needs minor revision: 1) Discussion needs improvement, please add references to discussion and compare TL AH HBV DNA quantification system with other systems using in laboratory practice. 2) Please edit references by the rules used in World journal of gastroenterology. 3) Add authors contribution, conflict of interests and funding. 4) Papers needs a linguistic revision of the manuscript by a native speaker.