

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

Manuscript NO: 37996

Title: A case of laparoscopic surgery of metastatic hepatic leiomyosarcoma associated with STUMP

Reviewer's code: 00041963

Reviewer's country: Turkey

Science editor: Li-Jun Cui

Date sent for review: 2018-01-22

Date reviewed: 2018-01-27

Review time: 5 Days

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This manuscript gives different messages to the readers.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

Manuscript NO: 37996

Title: A case of laparoscopic surgery of metastatic hepatic leiomyosarcoma associated with STUMP

Reviewer's code: 03765025

Reviewer's country: Brazil

Science editor: Li-Jun Cui

Date sent for review: 2018-02-06

Date reviewed: 2018-02-11

Review time: 5 Days

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a interesting case report that describes a metastatic hepatic leiomyosarcoma secondary to a previous broad ligament smooth muscle tumor of uncertain malignant potential (STUMP). There are few case reports and case series regarding metastatic liver leiomyosarcoma, however, this is the first one that described malignant transformation from primary STUMP to metastatic hepatic leiomyosarcoma. Language evaluation: good English level Title: I suggest not using abbreviations in the title Summary: well structured, it is a concise summary of the paper Keywords: need revision - Metastatic hepatic leiomyosarcoma, Smooth muscle tumor of uncertain malignant potential (STUMP) and Malignant transformation are not MeSH terms - Leiomyosarcoma and Smooth Muscle Tumor are appropriate MeSH terms. Introduction: the introduction provides a brief overview of the importance of the study. The aim is clear. Case report:



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https:// www.wjgnet.com

The clinical case is well documented, however some points should be clarified: - How did the liver nodule suspected? Abdominal palpable mass? - Liver resection was described as “video-assisted laparoscopic resection”. What does that mean? Did a hybrid liver resection performed? There was auxiliary incision? Figure 2 shows a pure laparoscopic resection. - Did the surgical specimen retrieved through a port site or auxiliary incision? - When did the patient operated? Long-term follow-up should be described. Where did the patient relapse? Did she submit to systemic treatment? - What is the current status of the patient? - Ethical aspects: ok (retrospective) - Figures: very clear and illustrative Discussion: discusses the importance of this case report - PubMed and Medline are very similar databases; EMBASE search can be useful to find new articles. - The oncological prognostic of patients with metastatic liver leiomyosarcoma should be discussed. - The last paragraph, which discusses the laparoscopic liver resections, is a bit confusing and out of context The conclusion is supported by the data References: ok

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

Manuscript NO: 37996

Title: A case of laparoscopic surgery of metastatic hepatic leiomyosarcoma associated with STUMP

Reviewer's code: 03035837

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Li-Jun Cui

Date sent for review: 2018-02-06

Date reviewed: 2018-02-20

Review time: 13 Days

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript by Fukui K, et al. reported a case of STUMP that occurred in a broad ligament and developed into metastatic hepatic leiomyosarcoma over a period of 6 years, and an ultrasound-guided video-assisted laparoscopic partial liver resection was performed with vessel-sealing devices, using the crush clamping method and Pringle maneuver. Overall, this manuscript is written in acceptable language quality and has a value for publication. Specific comments: First, it seems that metastatic hepatic leiomyosarcoma from STUMP have some reports (Am J Surg Pathol. 2008;32(1):98-102) (PMID: 18162776). Second, as laparoscopic surgery was emphasized repeatedly, the related methods used for the treatment, including ultrasound-guided, the crush clamping method and Pringle maneuver, should be described more detailedly in the treatment part. At last, follow-up data during the 6 years and after this operation are



7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https:// www.wjgnet.com

better to be added, if possible.