

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 39841

Title: Negative impact of HBsAg seroclearance on prognosis of hepatitis B-related primary liver cancer

Reviewer's code: 03538158

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Jin-Lei Wang

Date sent for review: 2018-05-15

Date reviewed: 2018-05-15

Review time: 2 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Authors concluded "Seroclearance in patients with hepatitis B-related primary liver cancer has protective effects with respect to tumorigenesis, cirrhosis and portal hypertension but confers worse prognosis, likely due to the frequent occurrence of



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https:// www.wjgnet.com

highly malignant ICC and CHC." However, authors excluded the patients with underlying liver diseases (hepatitis C virus, autoimmune liver disease, alcoholic liver disease, cryptogenic cirrhosis and hepatolithiasis). Authors should included these patients in the present study and show the HBV status and compare these patients.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 39841

Title: Negative impact of HBsAg seroclearance on prognosis of hepatitis B-related primary liver cancer

Reviewer's code: 00187828

Reviewer's country: Turkey

Science editor: Jin-Lei Wang

Date sent for review: 2018-05-15

Date reviewed: 2018-05-16

Review time: 1 Day

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript entitled "Negative impact of HBsAg seroclearance on prognosis of hepatitis B-related primary liver cancer" has been evaluated as follows; The effect of HBsAg seroclearance on prognosis in hepatitis B-related primary liver cancer has been



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https:// www.wjgnet.com

studied in the HBsAg seroclearance (SC) group and the HBsAg non-seroclearance (NSC) group. The SC and NSC groups consist of 72 and 216 patients, respectively. The authors demonstrated that seroclearance in patients with hepatitis B-related primary liver cancer has protective effects with respect to tumorigenesis, cirrhosis and portal hypertension but confers worse prognosis. It is an interesting paper with statistically significant data but needs language polishing.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 39841

Title: Negative impact of HBsAg seroclearance on prognosis of hepatitis B-related primary liver cancer

Reviewer's code: 00183339

Reviewer's country: Iran

Science editor: Jin-Lei Wang

Date sent for review: 2018-05-15

Date reviewed: 2018-05-20

Review time: 4 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This paper investigated the "impact of HBsAg seroclearance on prognosis of hepatitis B-related primary liver cancer". The authors found that Seroclearance in patients with hepatitis B-related primary liver cancer has protective effects with respect to



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https:// www.wjgnet.com

tumorigenesis, cirrhosis and portal hypertension but confers worse prognosis, likely due to the frequent occurrence of highly malignant ICC and CHC. The manuscript is well presented and of interest and can contribute to increase the knowledge of this topic. Only some grammatical errors were seen in the manuscript which should be corrected.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 39841

Title: Negative impact of HBsAg seroclearance on prognosis of hepatitis B-related primary liver cancer

Reviewer's code: 02441096

Reviewer's country: Egypt

Science editor: Jin-Lei Wang

Date sent for review: 2018-05-15

Date reviewed: 2018-05-28

Review time: 12 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Minor Comment: • The editing of the manuscript needs careful revision. • Author No.

(4)- Ying- Tang Gao- contribution is missing and has to be added. • Language level: B

Comments to Authors: 1. TITLE Reflect the major content of the article; however, HBsAg

sero-clearance is better to be replaced by HBsAg-negativity. 2. ABSTRACT It partially fulfills the journal requirements; the aim of the work is not clearly identified. 3. INTRODUCTION It provides insufficient background regarding the studied topic because of the following: o The authors need to address quantitative HBsAg as a useful tool to predict seroclearance. o Also, occult HBV infection, where HBVsAg is not present, but still the patient has HBV infection has to be emphasized. o Last paragraph: It was mentioned that “correlation between HBsAg seroclearance and the prognosis of patients with liver cancer was demonstrated”. This has to be revised, because no correlation was presented. 4. MATERIALS AND METHODS: It was nearly covered, but some important issues have to be considered. o HBsAg status: patient selection based on quantitative/qualitative HBsAg is not clarified. o HBV sAg clearance is not clarified if it is in the course of natural development or in response to antiviral therapy. o SC group were strictly matched with those of the NSC group at a proportion of 1:3. The reason for the chosen ratio is better to be explained. 5. RESULTS: Are well presented and informative, however, the following remarks are better to be considered: o The average age is better to be expressed as mean age \pm SD. o Tables were informative, but p value is missing> Also, normal values for AST, ALT, TBiL & AFP have to be mentioned. o % is always has to be associated with any presented number of patients; e.g.: 26/72 (%). o Figures 2- 4 are better to be figure 2(A, B, C). 6. Discussion: An overall theoretical analysis of the study results is nearly covered. 7. REFERENCES: • Relevant updated references are cited. • PMID is maintained for all included references. • The journal style for writing this section is maintained.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

[] The same title



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https:// www.wjgnet.com

☐ Duplicate publication

☐ Plagiarism

☐ Y No

BPG Search:

☐ The same title

☐ Duplicate publication

☐ Plagiarism

☐ Y No