PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 42347

Title: Nomogram to predict overall survival after gallbladder cancer resection in China

Reviewer's code: 02840081

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Ruo-Yu Ma

Date sent for review: 2018-09-19

Date reviewed: 2018-10-11

Review time: 22 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing	[Y] Accept (High priority)	Peer-Review:
[Y] Grade B: Very good	[Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing		[Y] Anonymous
[ ] Grade C: Good		[ ] Accept (General priority)	[ ] Onymous
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing		Peer-reviewer's expertise on the topic of the manuscript:
[ ] Grade E: Do not publish	[ ] Grade D: Rejection	[ ] Minor revision	[Y] Advanced
		[ ] Major revision	[ ] General
		[ ] Rejection	[ ] No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			[ ] Yes
			[Y] No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Recently, a more accurate and effective survival model for predicting the prognosis of patients with nonmetastatic gallbladder after surgical resection derived from the SEER database was built. However, due to the limited number of GBC patients and disparate risk factors in China, to the best of our knowledge, no predictive model has been

established to evaluate the prognosis of patients with GBC in China. In this study, the authors incorporated individual correlation determinants into a nomogram to predict overall survival for GBC patients after radical resection. Overall, the study is very well designed and the the results are very interesting. 1 Title is succinct, and reflects the main subject/hypothesis of the manuscript. 2 The abstract summarizes and reflect the work described in the manuscript. 3 Methods are adequate, and described very detail in the main text. 4 Results are interesting and well displayed. And the follow up data are good 5 The lastest references have been listed and discussed with the results. 6 Main text requires a minor editing.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

[   ] The same title

[   ] Duplicate publication

[   ] Plagiarism

[Y] No

BPG Search:

[   ] The same title

[   ] Duplicate publication

[   ] Plagiarism

[Y] No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 42347

Title: Nomogram to predict overall survival after gallbladder cancer resection in China

Reviewer's code: 03645518

Reviewer's country: South Korea

Science editor: Ruo-Yu Ma

Date sent for review: 2018-09-19

Date reviewed: 2018-10-15

Review time: 25 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
[Y] Grade A: Excellent	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing	[Y] Accept (High priority)	Peer-Review:
[ ] Grade B: Very good	[Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] Accept (General priority)	[Y] Anonymous
[ ] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] Minor revision	[ ] Onymous
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejection	[ ] Major revision	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the topic of the manuscript:
[ ] Grade E: Do not publish		[ ] Rejection	[Y] Advanced
			[ ] General
			[ ] No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			[ ] Yes
			[Y] No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Excellent study about the curative resection for gallbladder carcinoma. In this study, the authors integrated clinically significant variables related to prognosis after curative resection for gallbladder carcinoma into a predictive nomogram. About 142 gallbladder cancer patients who underwent curative intent surgical resection were included. A

multivariate Cox proportional hazards model was used to select variables to construct the nomogram. Discrimination and calibration of the nomogram were performed via the concordance index and calibration plots. And ROC curve analysis and DCA were performed to evaluate the predictive accuracy and net benefit of the nomogram. A high prediction accuracy was verified via bootstrap validation. And the calibration plot demonstrated good performance of the nomogram. ROC curve analysis revealed high sensitivity and specificity. Also, a high net benefit was proven by DCA. After calibration and verification, this model was shown to have high predictive accuracy and clinical utility for assessing the survival time of patients undergoing curative intent resection for gallbladder cancer. The study is very well designed, and the results are very interesting. Congratulate to the authors for their work. Those results are very useful to the clinicians. Some minor language revisions is required

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

[   ] The same title

[   ] Duplicate publication

[   ] Plagiarism

[Y   ] No

BPG Search:

[   ] The same title

[   ] Duplicate publication

[   ] Plagiarism

[Y] No

Baishideng Publishing Group

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 42347

Title: Nomogram to predict overall survival after gallbladder cancer resection in China

Reviewer's code: 02856102

Reviewer's country: South Korea

Science editor: Ruo-Yu Ma

Date sent for review: 2018-09-19

Date reviewed: 2018-10-15

Review time: 25 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing	[ ] Accept (High priority)	Peer-Review:
[Y] Grade B: Very good	[Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[Y] Accept (General priority)	[Y] Anonymous
[ ] Grade C: Good			[ ] Onymous
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] Minor revision	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the topic of the manuscript:
[ ] Grade E: Do not publish	[ ] Grade D: Rejection	[ ] Major revision	[Y] Advanced
		[ ] Rejection	[ ] General
			[ ] No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			[ ] Yes
			[Y] No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This study is very interesting and the manuscript is very well written. I have no sepcific comments to the authors, only some minor language polishing should be checked.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

[   ] The same title

[   ] Duplicate publication

[   ] Plagiarism

[Y] No

BPG Search:

[   ] The same title

[   ] Duplicate publication

[   ] Plagiarism

[Y] No