

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 49190

Title: Application of Newcastle Disease Virus in the Treatment of Colorectal Cancer

Reviewer's code: 03004570

Reviewer's country: Turkey

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-05-18 11:25

Reviewer performed review: 2019-05-23 05:46

Review time: 4 Days and 18 Hours

| SCIENTIFIC QUALITY | LANGUAGE QUALITY | CONCLUSION | PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS |
|--|---|--|---|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept | Peer-Review: |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language | (High priority) | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good | polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept | <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of | (General priority) | Peer-reviewer's expertise on the |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not | language polishing | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision | topic of the manuscript: |
| publish | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision | <input type="checkbox"/> Advanced |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General |
| | | | <input type="checkbox"/> No expertise |
| | | | Conflicts-of-Interest: |
| | | | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes |
| | | | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No |

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This mini-review which is about the application of NDV in the treatment of CRC needs some corrections. In the Conclusion section, the authors concluded that the strategy of NDV anti-CRC therapy has been widely explored. Actually, as they mentioned, only one phase II and one small phase III study from a single center were published (ref #78 &

#79). In the trial published by Schulze et al in 2009 (ref #79), total 50 patients were randomised to the adjuvant vaccination (n=25 pts) with ATV-NDV or control (no treatment) group (n=25 pts). All patients were curatively resected for CRC liver metastasis before randomization. In the total patient group, no differences in the primary and secondary end-points were detected. Only a subgroup analysis revealed a significant OS advantage for vaccinated colon cancer patients (n=13 pts!). These data are not enough to draw a conclusion. On the other hand, again in the Conclusion section, authors conclude that NDV is associated with fewer side effects and higher safety than chemotherapy or radiotherapy. However, there is not any published comparative trial in the literature! This conclusion is not acceptable without any evidence. In the Table 1, there is a typing error: ref #79 after Schirrmacher et al should be #82. Except these statements, this mini-review is worth to publish. The topic that is current situation of the treatment with NDV in CRC is highly attractive for readers and figures are excellent.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 49190

Title: Application of Newcastle Disease Virus in the Treatment of Colorectal Cancer

Reviewer's code: 02544751

Reviewer's country: Slovakia

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-06-01 19:55

Reviewer performed review: 2019-06-06 08:04

Review time: 4 Days and 12 Hours

| SCIENTIFIC QUALITY | LANGUAGE QUALITY | CONCLUSION | PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS |
|---|---|---|---------------------------------------|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept | Peer-Review: |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language | (High priority) | <input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good | polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept | <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of | (General priority) | Peer-reviewer's expertise on the |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not | language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision | topic of the manuscript: |
| publish | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision | <input type="checkbox"/> Advanced |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection | <input type="checkbox"/> General |
| | | | <input type="checkbox"/> No expertise |
| | | | Conflicts-of-Interest: |
| | | | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes |
| | | | <input type="checkbox"/> No |

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Recension of manuscript No. 49190: „ Application of Newcastle Disease Virus in the Treatment of Colorectal Cancer, written by Hui Song, Li-Ping Zhong, Nuo Yang, Zi-Quan Li, Yong-Xiang Zhao “, which will be published in World Journal of Gastroenterology. The structure of manuscript is in keeping with the common

required criteria. The topic of the work is very actual, because despite the surgical treatment and chemotherapy for colorectal cancer, the majority of colorectal cancer patients die due to liver or lung metastasis or recurrence. Therefore, there is an urgent need to find more effective treatment strategies to reduce their mortality. Newcastle disease virus can selectively infect tumor cells and can also improve the ability of Newcastle disease virus to resist colorectal cancer by constructing an autologous tumor vaccine. Authors described molecular biological characteristics of Newcastle disease virus, the oncolytic mechanism of Newcastle disease virus, the possibilities in the treatment of colorectal cancer in vitro and clinical application of the Newcastle disease virus against colorectal cancer patients. Work is clearly legible, brings summarizes new knowledges. The citations are actual and their format respect usual standards. The conclusion reflects the author's knowledges and these can be accepted. However, more research is needed to determine the preclinical and clinical effects of Newcastle disease virus to verify its safety and efficacy in colorectal cancer therapy. I recommend the manuscript to be published. Kosice, 6. May 2019 MUDr. Jana Katuchova, PhD. Professor of Department of Surgery University Hospital Košice Slovakia

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☒ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<https://www.wjgnet.com>

[] Duplicate publication

[] Plagiarism

[Y] No