



### PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Transplantation

**Manuscript NO:** 55163

**Title:** Pre-emptive live donor kidney transplantation: Moving barriers to opportunities.  
An ELPAT view

**Reviewer's code:** 00504341

**Position:** Peer Reviewer

**Academic degree:** MD

**Professional title:** Professor

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** France

**Author's Country/Territory:** United Kingdom

**Manuscript submission date:** 2020-09-21

**Reviewer chosen by:** Jia-Ping Yan

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2020-10-19 07:08

**Reviewer performed review:** 2020-10-20 10:14

**Review time:** 1 Day and 3 Hours

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Re-review</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No
<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568  
**E-mail:** [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com)  
**https://**[www.wjgnet.com](http://www.wjgnet.com)

#### **SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

The subject of pre-emptive transplantation, which occurs prior to the recipient's requirement for dialysis that has demonstrated improvements in patient and graft survival in comparison to implantation after the commencement of dialysis, has been extensively discussed in the literature during the last decades, fundamentally for reason of the good results obtained in kidney transplantation. The manuscript of van Dellen et al; carries out an instructive analysis of the basics mechanisms of action of the procedure, and various considerations in this regard. These objectives and indications are supported by an important and significant bibliography. Although the essence of this work does not add new knowledge on the subject; it constitutes a good educational element in this regard, which is undoubtedly of practical use. In relation to the final conclusion of this assay, a short call to the problem of social behaviour regarding donation of potential deceased donor, could also be useful to have been mentioned.



**PEER-REVIEW REPORT**

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Transplantation

**Manuscript NO:** 55163

**Title:** Pre-emptive live donor kidney transplantation: Moving barriers to opportunities.  
An ELPAT view

**Reviewer's code:** 00844053

**Position:** Peer Reviewer

**Academic degree:** FACS, MD

**Professional title:** Chief Doctor, Full Professor, Professor

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** United States

**Author's Country/Territory:** United Kingdom

**Manuscript submission date:** 2020-09-21

**Reviewer chosen by:** Jia-Ping Yan

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2020-10-19 11:21

**Reviewer performed review:** 2020-10-26 18:18

**Review time:** 7 Days and 6 Hours

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Re-review</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No
<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://**www.wjgnet.com

#### **SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

D Van Dellen ET al. Described pre-emptive live donor kidney transplantation: Moving barriers to opportunities. An ELPAT view. They wrote a nice review including of the aspects of pre-emptive about kidney transplantation. In their paper there is no clinical data about the benefit of doing transplants in that setting? Pre-emptive transplant has great benefit for the recipient, avoiding dialysis and maximizing patient survival. Do the authors think that transplantation could be different experience among patients that were on dialysis and those who had the transplant and were pre-emptive?