



Mr D van Dellen
Clinical Lead
Renal Transplant Unit
Manchester Royal Infirmary
Oxford Road
Manchester
M13 9WL
30th January 2021

Editor in Chief
World Journal of Transplantation

Dear Sir

Re: Pre-emptive live donor kidney transplantation: Moving barriers to opportunities. An ELPAT view (Manuscript NO: 55163)

Many thanks for your reviewers' comments on this manuscript. I have attached a revised manuscript in the correct format but have also responded to reviewers and editorial queries on a point-by-point basis below. In addition, formatting has been arranged as per guidelines.

Reviewer #1:

D Van Dellen ET al. Described pre-emptive live donor kidney transplantation: Moving barriers to opportunities. An ELPAT view. They wrote a nice review including of the aspects of pre-emptive about kidney transplantation. In their paper there is no clinical data about the benefit of doing transplants in that setting? Pre-emptive transplant has great benefit for the recipient, avoiding dialysis and maximizing patient survival. Do the authors think that transplantation could be different experience among patients that were on dialysis and those who had the transplant and were pre-emptive?

Many thanks for your comments and review of the article. This manuscript was intended as a descriptive review of the challenges, barriers and opportunities to pre-emptive live donation from an ethical stand point. The benefit of pre-emptive transplantation is well documented and referenced extensively in the manuscript, and is obviously a very important consideration in terms of decisions regarding timing of transplantation, if available. However, the manuscript/review particularly examined opportunities and barriers to live donation and on this basis, was a largely descriptive review.

Reviewer #2:

The subject of pre-emptive transplantation, which occurs prior to the recipient's requirement for dialysis that has demonstrated improvements in patient and graft survival in comparison to implantation after the commencement of dialysis, has been extensively discussed in the literature during the last decades, fundamentally for reason of the good results obtained in kidney transplantation. The manuscript of van Dellen et al; carries out an instructive analysis of the basics mechanisms of action of the procedure, and various



considerations in this regard. These objectives and indications are supported by an important and significant bibliography. Although the essence of this work does not add new knowledge on the subject; it constitutes a good educational element in this regard, which is undoubtedly of practical use. In relation to the final conclusion of this essay, a short call to the problem of social behaviour regarding donation of potential deceased donor, could also be useful to have been mentioned.

Many thanks for your comments. This has been added to the manuscript.

Science editor:

Pre-emptive transplant has great benefit for the recipient, avoiding dialysis and maximizing patient survival. Do the authors think that transplantation could be different experience among patients that were on dialysis and those who had the transplant and were pre-emptive.

Many thanks for this question. There are no substantive studies examining this fact. This question has been added this to the manuscript as an area for further study.

The questions raised by the reviewers should be answered

This has been done in all instances

There are no tables or figures.

This is a review of the current literature regarding pre-emptive transplantation. On this basis, no data were presented in any tabular or figure form as there was no new data to present. There was therefore a conscious decision not to include any tables or figures on this basis.

The authors need to provide the signed Conflict-of-Interest Disclosure Form and Copyright License Agreement.

This has been completed.

I found no "Author contribution" section. Please provide the author contributions.

This has been completed.

I found the authors did not add the PMID and DOI in the reference list. Please provide the PubMed numbers and DOI citation numbers to the reference list and list all authors of the references. The author should number the references in Arabic numerals according to the citation order in the text. The reference numbers will be superscripted in square brackets at the end of the sentence with the citation content or after the cited author's name, with no spaces

This has been corrected. PMID and DOI references are given where available.

Please write the "Abstract" section.

This has been completed.

Please let me know if you have any further queries. Many thanks in advance for considering this revised manuscript.

Yours sincerely

David van Dellen MD FRCS
Consultant Transplant & General Surgeon
Clinical Lead
Department of Renal & Pancreas Transplantation



Manchester Royal Infirmary
Manchester University NHS Foundation Trust



Manchester University
NHS Foundation Trust