



## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Transplantation

**Manuscript NO:** 55261

**Title:** Current protocols and outcomes of ABO-incompatible kidney transplantation

**Reviewer's code:** 00505314

**Position:** Peer Reviewer

**Academic degree:** MD

**Professional title:** Doctor

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** United States

**Author's Country/Territory:** Italy

**Manuscript submission date:** 2020-03-08

**Reviewer chosen by:** Jie Wang

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2020-03-26 15:35

**Reviewer performed review:** 2020-03-26 16:49

**Review time:** 1 Hour

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Re-review</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568  
**E-mail:** [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com)  
**https://**[www.wjgnet.com](http://www.wjgnet.com)

#### **SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

In this review article, the others discuss in detail the steps involved in the desensitization process for ABO incompatible kidney transplantation. The advantages and potential complications are discussed. Authors also briefly discussed the kidney exchange program to bypass the immunological barrier. The article is written well and important references included. The manuscript is a useful contribution to the existing literature. I would recommend adding a paragraph regarding the authors opinion regarding how to select a patient for desensitization versus using a paired exchange program.



## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Transplantation

**Manuscript NO:** 55261

**Title:** Current protocols and outcomes of ABO-incompatible kidney transplantation

**Reviewer's code:** 03655859

**Position:** Editorial Board

**Academic degree:** MBBS, MD

**Professional title:** Assistant Professor, Doctor

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** United States

**Author's Country/Territory:** Italy

**Manuscript submission date:** 2020-03-08

**Reviewer chosen by:** Jia-Ping Yan

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2020-04-16 17:19

**Reviewer performed review:** 2020-04-17 02:13

**Review time:** 8 Hours

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Re-review</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://**www.wjgnet.com

#### **SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

Salvadori et al presented this important review article about the ABOi transplant. Paper is well written and easy to follow. I have a few questions/comments as below: 1. In the Introduction section, please provide references for some of the important points- eg. "30% are considered incompatible". Similarly, in the conclusion section, it was mentioned that "the paired donation only 31% of the pairs are encountering a possible exchange in optimal conditions." - this will also need a reference. 2. It is mentioned that ABOi is more expensive than ABOc but cheaper than being on dialysis- which is true, but giving numbers, eg. approx what will be the cost of each transplant, dialysis and paired kidney donation would be important and interesting- 3. Under the section "DEVELOPMENT OF THE PRACTICE OF KIDNEY TRANSPLANTATION IN ABO-INCOMPATIBLE PAIRS". - is an interesting and good summary of the history of ABOi- consider presenting it in a figure.



## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Transplantation

**Manuscript NO:** 55261

**Title:** Current protocols and outcomes of ABO-incompatible kidney transplantation

**Reviewer's code:** 05117991

**Position:** Associate Editor

**Academic degree:** MD, MSc

**Professional title:** Associate Professor, Director, Surgeon

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** Turkey

**Author's Country/Territory:** Italy

**Manuscript submission date:** 2020-03-08

**Reviewer chosen by:** Jia-Ping Yan

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2020-04-16 09:49

**Reviewer performed review:** 2020-04-18 08:26

**Review time:** 1 Day and 22 Hours

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Re-review</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568  
**E-mail:** [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com)  
**https://**[www.wjgnet.com](http://www.wjgnet.com)

#### **SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

Dear Authors, As a reviewer, I received your manuscript a few days ago. Unfortunately, it has major English grammatical mistakes and is not confluent. I recommend you to retrieve it, before rejection and have it edited by a proofreading company. Below is a company that I used in the past and was satisfied with their work. They are relatively cheap compared to other editing services. (e-mail: [translationatlantic@gmail.com](mailto:translationatlantic@gmail.com)) You are free to use any service you like, however, if the article remains in this form, it does not qualify to be published. It is very hard to read and focus on the content with so many mistakes. I would be pleased to review it again, if grammatical mistakes are corrected.



## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Transplantation

**Manuscript NO:** 55261

**Title:** Current protocols and outcomes of ABO-incompatible kidney transplantation

**Reviewer's code:** 03755224

**Position:** Associate Editor

**Academic degree:** FACS, FRCS, MD, PhD

**Professional title:** Professor

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** Spain

**Author's Country/Territory:** Italy

**Manuscript submission date:** 2020-03-08

**Reviewer chosen by:** Jia-Ping Yan

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2020-04-17 10:47

**Reviewer performed review:** 2020-04-26 00:46

**Review time:** 8 Days and 13 Hours

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Re-review</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No
<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

Also the characteristics of the specific immunosorbent columns to eliminate isoagglutinins are also not well explained. Because this is a review article, not an original article, it limits comments regarding methodology or design.

**RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT**

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Transplantation

**Manuscript NO:** 55261

**Title:** Current protocols and outcomes of ABO-incompatible kidney transplantation

**Reviewer's code:** 03655859

**Position:** Editorial Board

**Academic degree:** MBBS, MD

**Professional title:** Assistant Professor, Doctor

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** United States

**Author's Country/Territory:** Italy

**Manuscript submission date:** 2020-03-08

**Reviewer chosen by:** Le Zhang

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2020-05-24 17:20

**Reviewer performed review:** 2020-05-24 17:28

**Review time:** 1 Hour

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://**www.wjgnet.com

<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: [ <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> ] Anonymous [ <input type="checkbox"/> ] Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: [ <input type="checkbox"/> ] Yes [ <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> ] No
-------------------------------------	-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

### **SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

Thank you for answering my questions/comments. I have no new comments to add.



## RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Transplantation

**Manuscript NO:** 55261

**Title:** Current protocols and outcomes of ABO-incompatible kidney transplantation

**Reviewer's code:** 03755224

**Position:** Associate Editor

**Academic degree:** FACS, FRCS, MD, PhD

**Professional title:** Professor

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** Spain

**Author's Country/Territory:** Italy

**Manuscript submission date:** 2020-03-08

**Reviewer chosen by:** Le Zhang

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2020-05-24 18:22

**Reviewer performed review:** 2020-05-26 10:13

**Review time:** 1 Day and 15 Hours

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

### SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In my previous comment I asked for an explanation of the characteristics of the specific



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568  
**E-mail:** [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com)  
**https://**[www.wjgnet.com](https://www.wjgnet.com)

immunosorbent columns for removing isoagglutinins. Reference 20 has been included