



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Experimental Medicine

Manuscript NO: 61885

Title: Phase I Study on the Safety and Preliminary Efficacy of Allogeneic Mesenchymal Stem Cells in Hypoxic- Ischemic Encephalopathy

Reviewer's code: 03656580

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Postdoc, Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: China

Author's Country/Territory: Turkey

Manuscript submission date: 2020-12-24

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-12-24 23:43

Reviewer performed review: 2021-01-04 01:47

Review time: 10 Days and 2 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Cell therapies, particularly WJ-MSCs, have been paving the way for novel treatment protocols for preventing ischemic brain damage. However, (1) Clinical use of stem cell therapy remains conflicted and the root of its efficacy needs to be clarified; (2) Several variables need to be elucidated, such as the mediators between cells, the optimal type and time of therapy, and the ideal patient characteristics; (3) Multi-center studies with larger populations are needed to verify the safety and efficacy outcomes obtained here, along with an optimization for the treatment protocol in question.



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Experimental Medicine

Manuscript NO: 61885

Title: Phase I Study on the Safety and Preliminary Efficacy of Allogeneic Mesenchymal Stem Cells in Hypoxic- Ischemic Encephalopathy

Reviewer's code: 05410953

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Associate Professor, Chief Doctor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Spain

Author's Country/Territory: Turkey

Manuscript submission date: 2020-12-24

Reviewer chosen by: Jin-Lei Wang

Reviewer accepted review: 2021-01-01 19:12

Reviewer performed review: 2021-01-06 17:53

Review time: 4 Days and 22 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Authors present a new multiple route administration of MSC for HIE. The results in term of safety are good as well preliminary efficacy but with a short population (8 cases). Authors present the manuscript as open label phase I study with the approval from the Turkish Ministry of Health. I Can not find the registration number and name of trial registry.



RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

Name of journal: World Journal of Experimental Medicine

Manuscript NO: 61885

Title: Phase I Study on the Safety and Preliminary Efficacy of Allogeneic Mesenchymal Stem Cells in Hypoxic- Ischemic Encephalopathy

Reviewer's code: 05410953

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Associate Professor, Chief Doctor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Spain

Author's Country/Territory: Turkey

Manuscript submission date: 2020-12-24

Reviewer chosen by: Le Zhang

Reviewer accepted review: 2021-02-24 16:47

Reviewer performed review: 2021-02-24 17:26

Review time: 1 Hour

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA

Telephone: +1-925-399-1568

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

https://www.wjgnet.com

I have revised the answers of the authors. They confirm the approval of Turkish Ministry of Health, General Directorate of Health Services, Department of Organ/Tissue Transplantation and Dialysis Services, and the Scientific Committee (Registry Number 56733164-203-E.2569).



RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

Name of journal: World Journal of Experimental Medicine

Manuscript NO: 61885

Title: Phase I Study on the Safety and Preliminary Efficacy of Allogeneic Mesenchymal Stem Cells in Hypoxic- Ischemic Encephalopathy

Reviewer's code: 03656580

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Postdoc, Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: China

Author's Country/Territory: Turkey

Manuscript submission date: 2020-12-24

Reviewer chosen by: Le Zhang

Reviewer accepted review: 2021-02-28 23:27

Reviewer performed review: 2021-03-02 06:22

Review time: 1 Day and 6 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

ok