

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Experimental Medicine

**Manuscript NO:** 61885

**Title:** Phase I Study on the Safety and Preliminary Efficacy of Allogeneic Mesenchymal Stem Cells in Hypoxic- Ischemic Encephalopathy

**Reviewer's code:** 03656580

**Position:** Peer Reviewer

**Academic degree:** MD, PhD

**Professional title:** Postdoc, Professor

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** China

**Author's Country/Territory:** Turkey

**Manuscript submission date:** 2020-12-24

**Reviewer chosen by:** AI Technique

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2020-12-24 23:43

**Reviewer performed review:** 2021-01-04 01:47

**Review time:** 10 Days and 2 Hours

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Re-review</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568  
**E-mail:** [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com)  
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

#### **SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

Cell therapies, particularly WJ-MSCs, have been paving the way for novel treatment protocols for preventing ischemic brain damage. However, (1) Clinical use of stem cell therapy remains conflicted and the root of its efficacy needs to be clarified; (2) Several variables need to be elucidated, such as the mediators between cells, the optimal type and time of therapy, and the ideal patient characteristics; (3) Multi-center studies with larger populations are needed to verify the safety and efficacy outcomes obtained here, along with an optimization for the treatment protocol in question.

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Experimental Medicine

**Manuscript NO:** 61885

**Title:** Phase I Study on the Safety and Preliminary Efficacy of Allogeneic Mesenchymal Stem Cells in Hypoxic- Ischemic Encephalopathy

**Reviewer's code:** 05410953

**Position:** Peer Reviewer

**Academic degree:** MD, PhD

**Professional title:** Associate Professor, Chief Doctor

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** Spain

**Author's Country/Territory:** Turkey

**Manuscript submission date:** 2020-12-24

**Reviewer chosen by:** Jin-Lei Wang

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2021-01-01 19:12

**Reviewer performed review:** 2021-01-06 17:53

**Review time:** 4 Days and 22 Hours

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Re-review</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

#### **SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

Authors present a new multiple route administration of MSC for HIE. The results in term of safety are good as well preliminary efficacy but with a short population (8 cases). Authors present the manuscript as open label phase I study with the approval from the Turkish Ministry of Health. I Can not find the registration number and name of trial registry.

## RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Experimental Medicine

**Manuscript NO:** 61885

**Title:** Phase I Study on the Safety and Preliminary Efficacy of Allogeneic Mesenchymal Stem Cells in Hypoxic- Ischemic Encephalopathy

**Reviewer's code:** 05410953

**Position:** Peer Reviewer

**Academic degree:** MD, PhD

**Professional title:** Associate Professor, Chief Doctor

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** Spain

**Author's Country/Territory:** Turkey

**Manuscript submission date:** 2020-12-24

**Reviewer chosen by:** Le Zhang

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2021-02-24 16:47

**Reviewer performed review:** 2021-02-24 17:26

**Review time:** 1 Hour

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

## SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

I have revised the answers of the authors. They confirm the approval of Turkish Ministry of Health, General Directorate of Health Services, Department of Organ/Tissue Transplantation and Dialysis Services, and the Scientific Committee (Registry Number 56733164-203-E.2569).

## RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Experimental Medicine

**Manuscript NO:** 61885

**Title:** Phase I Study on the Safety and Preliminary Efficacy of Allogeneic Mesenchymal Stem Cells in Hypoxic- Ischemic Encephalopathy

**Reviewer's code:** 03656580

**Position:** Peer Reviewer

**Academic degree:** MD, PhD

**Professional title:** Postdoc, Professor

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** China

**Author's Country/Territory:** Turkey

**Manuscript submission date:** 2020-12-24

**Reviewer chosen by:** Le Zhang

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2021-02-28 23:27

**Reviewer performed review:** 2021-03-02 06:22

**Review time:** 1 Day and 6 Hours

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

## SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568  
**E-mail:** [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com)  
**https://**[www.wjgnet.com](http://www.wjgnet.com)

ok