

## Response to Reviewers

**Subject:** Submission of revised minireview article (**Manuscript NO.: 62619**) for publication

Dear Editor-in-Chief,

I am extremely grateful to you, to the Editorial board members and to the Reviewers for recommending resubmission of my manuscript entitled, "Ophthalmological Instruments of Al-Halabi Fills in a Gap in the Biomedical Engineering History." I am hereby submitting the revised version of the same for publication in your esteemed journal. I have addressed the reviewer's and the editors' comments specifically in a point-by-point fashion and highlighted the added or modified contents in yellow while the deleted contents in red. I have tried my best to address all the queries/comments/suggestions and have incorporated them at appropriate places in the revised manuscript.

Further, I state that the data provided in the manuscript is original and is not in consideration for publication elsewhere and none of its contents in part or in full has been published previously.

The author of the manuscript has approved the content and its submission to World Journal of Methodology.

Thanking you,

Yours sincerely,

Dr. Mohamed Nagy Saad

Assistant Professor, Biomedical Engineering Department, Faculty of Engineering, Minia University, Egypt

Email: [m.n.saad@ieee.org](mailto:m.n.saad@ieee.org), [m.n.saad@mu.edu.eg](mailto:m.n.saad@mu.edu.eg)

The specific point-by-point responses to the Reviewer's comments are as follows:-

Reviewer comments followed by highlighted response:

### Reviewers' comments:

#### **Reviewer #1:**

---

1. This is an interesting manuscript talking on the history of ophthalmological instrument development in a regional area.

**Response:** Many thanks for the compliment. Indeed, the included ophthalmological instruments had been used -at that time period- in Syria in particular and in the Middle East in general.

---

2. Most of the reference were from a book beyond the recent decade.

**Response:** That's right. This article is intended to cover a part of the biomedical engineering history. This article depends basically on the reproduction of al-Halabi's book edited by M. Z. Wafai and M. R. Kalaji. The book was published by the Islamic Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (ISESCO), Rabat, Morocco in 1990. Dr. Wafai is a chief of Vitreo-Retina Division, King Khalid Eye Specialist Hospital, Riyadh, Saudi Arabia, and a former instructor in Ophthalmology, Harvard Medical School, Boston, Massachusetts, USA. Dr. Kalaji is a professor of Islamic Studies, King Saud University, Riyadh, Saudi Arabia, and a former professor of Islamic Studies, Damascus University, Syria.

3. The treatments of mentioned eye diseases are very different today.

**Response:** That's true. As these techniques were in charge from about 800 years.

**Science Editor's comments:**

---

(1) The "Author Contributions" section is missing. Please provide the author contributions.

**Response:** The "Author Contributions" section has been added.

---

(2) The authors did not provide original pictures. Please provide the original figure documents. Please prepare and arrange the figures using PowerPoint to ensure that all graphs or arrows or text portions can be reprocessed by the editor.

**Response:** The uniform presentation for figures had been prepared. Each figure was inserted in a slide. The figures were arranged chronologically as they appear in the article.

---

(3) PMID and DOI numbers are missing in the reference list. Please provide the PubMed numbers and DOI citation numbers to the reference list and list all authors of the references. And please add reference numbers to each reference, include the reference list and the main text. Please revise throughout.

**Response:** The PMID or DOI numbers has been added to 23 references out of 38 taking into account the historic nature of this article with old books and resources. All authors have been listed. Reference numbers have been added in the reference list and the main text.

---

(4) Please obtain permission for the use of picture(s). If an author of a submission is re-using a figure or figures published elsewhere, or that is copyrighted, the author must provide documentation that the previous publisher or copyright holder has given permission for the figure to be re-published; and correctly indicating the reference source and copyrights.

For example, "Figure 1 Histopathological examination by hematoxylin-eosin staining (200 x). A: Control group; B: Model group; C: Pioglitazone hydrochloride group; D: Chinese herbal medicine group. Citation: Yang JM, Sun Y, Wang M, Zhang XL, Zhang SJ, Gao YS, Chen L, Wu MY, Zhou L, Zhou YM, Wang Y, Zheng FJ, Li YH. Regulatory effect of a Chinese herbal medicine formula on non-alcoholic fatty liver disease. World J Gastroenterol 2019; 25(34): 5105-5119. Copyright ©The Author(s) 2019. Published by Baishideng Publishing Group Inc[6]". And please cite the reference source in the references list. If the author fails to properly cite the published or copyrighted picture(s) or table(s) as described above, he/she will be subject to withdrawal of the article from BPG publications and may even be held liable.

---

**Response:** All the figures included in the article belongs to the same reference which is a book chapter:

Sezgin F, Neubauer E. Volume IV: Catalogue of the collection of instruments of the institute for the history of Arabic and Islamic sciences. In: Sezgin F. Science and technology in Islam. Frankfurt am Main, Germany: Institute for the History of Arabic-Islamic Science, 2010: 1-94.

The reference number of this reference is 23 in the reference list. The book publisher is the Institute for the History of Arabic-Islamic Science (Institut für Geschichte der Arabisch-Islamischen Wissenschaften), Frankfurt am Main, Germany. The permission for the reproduction of the figures has been guaranteed from the book publisher through an email. The email body text is as follows:

Sehr geehrter Herr Dr. Saad,

In Beantwortung Ihrer Anfrage kann ich Ihnen mitteilen, dass wir Ihnen die Druckerlaubnis für die von Ihnen unten erwähnten Abbildungen erteilen.

Mit freundlichen Grüßen  
i.A. Dr. Gesine Yildiz  
Institut für Geschichte der Arabisch-Islamischen Wissenschaften  
Westendstrasse 89  
D-60325 Frankfurt am Main  
Phone: +49(0)69-7560090  
Fax: +49(0)69-75600912

The English translation of the email:

Dear Doctor. Saad,

In response to your request, I can inform you that we have given you permission to print the images you have mentioned below.

Kind regards

on behalf of Dr. Gesine Yildiz

Institute for the History of Arab-Islamic Sciences

The email of the Institute for the History of Arab-Islamic Sciences: [igaiw@em.uni-frankfurt.de](mailto:igaiw@em.uni-frankfurt.de)

#### **Company editor-in-chief comments:**

---

- (1) Before final acceptance, uniform presentation should be used for figures showing the same or similar contents; for example, "Figure 1 Pathological changes of atrophic gastritis after treatment. A: ...; B: ...; C: ...; D: ...; E: ...; F: ...; G: ...".
- 

**Response:** The uniform presentation for figures had been prepared. Each figure was inserted in a slide. The figures were arranged chronologically as they appear in the article.

---

- (2) Please provide decomposable Figures (in which all components are movable and editable), organize them into a single PowerPoint file.
- 

**Response:** The uniform presentation for figures had been prepared. Each figure was inserted in a slide. The figures were arranged chronologically as they appear in the article.

---

- (3) Please authors are required to provide standard three-line tables, that is, only the top line, bottom line, and column line are displayed, while other table lines are hidden. The contents of each cell in the table should conform to the editing specifications, and the lines of each row or column of

the table should be aligned. Do not use carriage returns or spaces to replace lines or vertical lines and do not segment cell content.

**Response:** All tables have been formatted as requested.

---