

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Critical Care Medicine

**Manuscript NO:** 62834

**Title:** Frequency of Hepatic Steatosis and Its Association with the Pneumonia Severity Score on Chest CT in Adult COVID-19 Patients

**Reviewer's code:** 05432496

**Position:** Peer Reviewer

**Academic degree:** PhD

**Professional title:** Research Fellow

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** Brazil

**Author's Country/Territory:** Turkey

**Manuscript submission date:** 2021-01-19

**Reviewer chosen by:** AI Technique

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2021-01-19 15:52

**Reviewer performed review:** 2021-01-21 23:51

**Review time:** 2 Days and 7 Hours

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Re-review</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

## **SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

1 Title. Does the title reflect the main subject/hypothesis of the manuscript? The title partially reflects the study. The authors should make clear that they selected moderate COVID-19 patients. 2 Abstract. Does the abstract summarize and reflect the work described in the manuscript? Yes. 3 Key words. Do the key words reflect the focus of the manuscript? Yes. 4 Background. Does the manuscript adequately describe the background, present status and significance of the study? Yes. 5 Methods. Does the manuscript describe methods (e.g., experiments, data analysis, surveys, and clinical trials, etc.) in adequate detail? Yes. 6 Results. Are the research objectives achieved by the experiments used in this study? What are the contributions that the study has made for research progress in this field? Yes. 7 Discussion. Does the manuscript interpret the findings adequately and appropriately, highlighting the key points concisely, clearly and logically? Are the findings and their applicability/relevance to the literature stated in a clear and definite manner? Is the discussion accurate and does it discuss the paper's scientific significance and/or relevance to clinical practice sufficiently? Moderate. Authors should make clear the possible implication involving the age difference, possible implication of COVID-19 in the aggravating Hepatic Steatosis. They did not evaluate important variables such as comorbidities (obesity, diabetes, smoking,...) that could impact both hepatic steatosis and COVID-19, therefore are crucial for this manuscript. 8 Illustrations and tables. Are the figures, diagrams and tables sufficient, good quality and appropriately illustrative of the paper contents? Do figures require labeling with arrows, asterisks etc., better legends? Yes. 9 Biostatistics. Does the manuscript meet the requirements of biostatistics? Yes. 10 Units. Does the manuscript meet the requirements of use of SI units? Yes. 11 References. Does the manuscript cite appropriately the latest, important and authoritative references in the introduction and

discussion sections? Does the author self-cite, omit, incorrectly cite and/or over-cite references? Yes. 12 Quality of manuscript organization and presentation. Is the manuscript well, concisely and coherently organized and presented? Is the style, language and grammar accurate and appropriate? Yes. the language and grammar is appropriate. 13 Research methods and reporting. Authors should have prepared their manuscripts according to manuscript type and the appropriate categories, as follows: (1) CARE Checklist (2013) - Case report; (2) CONSORT 2010 Statement - Clinical Trials study, Prospective study, Randomized Controlled trial, Randomized Clinical trial; (3) PRISMA 2009 Checklist - Evidence-Based Medicine, Systematic review, Meta-Analysis; (4) STROBE Statement - Case Control study, Observational study, Retrospective Cohort study; and (5) The ARRIVE Guidelines - Basic study. Did the author prepare the manuscript according to the appropriate research methods and reporting? Yes 14 Ethics statements. For all manuscripts involving human studies and/or animal experiments, author(s) must submit the related formal ethics documents that were reviewed and approved by their local ethical review committee. Did the manuscript meet the requirements of ethics? Yes Specific Comments To Authors: First, what are the original findings of this manuscript? What are the new hypotheses that this study proposed? What are the new phenomena that were found through experiments in this study? What are the hypotheses that were confirmed through experiments in this study?

The manuscript identifies and correlate the frequency of hepatic steatosis, Pneumonia Severity Score in adults with moderate COVID-19 in Turkey. Second, what are the quality and importance of this manuscript? What are the new findings of this study? What are the new concepts that this study proposes? What are the new methods that this study proposed? Do the conclusions appropriately summarize the data that this study provided? What are the unique insights that this study presented? What are the key problems in this field that this study has solved? The study identifies the presence of



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568  
**E-mail:** [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com)  
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

hepatic steatosis in COVID-19 patients in comparison with non-COVID-19 patients. This further confirms previous investigations with similar findings but performed in a different country, and add important and relevant information. Third, what are the limitations of the study and its findings? What are the future directions of the topic described in this manuscript? What are the questions/issues that remain to be solved? What are the questions that this study prompts for the authors to do next? How might this publication impact basic science and/or clinical practice? The limitations of the study hinder the application of the investigation. Hepatic Steatosis is highly associated with different diseases that are also associated with COVID-19, such as obesity and type 2 Diabetes mellitus. Other important information is when was the tested performed in relation to the infection/hospital admission. I suggest that the table with data from patients be complemented with the clinical information (comorbidities) and the information on when was the tests performed.

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Critical Care Medicine

**Manuscript NO:** 62834

**Title:** Frequency of Hepatic Steatosis and Its Association with the Pneumonia Severity Score on Chest CT in Adult COVID-19 Patients

**Reviewer's code:** 03003255

**Position:** Peer Reviewer

**Academic degree:** MD, PhD

**Professional title:** Assistant Professor, Surgeon, Surgical Oncologist

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** Germany

**Author's Country/Territory:** Turkey

**Manuscript submission date:** 2021-01-19

**Reviewer chosen by:** AI Technique

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2021-01-20 07:44

**Reviewer performed review:** 2021-01-23 14:37

**Review time:** 3 Days and 6 Hours

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Re-review</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568  
**E-mail:** [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com)  
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

#### **SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

The paper deals with an interesting and up to date question and is of importance for the readership of the WJG. The overall quality of the paper is good and I have only some minor questions: - the timeframe in which the patients were recruited is only 1 month according to the method section. Even for a high volume center 1216 CT's of the chest for suspected COVID 19 disease seems extremely high. Please explain. - Was permission gained from the patient for usage of the CT scans in figure 1?

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Critical Care Medicine

**Manuscript NO:** 62834

**Title:** Frequency of Hepatic Steatosis and Its Association with the Pneumonia Severity Score on Chest CT in Adult COVID-19 Patients

**Reviewer's code:** 03765308

**Position:** Editorial Board

**Academic degree:** MD, PhD

**Professional title:** Doctor, Professor

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** Taiwan

**Author's Country/Territory:** Turkey

**Manuscript submission date:** 2021-01-19

**Reviewer chosen by:** Jin-Lei Wang

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2021-01-21 23:08

**Reviewer performed review:** 2021-01-25 00:17

**Review time:** 3 Days and 1 Hour

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Re-review</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No
<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

## **SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

**Brief summary** This is a consecutive series of 1216 patients who was admitted to ER between September 2020 and October 2020. Among them, 252 (54.4%) patients with COVID-19 and pneumonia or 211 patients (45.6%) without COVID-19 were included for liver steatosis evaluation. The frequency of hepatic steatosis detected by CT in the COVID-19 positive group was significantly higher than the control group (42.9 vs. 19.4%,  $p < 0.001$ ). They concluded that hepatic steatosis is associated with severe COVID-19 disease, can be considered as a new parameter in the risk analysis of infected patients.

**Comments:** 1. Among 1216 patients, only 463 were included. Readers will be appreciated to understand the reasons of exclusion in a list. 2. Do not understand why severe cases were excluded. These cases should be included and be examined as a confounding factor in multivariate analysis. In addition, those CoVID-19 RT-PCR positive patients without pneumonia should be included as a mild case group. How many CT or chest X ray were done in COVID-19 RT PCR negative subjects? Pneumonia may occur in the course of a disease. 3. How the COVID-19 RT-PCR were done was not well described. How many RT-PCR for each case were done in both groups? 4. No information on alcohol beverage, body weight, body height, diabetes and hypertension. These are important messages for a hepatic steatosis study. 5. The study design compared COVID-19 positive and negative group. No comparison was made between COVID-19 positive cases with or without pneumonia. Therefore, the conclusion hepatic steatosis occurred in severe COVID-19 group may be not appropriated. 6. In general, older patients may associated with higher prevalence of liver steatosis. The COV-19 positive cases were 9 years older than COV-19 negative cases. We will need a multivariate or age adjusted analysis.

## RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Critical Care Medicine

**Manuscript NO:** 62834

**Title:** Frequency of Hepatic Steatosis and Its Association with the Pneumonia Severity Score on Chest CT in Adult COVID-19 Patients

**Reviewer's code:** 05432496

**Position:** Peer Reviewer

**Academic degree:** PhD

**Professional title:** Research Fellow

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** Brazil

**Author's Country/Territory:** Turkey

**Manuscript submission date:** 2021-01-19

**Reviewer chosen by:** Jia-Ru Fan

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2021-02-20 12:06

**Reviewer performed review:** 2021-02-20 12:19

**Review time:** 1 Hour

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

## SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568  
**E-mail:** [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com)  
**https://**[www.wjgnet.com](http://www.wjgnet.com)

Thank you for the attention to the comments. The manuscript has improved with the additions.

## RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Critical Care Medicine

**Manuscript NO:** 62834

**Title:** Frequency of Hepatic Steatosis and Its Association with the Pneumonia Severity Score on Chest CT in Adult COVID-19 Patients

**Reviewer's code:** 03003255

**Position:** Peer Reviewer

**Academic degree:** MD, PhD

**Professional title:** Assistant Professor, Surgeon, Surgical Oncologist

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** Germany

**Author's Country/Territory:** Turkey

**Manuscript submission date:** 2021-01-19

**Reviewer chosen by:** Jia-Ru Fan

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2021-02-21 15:32

**Reviewer performed review:** 2021-02-22 08:58

**Review time:** 17 Hours

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

## SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568  
**E-mail:** [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com)  
**https://**[www.wjgnet.com](http://www.wjgnet.com)

The authors have sufficiently answered the questions raised.