

## CHECKLIST OF RESPONSIBILITIES FOR SCIENTIFIC EDITORS

Manuscript page number (Without Figures): 30 Rate: 6.2 CNY per page

Editing Fee: <u>186</u> CNY

Figure count: \_\_\_\_\_\_ Figure handling time: 20 min Rate: 1 CNY per min

Editing Fee: 20 CNY

XML and PDF converting time: 40 min Rate: 1 CNY per min

Editing Fee: <u>40</u> CNY

Manuscript word count: 8525

Total Editing Fee: <u>246</u> CNY

		Comments
Item No.	Specific items for verification	Yes=[Y]
		No= [N]
	General Information of the Manuscript	
	Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology	
	Manuscript NO.: 67566	
	Column: Frontier	
	Title: Chronic rejection after liver transplantation: Opening the	
	Pandora's box	
1	Authors: Roberta Angelico, Bruno Sensi, Tommaso M Manzia,	[Y]
	Giuseppe Tisone, Giuseppe Grassi, Alessandro Signorello, Martina	
	Milana, Ilaria Lenci and Leonardo Baiocchi	
	<b>Reviewer code:</b> 03253490, 02860506, and 05703005	
	<b>First decision:</b> 2021-06-13 03:55	
	Scientific Editor: Yun-Xiaojian Wu	
	Date of signature: <u>11/18/2021</u> (month/day/year)	



## Baishideng Publishing

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite 160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA Telephone: +1-925-399-1568 E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com https://www.wjgnet.com

## **Editorial Office's Comments**

Science Editor: 1 Scientific quality: The manuscript describes a Frontier of the Chronic rejection in liver transplantation. The topic is within the scope of the WJG. (1) Classification: Grade B, B and C; (2) Summary of the Peer-Review Report: This is a well written review covering chronic rejection and would be of interest to the readers. Some problems need to be clarified and Figure 1 need to be revised. The questions raised by the reviewers should be answered; (3) Format: There are 2 tables and 1 figure; (4) References: A total of 68 references are cited, including 11 references published in the last 3 years; (5) Self-cited references: There are 5 self-cited references. 2 Language evaluation: Classification: Grade A, A and B. The manuscript is reviewed by Proof-Reading-Service. 3 Academic norms and rules: No academic misconduct was found in the Bing search. 4 Supplementary comments: This is an invited manuscript. No financial support was obtained for the study. The topic has not previously been published in the WJG. (13)5 Issues raised: (1) Please provide a formal English language editing certificate issued by the language editing company; (2) The authors did not provide original pictures. Please provide the original figure documents. Please prepare and arrange the figures using PowerPoint to ensure that all graphs or arrows or text portions can be reprocessed by the editor; (3) Please confirm if the figures are original. If an author of a submission is re-using a figure or figures published elsewhere, or that is copyrighted, the author must provide documentation that

2

[Y]



the previous publisher or copyright holder has given permission for the figure to be re-published; and correctly indicating the reference source and copyrights. For example, "Figure 1 Histopathological examination by hematoxylin-eosin staining (200 ×). A: Control group; B: Model group; C: Pioglitazone hydrochloride group; D: Chinese herbal medicine group. Citation: Yang JM, Sun Y, Wang M, Zhang XL, Zhang SJ, Gao YS, Chen L, Wu MY, Zhou L, Zhou YM, Wang Y, Zheng FJ, Li YH. Regulatory effect of a Chinese herbal medicine formula on non-alcoholic fatty liver disease. World J Gastroenterol 2019; 25(34): 5105-5119. Copyright ©The Author(s) 2019. Published by Baishideng Publishing Group Inc[6]". And please cite the reference source in the references list. If the author fails to properly cite the published or copyrighted picture(s) or table(s) as described above, he/she will be subject to withdrawal of the article from BPG publications and may even be held liable; (4) For PMID and DOI numbers of references from English-language journals, please ensure there is a space between the PMID and DOI numbers in the square brackets. 6 Recommendation: Conditional acceptance. Company Editor-in-Chief: I have reviewed the Peer-Review Report, full text of the manuscript, and the relevant ethics

Report, full text of the manuscript, and the relevant ethics documents, all of which have met the basic publishing requirements of the World Journal of Gastroenterology, and the manuscript is conditionally accepted. I have sent the manuscript to the author(s) for its revision according to the Peer-Review Report, Editorial



	Office's comments and the Criteria for Manuscript Revision by	
	Authors.	
3	The fixed headings are copied.	[ Y]
	The title concisely summarizes the main topic of the study and is	
	not too long (no more than 18 words). Words such as 'exploration',	
4	'research', 'analysis', 'observation', and 'investigation' are avoided.	[Y]
	The title does not start with 'The' and does not include any Arabic	
	numbers or uncommon abbreviations.	
5	A short running title is provided (no more than 6 words).	[ Y]
	The authors' full family (sur)names and full/abbreviated first	
6	names are listed on the title page and are consistent with those	[Y]
	listed in the signed BPG Copyright License Agreement form.	
	The 'Author contributions' passage describes the specific	
	contribution(s) made by each author. The author's names are listed	
	in the following format: full family (sur)name followed by	
	abbreviated first and middles names.	
	e.g., "Wang CL and Liang L contributed equally to this work; Wang	
7	CL, Liang L, Fu JF, Zou CC, Hong F and Wu XM designed the	[Y]
	research study; Wang CL, Zou CC, Hong F and Wu XM performed	
	the research; Xue JZ and Lu JR contributed new reagents and	
	analytic tools; Wang CL, Liang L and Fu JF analyzed the data; and	
	Wang CL, Liang L and Fu JF wrote the manuscript. All authors	
	have read and approve the final manuscript."	
	The 'Supported by' statement describes the source(s) of financial	
8	support and includes the corresponding identification number(s)	[ N]
	and program ID(s) if available, and contains no spelling errors.	[Y] [Y] [Y]
	The 'Corresponding author' passage provides the corresponding	
9	author's full first and family (sur)names, abbreviated title (e.g., MD,	[ Y]
	PhD), affiliated institute's name and complete postal address	[ * ]
	(including zip code) and e-mail (written in all lowercase), and	



	contains no spelling errors.	
10	The Manuscript Tracking information ( <i>i.e.</i> , Received, Peer review started, First decision, Revised, Accepted, Article in press, and Published online) are provided along with the corresponding editor and date for each item, and contain no spelling errors.	[ Y]
11	The Abstract section is formatted according to the article-specific style (structured <i>vs</i> unstructured) and word count thresholds, as follows: <u>Commentary, Frontier, Diagnostic Advances, Medical Ethics,</u> <u>Minireview, Review, Therapeutics Advances, and Topic Highlight</u> : Non-structured abstract that is no less than 200 words. <u>Field of Vision, Case Report and Letter to the Editor</u> : Non-structured abstract that is no less than 150 words. <u>Research articles</u> : Structured abstract with subsections for AIM (no more than 20 words); METHODS (no less than 80 words); RESULTS (no less than 120 words); and CONCLUSION (no more than 26 words).	[Y ]
12	The 'Key words' list provides 5-10 keywords that reflect the main content of the study. The first letter of each keyword is capitalized, and each keyword is separated by a semicolon.	[Y ]
13	The "citation" contains authors' names and manuscript title. The name of the first author should be typed in bold letters; the family (sur) name of all authors should be typed with the first letter capitalized, followed by their abbreviated first and middle initials. For example, an article by Jae Moon Yoon, Ki Young Son, Chun Sick Eom, Daniel Durrance, Sang Min Park will be written as Yoon JM, Son KY, Eom CS, Durrance D, Park SM. Pre-existing diabetes mellitus increases the risk of gastric cancer: A meta-analysis. <i>World J</i>	[Y]



	<i>Gastroenterol</i> 2019; In press	
14	The 'Core tip' provides a summary (less than 100 words) of the	
	study that outlines the most innovative and important arguments	
	and core contents of the paper and will serve to effectively attract	[Y]
	readers.	
	The 'INTRODUCTION' section clearly describes the relevant	
	background information for the study. Only the most relevant and	
	current (within the past 5 years) literature is cited, with the	
	exception of rare instances of seminal literature citations. All	
	technical terms and/or abbreviations are explained and/or defined,	
15	with the full name of abbreviations given upon first appearance in	
15	the text and the abbreviation presented in parentheses [i.e.,	[Y]
	"computed tomography (CT)"]. First-person pronouns (e.g., 'I',	
	'we') are used appropriately to clearly indicate the work performed	
	by the author(s). When weaknesses of previous studies are	
	described in the text to highlight the innovations related to the	
	current study, the information is presented carefully.	
	The 'MATERIALS AND METHODS' section clearly and accurately	
16	describes all materials and methods used to obtain the data	[N ]
10	presented in the article and is adequate for a reader to repeat the	
	study.	
	The 'RESULTS' section concisely describes the observational and	
17	experimental results. Representative data and data that have	
	scientific significance are emphasized. Data is presented in either	
	the text, a table or figure ( <i>i.e.</i> , chart, diagram, graph or image), but is	[N]
	not repeated among each. Information presented in the tables and	
	figures clearly describes the trends, meaning, and inferences.	
	Results described in textual form are accurate, concise and clear.	
18	Statistical symbols are accurate. Statistical significance is expressed	[ N]
	as ${}^{a}P < 0.05$ , ${}^{b}P < 0.01$ ( $P > 0.05$ usually does not need to be denoted).	[ 18]



	If there are other series of <i>P</i> values, ${}^{c}P < 0.05$ and ${}^{d}P < 0.01$ are used,	
	and a third series of <i>P</i> values is expressed as ${}^{e}P < 0.05$ and ${}^{f}P < 0.01$ .	
	Statistical data is expressed as mean $\pm$ SD or mean $\pm$ SE.	
	The 'DISCUSSION' section (1) describes the main purpose and	
	hypothesis of the study; (2) summarizes the most important results;	
	(3) illustrates and explains the results (but does not simply repeat	
19	the data) and draws conclusions or inferences based on the results;	
19	(4) points out the limitations of the study and their impact on the	[ N]
	results, as well as proposes further advice on future research	
	topic(s) or direction(s); and (5) describes the theoretical significance	
	and practical value of the findings.	
	The 'ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS' section expresses gratitude to any	
	individuals or organizations for technical support (i.e., providing	
20	instrumentation, equipment or experimental materials, and/or	[N ]
20	assistance in experimental work), non-technical services (i.e., useful	
	inspiration, suggestions, guidance, or review), and/or any other	
	auxiliary work.	
	The 'ARTICLE HIGHLIGHTS' section provides comments for	
21	original articles in accordance with the specified format.	[N]
	The 'REFERENCES' section lists the references in the Vancouver	
	style. This style uses Arabic numeral in-text citations based on the	
	order of the first appearance of a source in the text. For citations	[Y]
	where the author's name is indicated in the text, a superscript	
22	number should be placed following the name ( <i>i.e</i> , "Pang <i>et al</i> "). For	
	citations where no author is indicated, a superscript number should	
	be placed at the end of the sentence. Respective examples are: "Ma <sup>[1]</sup>	
	reported", "Pan et al <sup>[2-5]</sup> indicated"; "PCR has a high	
	sensitivity <sup>[6,9]</sup> ." No superscript numbers are used when the	
	reference number is described in the text; for example, "The	
	experimental method used has been described in reference [8]." The	



	style of reference citations in tables is the same as that in the text	
	( <i>e.g.</i> , Pan <i>et al</i> <sup>[2-5]</sup> , please see reference [8]).	
	(e.g., 1 aft et uteri, please see reference [6]).	
	Journal references have been verified to ensure that there are no	
	duplicate references and that the PMID numbers are correct. For	
	references not yet included in PubMed: the name of Chinese	
	journals is spelled out using Chinese Pinyin, with the first letter of	
23	each word capitalized ( <i>e.g., Shijie Huaren Xiaohua Zazhi</i> ); the name of	[Y]
	journals in other languages are listed according to indexing	
	information retrieved from Google. Book references are presented	
	with all the information relevant to the electronic version.	
	The number of cited references is appropriate for the article type, as	
	follows:	
	<u>Commentary:</u> no less than 50;	
24	<u>Review:</u> no less than 100;	[Y]
	<u>Article:</u> no less than 30/26;	
	Case Report and Letter to the Editor: no less than 1.	
	The ethics-related statements are provided in accordance with the	
25	manuscript type (e.g., Manuscript NoInstitutional review board	[N]
	statement, Manuscript NoAnimal care and use statement, etc.).	
	The names of the peer reviewers and the scientific editor are present	
26	at the end of the paper (e.g., P-Reviewer: Hugot D S-Editor: Wang	[Y]
	JL).	



		1
	The order and numerical labeling of tables and figures is consistent	
	with their appearance and presentation in the text. Symbols in	
	tables ( <i>e.g.</i> , +, -, $\times$ , $\div$ , *) correctly correspond to the definitions in the	
27	footnotes. Only one legend is provided for each multi-panel figure	[Y]
27	consisting of color graphs, black and white graphs, or line graphs	[ + ]
	that depicts data of the same theme. For example: Figure 1	
	Pathological changes in atrophic gastritis tissue before and after	
	treatment. A:; B:; C:; D:; E:; F:	
	Split pictures include flow charts, line graphs, histograms, and	
28	graphs including text. Unsplit pictures include meta-analysis	[Y]
	diagrams, PCR amplification curves, and survival curves.	
20	The author(s) highlighted the changes made to the manuscript	
29	according to the peer-reviewers' comments.	[Y]
20	The responses to the peer-reviewers' comments are consistent with	
30	the changes made to the manuscript.	[Y]
	The revised manuscript is provided (file name: Manuscript	
	NoReview; <i>e.g.</i> , 870- Review).	
31	The letter of peer-reviewers' comments is provided (file name:	
51	Manuscript NoPeer-review(s); <i>e.g.</i> , 870-Peer-review(s)).	[Y]
	The response letter is provided (file name: Manuscript	
	NoAnswering reviewers; <i>e.g.</i> , 870-Answering reviewers).	
32	The related ethics and relevant documents are provided, such as (1)	
	Approved grant application form(s) or funding agency copy of any	
	approval document(s) (file name: Manuscript NoGrant application	
	form(s)); (2) Biostatistics review certificate (file name: Manuscript	
	NoBiostatistics statement); (3) Conflict-of-interest statement (file	[ Y]
	name: Manuscript NoConflict-of-interest statement); (4) Clinical	
	trial registration statement (file name: Manuscript NoClinical trial	
	registration statement); (5) Institutional review board approval form	
	or document (file name: Manuscript NoInstitutional review board	



	statement); (6) Institutional animal care and use committee	
	approval form or document (file name: Manuscript	
	NoInstitutional animal care and use committee statement), and (7)	
	Signed informed consent form(s) or document(s) (file name:	
	Manuscript NoInformed consent statement).	
	All authors signed the BPG Copyright license agreement form (file	
33	name: Manuscript NoCopyright license agreement; e.g.,	[Y]
	870-Copyright license agreement).	
	The language certificate provided by authors who are non-native	
34	speakers of English meets the BPG requirements (file name:	[Y]
	Manuscript NoLanguage certificate; <i>e.g.</i> , 870-Language certificate).	
	The photos licensed in the Agreement for Use of Personal Photos	
25	are consistent with those in the paper (file name: Manuscript	
35	NoAgreement for use of personal photos; e.g., 870-Agreement for	[N]
	use of personal photos).	
	This document (Checklist of Responsibilities for Scientific Editors)	
36	has been saved under the file name: manuscript NoScientific	[Y]
	editor work list (e.g., 870-Scientific editor work list).	
	A CrossCheck investigation (an effective tool for detecting unoriginal	
	content, enabling our editors to preserve the journal's integrity and	
	the authors' copyright) has been performed for the manuscript via	
	the website: http://www.ithenticate.com/. The results document	
	contains the following information for the manuscript: "Name of	
37	journal", "Manuscript No.", "Columns", "Title" and "Author list".	[Y]
	The Figure of the CrossCheck results is saved in JPEG format (.jpg) at	[N ] [Y ]
	1440 × 680 pixel resolution. The PDF of the CrossCheck results has	
	been saved under the file name: manuscript No CrossCheck report	
	(e.g., 870-CrossCheck report). The Google searches have also been	
	performed to further ensure publication of original content.	
38	The text of the manuscript is typed in Book Antiqua font, 12 pt, with	[Y]



	1.5 line spacing.	
Responsibilities of scientific editors	The primary responsibilities of our scientific editors include carefully entire manuscript and all accompanying materials for: (1) error grammar, punctuation and wording; (2) suitability of tables, figures, f legends; (3) accurate and appropriate presentation of symbols ( <i>e.g.</i> +, tables and figures; and (4) complete and comprehensive revision of t	rs in spelling, figure data and -, ×, ÷, %, *) in
Publication process	according to the reviewers' comments. Manuscript reception and registration→Initial review by scientific review→End of peer review→First round of meeting evalu accepted→Revision by the author(s)→Second round of meeting evalu accepted/revised/rejected→Final review by the Editor-in-Chief control for academic content and language quality)→Final acceptance of publication fee→Language editing→Production→Proofreading editor→Proofreading by deputy editor→Final review by Editor-in-C of online open-access papers in electronic form on the BPG websi online papers on PubMed Central→Delivery of high-quality PDF r author(s)→End of the publication process.	ation→To be luation→To be (final quality e and charging by scientific Chief→Release te→Release of